

**2010
TRIENNIAL ON-SITE
SECURITY REVIEW OF
SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT
AIRTRAIN**

RAIL TRANSIT SAFETY SECTION
RAIL TRANSIT AND CROSSING BRANCH
CONSUMER PROTECTION AND SAFETY DIVISION
CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

November 9, 2010

Final Report
(PUBLIC)

Richard W. Clark, Director
Consumer Protection and Safety Division

2010 TRIENNIAL ON-SITE SECURITY REVIEW OF SAN FRANCISCO INTERNATIONAL AIRPORT AIRTRAIN

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The California Public Utilities Commission's Rail Transit Safety Section (RTSS) staff conducted this system security program review. Staff members directly responsible for conducting review and inspection activities include:

Stephen Artus, Rail Transit Crossing Branch
Program and Project Supervisor
Steve Espinal – Senior Utilities Engineer
Anton Garabetian – Senior Utilities Engineer
Vincent Kwong, CPUC Representative to
AirTrain, Utilities Engineer

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
2 INTRODUCTION	2
3 BACKGROUND	3
4 SECURITY REVIEW PROCEDURE	4
5 FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	5
 APPENDICES	
A. Acronyms List	7
B. AirTrain 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklist Index	8
C. AirTrain 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklists	9

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The California Public Utilities Commission's (Commission) Consumer Protection and Safety Division (CPSD), Rail Transit Safety Section staff (Staff) conducted an on-site system security review of the San Francisco International Airport AirTrain (AirTrain) in November 2010. The review focused on verifying AirTrain's effective implementation of the System Security Plan, addressing Threat & Vulnerability Assessment (TVA) and emergency response.

Following the on-site security review, staff held a post-review conference with AirTrain executives on December 6, 2010. Staff provided AirTrain personnel with a synopsis of the preliminary review findings and preliminary recommendations for corrective actions.

The security review results indicate that AirTrain has a comprehensive system security program and has effectively implemented the System Security Plan (SSP). Staff noted no exceptions during the review and therefore made no recommendations.

The Introduction for this report is presented in Section 2. Section 3 is the Background Section which contains a description of the AirTrain system and a status of the corrective actions resulting from the 2007 on-site safety and security review recommendations. Section 4 describes the review procedure. The review findings and recommendations are listed in Section 5. The 2010 AirTrain Triennial Security Review Acronyms List is found in Appendix A, Checklist Index in Appendix B, and Review Checklists in Appendix C.

2. INTRODUCTION

The Commission's General Order (GO) 164-D, *Rules and Regulations Governing State Safety Oversight of Rail Fixed Guideway Systems*, and the Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) Rule, Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 659, *Rail Fixed Guideway Systems: State Safety Oversight*, require the designated State Safety Oversight Agencies to perform a review of each rail transit agency's system safety and security program(s) at a minimum of once every three years. The purpose of the triennial review is to evaluate the effectiveness of each rail transit agency's System Security Plan (SSP) and to assess the level of compliance with GO 164-D as well as other Commission safety and security requirements. Staff conducted the previous AirTrain on-site security review in conjunction with Transportation Security Administration in August 2007.

Staff advised AirTrain Manager by a letter dated on September 23, 2010 of the scheduling of the Commission's safety review on November 8-10, 2010. The letter included 5 checklists that served as the basis for the review. The checklists focused on the verification of the effective implementation of the SSP.

Staff conducted an opening conference on November 8, 2010 with AirTrain Manager, Safety and Security Manager, Bombardier Site Director, and Bombardier managers and supervisors.

Staff conducted the on-site security inspections and records review during November 8-10, 2010. At the conclusion of each review activity, staff provided AirTrain personnel a verbal summary of the preliminary findings and discussed preliminary recommendations for corrective actions.

On December 6, 2010, staff conducted a post-review exit meeting with AirTrain's managers. Staff provided the attendees a synopsis of the findings from the 5 checklists and addressed any questions or concerns from AirTrain's management.

3. BACKGROUND

AirTrain at the San Francisco International Airport began operation on February 24, 2003 as a six mile system. It operates 24 hours every day, providing free service throughout the San Francisco International Airport (SFO). The SFO AirTrain was originally contracted to Bombardier as a design-build-operate-maintain project. The system is owned by the San Francisco Airports Commission and is currently operated and maintained by Bombardier. With a fleet of 38 CX-100 people movers, the six mile system serves nine stations connecting all the airport's terminals, parking garages, and the Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) station with the Rental Car Center.

The AirTrain system operates two lines. These are:

- Blue Line – all terminals, garages, BART Station, and Rental Car Center
- Red Line – all terminals, garages, and the BART Station.

Status of the 2007 AirTrain Triennial Review Recommendations

The Transportation Security Administration (TSA) performed the previous triennial on-site security review in August 2007 in conjunction with CPUC Staff. In a summary letter, TSA found various deficiencies involved in the compliance of the SSP document and the process for conducting internal security reviews.

CPUC Commission Resolution ST-91 adopted staff's final report and ordered AirTrain to develop appropriate corrective action plan and implementation schedule to respond to the issued recommendations. Resolution ST-91 also ordered AirTrain to submit quarterly status reports tracking the implementation of these corrective actions through full completion.

AirTrain developed and submitted a corrective action plan and an implementation schedule to fulfill each of the five recommendations. On December 3, 2008, AirTrain completed the last of the corrective actions in compliance with Commission Resolution ST-91.

4. REVIEW PROCEDURE

Staff conducted the 2010 Triennial Security Review in accordance with Rail Transit Safety Section Procedure Four (4), *Procedure for Performing Triennial Safety & Security Reviews of Rail Transit Systems*. Staff developed five (5) checklists to evaluate the adequacy of AirTrain's system security plan and the efficacy of its implementation.

The security evaluation includes the AirTrain security department, programs and processes which have system security functions and responsibilities. The review is based on Commission and FTA requirements, AirTrain's SSP & System Safety Program Plan (SSPP), American Public Transportation Association (APTA) system safety program guidelines, TSA baseline review list, TSA security related documents, and the staff's knowledge of the transit system. The five (5) checklists are listed in Appendix B.

Each checklist identifies the core security-related elements and characteristics that staff reviewed. Each of the checklists also references Commission, AirTrain, and other documents that establish the security program requirements. The methods used to perform the review include:

- Discussions and interviews with AirTrain management
- Reviews of rules, procedures, policies, and records
- Interviews with rank and file employees

Immediately following the security review, staff summarized the findings and the preliminary recommendations (if appropriate) with the respective AirTrain security personnel. The post-review summary is beneficial for clarifying findings or best-practices and provided AirTrain an opportunity to promptly address any necessary security improvements.

5. FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

APPENDICES

	Page
A. Acronyms List	7
B. AirTrain 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklist Index	8
C. AirTrain 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklists	9

**APPENDIX A
ACRONYMS LIST**

Abbreviation / Acronym	Description
BART	Bay Area Rapid Transit District
CAP	Corrective Action Plan
CFR	Code of Federal Regulations
Commission	California Public Utilities Commission
CPSD	Consumer Protection and Safety Division
CPUC	California Public Utilities Commission
FTA	Federal Transit Administration
GO	General Order
RTCB	Rail Transit and Crossing Branch
RTSS	Rail Transit Safety Section
SSP	System Security Plan
SSPP	System Safety Program Plan
Staff	Consumer Protection and Safety Division personnel

APPENDIX B
AirTrain 2010 TRIENNIAL SECURITY REVIEW CHECKLISTS INDEX
(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

APPENDIX C

AirTrain 2010 TRIENNIAL SECURITY REVIEW CHECKLISTS (CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”