

**BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA**



FILED

04-22-10
04:59 PM

Order Instituting Rulemaking to Develop
Additional Methods to Implement the California
Renewables Portfolio Standard Program.

Rulemaking 06-02-012
(February 16, 2006)

NOTICE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATION

Pursuant to Rule 8.3 of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, the Center for Energy Efficiency and Renewable Technologies (CEERT) hereby gives notice of the following ex parte communication.

The communication occurred by letter mailed and addressed to Commission President Michael Peevey, Commissioner Dian Grueneich, Commissioner John Bohn, Commissioner Timothy Simon, and Commissioner Nancy Ryan on Monday, April 19, 2010. The communication was written only and is attached hereto as Appendix A.

The letter was sent from V. John White, CEERT's Executive Director, to the Commissioners of the California Energy Commission (CEC). This Commissioners named above were copied on this letter.

The letter describes CEERT's concern that the definitions and classifications of "bundled" and "REC only" transactions in Decision (D.) 10-03-021 appeared to conflict with Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) Program eligibility requirements adopted by the CEC. To resolve these conflicts, the letter contains a request by CEERT for the CEC to coordinate and hold a joint hearing or workshop with this Commission to reconsider and resolve conflicts between its eligibility rules and D.10-03-021. In the letter, CEERT further states that it believes that its hearing request is both timely and critical to ensure, and preserve, certainty in rules governing RPS-eligible procurement.

To obtain a copy of this notice, please contact:

Sara Steck Myers
Attorney at Law
Telephone: (415) 387-1904
FAX: (415) 387-4708
E-mail: ssmyers@att.net

Respectfully submitted,

April 22, 2010

/s/ SARA STECK MYERS
By: Sara Steck Myers
Attorney for CEERT

Sara Steck Myers
Attorney at Law
122 – 28th Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94121
(415) 387-1904
(415) 387-4708
ssmyers@att.net

APPENDIX A

**CEERT Letter to California Energy Commission (CEC)
April 19, 2010**



*Center for Energy Efficiency & Renewable Technologies
1100 11th Street, Suite 311, Sacramento, CA 95814, 916 442 7785*

April 19, 2010

Commission Chair Karen Douglas
Commission Vice-Chair James D. Boyd
Commissioner Jeffrey D. Byron
Commissioner Anthony Eggert
Commissioner Robert Weisenmiller
California Energy Commission
1516 Ninth Street
Sacramento, CA 95814-5512

RE: Docket # 03-RPS-1078 (Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS)) /
Docket # 09-RENEW EO-01 (Renewable Energy (RENEW) Executive Order (EO))
Request for Public Hearing to Address RPS Delivery Eligibility Requirements

Dear Commissioners:

By this letter, in furtherance of Governor's Executive Order S-14-08 (33% RPS), the Center for Energy Efficiency and Renewable Technologies (CEERT) requests that the California Energy Commission (CEC) notice and move rapidly to hold a public hearing in its Docket #03-RPS-1078 and/or Docket #09-RENEW EO-01. The purpose of this hearing would be to address, in coordination with the California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC), needed revisions to the CEC's RPS Eligibility Guidebook¹ in response to CPUC Decision (D.) 10-03-021.²

The hearing being requested by CEERT differs from the CEC's current request for comments on "how, if at all" D.10-03-021 affects previous comments on the CEC's "Draft 2006 Procurement Verification Staff Report."³ By that notice, it does not appear to be the CEC's intention to hold a hearing on the underlying requirements or rules contained in its RPS Eligibility Guidebook, which is the subject of this request.

Introduction

CEERT has long participated before the CEC and CPUC on issues related to the implementation of California's Renewable Portfolio Standard (RPS) Program. CEERT's current request stems from its long-held position that the CEC and CPUC must coordinate closely, to ensure clarity and certainty in RPS rules to so that the RPS goals

¹ Commission RPS Eligibility Guidebook (Third Edition), CEC-300-2007-006-ED3-CMF) (January 2008) at <http://www.energy.ca.gov/2007publications/CEC-300-2007-006/CEC-300-2007-006-ED3-CMF.PDF>.

² D.10-03-021 was issued in the CPUC's RPS Rulemaking (R.) 06-02-012 on March 11, 2010.

³ The CEC's Request for Comments was posted on April 7; comments are due CEC Docket Nos. 02-REN-1038 and 03-RPS-1078 on April 21, 2010.

will be achieved. In our view, CPUC D.10-03-021 creates (i) a conflict between rules adopted by the CPUC and those adopted by the CEC, and thus (ii) uncertainty in the market that could have a chilling effect on needed renewable development and procurement going forward. The requested hearing would, therefore, be the first step toward resolving this conflict and clarifying applicable RPS rules.

CPUC D.10-03-021

On March 11, 2010, after considering 3 different Proposed Decisions over a period of two years, the CPUC finally authorized the procurement and use of tradable renewable energy credits (TRECs) by RPS-obligated load serving entities (LSEs) for compliance with California's RPS Program in D.10-03-021.⁴ This authorization was given, however, subject to restrictions that will be in place for at least two years.

Significantly, D.10-03-021 defines renewable energy procurement as "bundled" or "REC-only," and then states that "the three large" California investor owned-utilities (IOUs) "may use TRECs ("REC-only") transactions to meet no more than 25 percent of their annual RPS procurement obligations."⁵ With regards to the classification of "bundled" transactions, D.10-03-021 establishes the following criteria:

"The following types of transactions shall be treated as bundled transactions for purposes of compliance with the California renewables portfolio standard:

- "a. Transactions in which energy is acquired from a generator certified as eligible for the California renewables portfolio standard and the generator has its first point of interconnection with the Western Electricity Coordinating Council interconnected transmission system with a California balancing authority; and
- "b. Transactions in which energy is required from a generator certified as eligible for the California renewables portfolio standard and the energy from the transaction is dynamically transferred to a California balancing authority area."⁶

D.10-03-021 does note that "the requirements for delivery to California of RPS-eligible generation" are set forth in Pub.Res. Code §25741(a) and "elaborated in the *RPS Eligibility Guidebook*" issued by the CEC.⁷ It also cites the CEC guidebook's adopted examples of "contracting structures that would meet the RPS-delivery

⁴ See, California Public Utilities (PU) Code, §§399.11, et seq; California Public Resources (Pub.Res.) Code, §§25740, et seq.

⁵ D.10-03-021, at p. 4.

⁶ D.03-10-021, Ordering Paragraph 7, at pp. 97-98. The CPUC has scheduled a workshop for April 23 to consider whether another type of transaction ("firm path transmission") might be treated as "bundled" in the future. However, such expansion of the "bundled transaction" criteria adopted in D.10-03-021 would require another CPUC order, for which no date has been set.

⁷ D.10-03-021, at p. 14.

requirements,” including its determination regarding RPS-compliant out-of-state “firming and shaping” transactions that do “not constitute tradable RECs.”⁸

However, in its differentiation of “bundled” and “REC-only” transactions, D.10-03-021 will effectively re-classify certain transactions as “REC-only,” rather than as RPS “bundled” transactions as they are defined under the CEC’s “delivery” eligibility requirements. In addition, D.10-03-021 extends its adopted “classifications” of TREC versus “bundled” transactions not only to prospective transactions, but also to RPS procurement contracts already approved by the CPUC as “bundled” consistent with the CEC’s certification as such.⁹ Specifically, a transaction that meets the CEC’s “delivery requirements” for “out-of-state energy” that is “firmed” and/or “shaped,” even if approved by the CPUC and certified by the CEC as “bundled” prior to D.10-03-021, will now be considered as delivering RECs-only from the effective date of D.10-03-021 forward.

This re-classification of transactions in D.10-03-021 raises a serious question of what comprises a “bundled” transaction versus a TREC transaction when viewed in conjunction with the CEC rules. Furthermore, the change in classification to existing contracts only accentuates the constant moving target of California RPS rules. Such uncertainty in the market is likely to dampen needed renewable energy development in the West, rather than enhance it.

This matter is complicated by the fact that D.10-03-021 also includes “dynamic transfers” among “bundled” transactions. At this time, dynamic scheduling as currently implemented in the California Independent System Operator (CAISO) tariff contains Uninstructed Deviation Penalty (UDP) provisions that make participation in this program cost prohibitive for intermittent generators. Until a dynamic scheduling tariff is developed that does not unduly burden intermittent generators, there is no way for intermittent generators to participate in this program.

Urgent Public Hearing Request

In meeting either the 20% or 33% RPS, it is clear that uniformity and certainty in the rules applicable to RPS-eligible procurement are paramount. Unnecessary or confusing criteria imposed on RPS eligible procurement will have a chilling effect on needed development and procurement and, in turn, undermine California’s goals of increasing reliance on electricity generated from renewable resources and reducing greenhouse gas emissions.

At present, it appears that the CPUC’s decision and the CEC’s RPS eligibility rules, in particular those defining when and how RPS-eligible energy “may be delivered,” including whether and how “firming and shaping” transactions from out-of-

⁸ D.10-03-021, at pp. 14, 15, 29; CEC RPS Eligibility Guidebook (January 2008), at p. 23, n.2; emphasis added.

⁹ See, e.g., CPUC Resolution E-4192 (October 2, 2008), at p. 14 (http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/word_pdf/FINAL_RESOLUTION/91720.pdf).

state renewable facilities should be treated, are in conflict. The CPUC's decision, however, is the subject of a motion to stay, petitions to modify, and applications for rehearing filed at the CPUC, and the CPUC is currently exploring other transactions ("firm path") that may qualify as "bundled." However, none of these actions change the terms of the CEC's Eligibility Guidebook or the fact that D.10-03-021 is currently effective law on the use of TRECs for RPS compliance by RPS-obligated load serving entities (LSEs).

Under these circumstances, CEERT believes that the CEC, in cooperation with the CPUC, should immediately address and resolve the apparent conflicts between D.10-03-021 and the CEC's eligibility rules. Communication and coordination between the CEC and CPUC is obviously necessary to achieve that outcome.

CEERT, therefore, requests that the CEC act quickly to coordinate and hold a joint hearing or workshop with the CPUC to reconsider its RPS delivery eligibility rules. Such action is completely appropriate to either CEC Docket #03-RPS-1078 (20% RPS) or Docket #09-RENEW EO-01 (33% RPS) or both and is consistent with the CEC's recent request for comments to determine the impacts of D.10-03-021 on its 2006 Procurement Verification Report.¹⁰

Conclusion

CEERT believes that its hearing request as described above is both timely and critical to ensure, and preserve, certainty in rules governing RPS-eligible procurement. Inconsistent rules or communications between the two state energy agencies charged with the responsibility to implement the RPS Program must be resolved to promote and realize California's renewable energy goals. To ensure a cooperative resolution of these issues before both the CEC and CPUC, CEERT has also copied CPUC Commissioners and the Governor's Office on this letter.

Sincerely,



V. John White
Executive Director

cc: Governor Arnold Schwarzenegger
CPUC Commissioners (Peevey, Grueneich, Bohn, Simon and Ryan)

¹⁰ See, n. 3, *supra* (re CEC Comment Request in Docket Nos. 02-REN-1038 and 03-RPS-1078. See also, CEC Docket No, 03-RPS-1078, Meeting Notice (June 29, 2009) at (http://www.energy.ca.gov/2009_energypolicy/notices/2009-06-29_workshop.html); Docket No. 09-Renew EO-01, Meeting Notice (March 12 and 17, 2009) at http://www.energy.ca.gov/33by2020/notices/2009-03-12+17_NOTICE_MEETINGS.PDF.

**Electronic Service List
R.06-02-012 (RPS)
April 22, 2010**

dgulino@ridgewoodpower.com
ron.cerniglia@directenergy.com
rick_noger@praxair.com
keith.mccrea@sablauw.com
csmoots@perkinscoie.com
rresch@seia.org
garson_knapp@fpl.com
Cynthia.A.Fonner@constellation.com
Lflowers@LSPower.com
ken.baker@wal-mart.com
ej_wright@oxy.com
sylvia.castillo@bsgclearing.com
jordan.white@pacificcorp.com
rkeen@manatt.com
mmazur@3PhasesRenewables.com
susan.munves@smgov.net
klatt@energyattorney.com
douglass@energyattorney.com
pssed@adelphia.net
pssed@adelphia.net
cathy.karlstad@sce.com
Joni.Templeton@sce.com
william.v.walsh@sce.com
kswitzer@gswater.com
kswitzer@gswater.com
cponds@ci.chula-vista.ca.us
AMSmith@SempraUtilities.com
daking@sempra.com
fortlieb@sandiego.gov
GBass@SempraSolutions.com
khassan@sempra.com
email@semprasolutions.com
jleslie@luce.com
tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com
tdarton@pilotpowergroup.com
GloriaB@anzaelectric.org
wplaxico@axiopower.com
kerry.eden@ci.corona.ca.us
Joe.Langenberg@gmail.com
tjaffe@energybusinessconsultants.com
mannm@dteenergy.com
cswollums@midamerican.com
abiecunasjp@bv.com
judith.kim@walmartlegal.com
rmccoy@ercot.com
allison.heaton@macquarie.com
andre.templeman@macquarie.com
christi.nicolay@macquarie.com
joe.paul@dynegy.com
roxane.perruso@tac-denver.com
bbaker@summitblue.com
kjsimonsen@ems-ca.com
dsaul@pacificsolar.net
dbrooks@nvenergy.com
chad_dickason@soleonenergy.com
freesa@thirdplanetwind.com
dykemma@thirdplanetwind.com
chilen@NVEnergy.com
emello@sppc.com
tciardella@nvenergy.com
tdillard@sppc.com
jgreco@terra-genpower.com
ctorchia@chadbourne.com
lmitchell@hanmor.com
harveyederpspc@hotmail.com
jackmack@suesec.com
case.admin@sce.com
gary.allen@sce.com
rkmoore@gswater.com
mary@solutionsforutilities.com
mtmcewan@gmail.com
tcorr@sempra.com
liddell@energyattorney.com
mshames@ucan.org
marcie.milner@shell.com
ccasselman@pilotpowergroup.com
CentralFiles@semprautilities.com
hrasool@semprautilities.com

dorth@krcd.org
ek@a-klaw.com
nes@a-klaw.com
pepper@cleanpowermarkets.com
holly@ausra.com
jrichman@bloomenergy.com
dbp@cpuc.ca.gov
dsh@cpuc.ca.gov
mpo@cpuc.ca.gov
nao@cpuc.ca.gov
theresa.mueller@sfgov.org
mhyams@swater.org
marcel@turn.org
mpa@a-klaw.com
wvm3@pge.com
b.barnes@cleantechamerica.com
bcragg@goodinmacbride.com
jsqueri@gmsr.com
jared.johnson@lw.com
jarmstrong@goodinmacbride.com
mday@goodinmacbride.com
nmurray@naturener.net
vidhyaprabhakaran@dwt.com
dhuard@manatt.com
jkarp@winston.com
jeffgray@dwt.com
salleyoo@dwt.com
sho@ogrady.us
crmd@pge.com
ECL8@pge.com
ssmyers@att.net
gpetlin@3degreesinc.com
ralf1241a@cs.com
wbooth@booth-law.com
Audra.Hartmann@Dynergy.com
kowalewskia@calpine.com
jeremy.weinstein@pacificcorp.com
jody_london_consulting@earthlink.net
jkepke@ch2m.com
gmorris@emf.net
lwisland@ucsusa.org
ndesnoo@ci.berkeley.ca.us
jpross@sungevity.com

jwright@semprautilities.com
dniehaus@semprautilities.com
bjnese@stoel.com
billm@enxco.com
shess@edisonmission.com
csteen@bakerlaw.com
rblee@bakerlaw.com
michaelgilmore@inlandenergy.com
hal@rwitz.net
wes658@gmail.com
sue.mara@rtoadvisors.com
mdjoseph@adamsbroadwell.com
michael.mcdonald@ieee.org
matthew@turn.org
paulfenn@local.org
Dan.adler@calcef.org
srovetti@swater.org
andre.devilbiss@recurrentenergy.com
dcover@esassoc.com
jim.howell@recurrentenergy.com
luke.dunnington@recurrentenergy.com
mflorio@turn.org
nsuetake@turn.org
nlong@nrdc.org
bfinkelstein@turn.org
snuller@ethree.com
avege@firstwind.com
fred.wellington@navigantconsulting.com
MGML@pge.com
gcooper@cpv.com
Jennifer.Barnes@Navigantconsulting.com
filings@a-klaw.com
cpuccases@pge.com
sls@a-klaw.com
spauker@wsgr.com
vjw3@pge.com
cmmw@pge.com
nxk2@pge.com
diarmuid@greenwoodenv.com
arno@recurrentenergy.com
cassandra.sweet@dowjones.com
elizabeth.blase@lw.com
jscancarelli@crowell.com

tomb@crossborderenergy.com
janreid@coastecon.com
johnredding@earthlink.net
jweil@aglet.org
demorse@omsoft.com
jsanders@caiso.com
dennis@ddecuir.com
jdalessi@navigantconsulting.com
cmkehrein@ems-ca.com
dcarroll@downeybrand.com
jmcfarland@treasurer.ca.gov
jluckhardt@downeybrand.com
steven@iepa.com
abb@eslawfirm.com
dkk@eslawfirm.com
glw@eslawfirm.com
lmh@eslawfirm.com
kmills@cfbf.com
wwester@smud.org
nelson@thnelson.com
dmdubson@stoel.com
kevin.lynch@iberdrolausa.com
jcolive@bpa.gov
Tom.Elgie@powerex.com
wblattner@semprautilities.com
janice@strategenconsulting.com
mpf@stateside.com
dan@energysmarthomes.net
Derek@AltaPowerGroup.com
EGrizard@deweysquare.com
r.raushenbush@comcast.net
tam.hunt@gmail.com
mpr-ca@coolearthsolar.com
harry.singh@rbssempra.com
dhecht@sempratrading.com
jansell@alternitywindpower.com
tmartin@alternitywindpower.com
steven.schleimer@barclayscapital.com
ACRoma@hhlaw.com
perlism@dicksteinshapiro.com
MASullivan@hhlaw.com
tszymanski@hunton.com
vsuravarapu@cera.com

joshdavidson@dwt.com
lcottle@winston.com
mchediak@bloomberg.net
rhassan@fbr.com
sdhilton@stoel.com
stevegreenwald@dwt.com
tkaushik@manatt.com
katherine@evomarkets.com
nfinerty@evomarkets.com
joshdavidson@dwt.com
judypau@dwt.com
bobgex@dwt.com
Diane.Fellman@nrgenergy.com
cem@newsdata.com
lisa_weinzimer@platts.com
atk4@pge.com
imcgowan@3degreesinc.com
alho@pge.com
bari@pge.com
regrelcpucases@pge.com
ELL5@pge.com
GXL2@pge.com
MMCL@pge.com
MRGG@pge.com
SEHC@pge.com
rwalther@pacbell.net
beth@beth411.com
kerry.hattevik@nexteraenergy.com
andy.vanhorn@vhcenergy.com
sean.beatty@mirant.com
rick_noger@praxair.com
sbeserra@sbcglobal.net
phanschen@mofo.com
timea.Zentai@navigantconsulting.com
pletkarj@bv.com
philha@astound.net
dietrichlaw2@earthlink.net
alex.kang@itron.com
nellie.tong@us.kema.com
ramonag@ebmud.com
ahaubenstock@brightsourceenergy.com
bepstein@fablaw.com
mrw@mrwassoc.com

dbranchcomb@spi-ind.com
sas@a-klaw.com
deb@a-klaw.com
jravenesanmarcos@yahoo.com
californiadockets@pacificorp.com
cbreidenich@yahoo.com
jholmes@emi1.com
rarego@lakeviewlight.com
dws@r-c-s-inc.com
pblood@columbiaenergypartners.com
castille@landsenergy.com
pbrehm@infiniacorp.com
lindsay_zaitsoff@transalta.com
olga.beznosova@bctc.com
jmcMahon@crai.com
ab1@cpuc.ca.gov
agc@cpuc.ca.gov
as2@cpuc.ca.gov
ams@cpuc.ca.gov
aes@cpuc.ca.gov
aeg@cpuc.ca.gov
bwm@cpuc.ca.gov
cjm@cpuc.ca.gov
cnl@cpuc.ca.gov
css@cpuc.ca.gov
dot@cpuc.ca.gov
eks@cpuc.ca.gov
gtd@cpuc.ca.gov
jm3@cpuc.ca.gov
jb9@cpuc.ca.gov
jaa@cpuc.ca.gov
jf2@cpuc.ca.gov
kpp@cpuc.ca.gov
lmi@cpuc.ca.gov
mrl@cpuc.ca.gov
mjs@cpuc.ca.gov
mjh@cpuc.ca.gov
nlr@cpuc.ca.gov
psd@cpuc.ca.gov
rmm@cpuc.ca.gov
smk@cpuc.ca.gov
svn@cpuc.ca.gov
sc1@cpuc.ca.gov

cpucdockets@keyesandfox.com
kfox@keyesandfox.com
cwooten@lumenxconsulting.com
rschmidt@bartlewells.com
clyde.murley@comcast.net
nrader@calwea.org
gtrobinson@lbl.gov
rhwiser@lbl.gov
ed.smeloff@sunpowercorp.com
brad@mp2capital.com
michael@mp2capital.com
lynn@lmaconsulting.com
anders.glader@elpower.com
keithwhite@earthlink.net
eric.cherniss@gmail.com
shani@scvas.org
sberlin@mccarthyLaw.com
jrobertpayne@gmail.com
davido@mid.org
tomk@mid.org
joyw@mid.org
brbarkovich@earthlink.net
dgrandy@caonsitegen.com
rmccann@umich.edu
martinhomec@gmail.com
tobinjmr@sbcglobal.net
bdicapo@caiso.com
grosenblum@caiso.com
saeed.farrokhpay@ferc.gov
e-recipient@caiso.com
david.oliver@navigantconsulting.com
kdusel@navigantconsulting.com
cpucrulings@navigantconsulting.com
lpark@navigantconsulting.com
pmaxwell@navigantconsulting.com
lwhouse@innercite.com
tpomales@arb.ca.gov
amber@iepa.com
mclaughlin@braunlegal.com
pstoner@lgc.org
bernardo@braunlegal.com
blaising@braunlegal.com
dseperas@calpine.com

tbo@cpuc.ca.gov
kenneth.swain@navigantconsulting.com
gcollord@arb.ca.gov
ahuang@arb.ca.gov
claufenb@energy.state.ca.us
gbarkalo@energy.state.ca.us
hrait@energy.state.ca.us
kzocchet@energy.state.ca.us
lgonzale@energy.state.ca.us
rmiller@energy.state.ca.us
pbarthol@energy.state.ca.us
hcronin@water.ca.gov
karen@klindh.com
atrowbridge@daycartermurphy.com

bsb@eslawfirm.com
jig@eslawfirm.com
jdh@eslawfirm.com
esison@smud.org
obartho@smud.org
rroth@smud.org
aorchar@smud.org
bbeebe@smud.org
mdeange@smud.org
vwood@smud.org
eddyconsulting@gmail.com
bpurewal@water.ca.gov
mniroula@water.ca.gov
artrivera@comcast.net