



FILED

12/18/20
02:27 PM

ALJ/JSJ/kz1 12/18/2020

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Appeal of MOHAMMEDZEYN, ADGO, doing
business as All POINT LIMO [[PSG-5191,
TCP 23256] from Citation F-5708 issued on
September 9, 2020 by the California Public
Utilities Commission, Transportation
Enforcement Branch, Consumer Protection and
Enforcement Division.

K.20-10-014

E-MAIL RULING REGARDING TELEPHONIC EVIDENTIARY HEARING

Dated December 18, 2020, at San Francisco, California.

/s/ JASON JUNGREIS

Jason Jungreis
Administrative Law Judge

From: Jungreis, Jason <Jason.Jungreis@cpuc.ca.gov>
Sent: Friday, December 18, 2020 8:50 AM
To: AllPointLimo@gmail.com; Bruno, Kenneth <Kenneth.Bruno@cpuc.ca.gov>; Yip-Kikugawa, Amy C. <amy.yip-kikugawa@cpuc.ca.gov>; Hook, Charlyn A. <charlyn.hook@cpuc.ca.gov>; Clay, Christopher <christopher.clay@cpuc.ca.gov>; Oh, Frances <Frances.Oh@cpuc.ca.gov>; Jungreis, Jason <Jason.Jungreis@cpuc.ca.gov>; Ito, Douglas <Douglas.Ito@cpuc.ca.gov>
Cc: ALJ Docket Office <ALJ_Docket_Office@cpuc.ca.gov>; ALJ Process <alj_process@cpuc.ca.gov>; ALJ Central Files Staff <ALJ_Central_Files_Staff@cpuc.ca.gov>; ALJ_Support ID <alj_supportid@cpuc.ca.gov>
Subject: K.20-10-014: EMAIL RULING REGARDING TELEPHONIC EVIDENTIARY HEARING

EMAIL RULING REGARDING TELEPHONIC EVIDENTIARY HEARING

To the Parties and to the Service List in K.20-10-014:

This e-mail Ruling sets a telephonic Evidentiary Hearing (Hearing) in Citation Appeal K. 20-10-014 for January 13, 2021, at 10:00 a.m.

This Hearing is the only Hearing that will take place in this proceeding. At the Hearing, I will receive all evidence and hear all arguments from the Consumer Protection and Enforcement Division (CPED) and Adgo Mohammedzeyn Essa (Mr. Essa). After the hearing, I will prepare a decision called a Resolution with findings of fact and conclusions of law.

This Ruling provides information regarding the Expedited Citation Appeal process. (Resolution ALJ-377, Rule 6.1). For additional reference, attached to this Email Ruling is Resolution ALJ-377 Appendix A, the "Citation Appellate Rules." See Rule 6.1 for the rules which apply to this proceeding.

In the Expedited Citation Appeal Hearing, parties represent themselves without lawyers; there is no need for further exchanges of information between the parties; and there will be no court reporter or transcript of the Hearing. CPED has the burden of proof by a preponderance of the evidence and, because of this,

CPED will open and close the Hearing. Mr. Essa has the burden of proof regarding any affirmative defenses he may wish to raise.

Information has already been exchanged through the Notice of Appeal and its contents, and through the CPED Compliance Filing and its contents. Because this will be a telephonic Hearing, parties will not be physically present to exchange additional information. Therefore, if either party wishes to present any additional information at the Hearing, that additional information must be emailed (not filed and not served) to the other party and to me no later than 24 hours prior to the Hearing.

The Hearing will be conducted as follows:

1. Speak only when addressed by the Administrative Law Judge.
2. Each time, immediately identify oneself when starting to speak.
3. Speak slowly and clearly.
4. Do not interrupt or speak over another person.
5. Opportunity will be provided for each party to discuss every issue.

The order of the Hearing will be as follows:

1. Introduction
2. Appearances
3. Discussion of issues to consider
4. CPED Opening
5. Mr. Essa Response
6. CPED Closing
7. Discussion of further steps

Each party is encouraged to directly contact the other party to explore the possibility of resolving this citation appeal through informal settlement. This is commonly done when the parties physically meet prior to a Hearing. Because we will not be physically meeting, the parties should undertake all possible settlement discussions by the day prior to the Hearing. CPED is encouraged to directly reach out to Mr. Essa to ensure settlement discussion takes place.

The following is the dial-in information for the Hearing:

Toll Free Number: 877-715-0719

Participant Passcode: 721383

IT IS SO RULED.

THE DOCKET OFFICE SHALL FORMALLY FILE THIS RULING.

Jason Jungreis

Administrative Law Judge

California Public Utilities Commission

jason.jungreis@cpuc.ca.gov

Notice: This communication may contain confidential and/or legally privileged information for the use of the intended recipient(s). Unauthorized use or disclosure is prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender and destroy all copies of the communication.

ATTACHMENT 1

APPENDIX A

Citation Appellate Rules and General Order I56 Appellate Rules

(Revised Rules Applicable on July 1, 2020)

Appendix A

Citation Appellate Rules and General Order 156 Appellate Rules (Citation Appellate Rules)

1. Applicability

The purpose of this Program is to establish Appellate Rules (Rules) so that all Citation Appeals and General Order 156 Appeals can be filed with the Commission's Docket Office. The Pilot Rules enacted in Resolution ALJ-299 were effective on January 1, 2015, and these Revised Rules are effective on July 1, 2020. For Citation Appeals, these Rules are to be read together with the Rules set forth in each statute, General Order, and Commission Resolution authorizing a Citation Program. For General Order 156 Appeals, these Rules are to be read together with General Order 156. These Rules, or their successor, are also applicable to future citation programs the Commission may establish.

Appendix A to the resolution adopting this program sets forth the Citation Appellate Rules and General Order 156 Appellate Rules which are applicable on July 1, 2020. Appendix B to the resolution adopting this pilot program sets forth how these Rules interact with an individual Citation Program or General Order 156.

2. Definitions

"Appellant" means the cited entity initiating the appeal.

"Citation Appeal" means an appeal from a citation or revocation of a license issued pursuant to a Citation Program.

"Citation Program" means the individual applicable statute, General Order or Resolution authorizing the issuance of a citation or authorizing the revocation of a license.

"Clearinghouse" means the Commission-supervised program that shall conduct WMLGBTBE verifications and maintains a database of WMDVLGBTBEs [women, minority, disabled veteran and lesbian, gay bisexual or transgender person-owned

business] for the use of utilities and the Commission as defined by General Order 156 § 1.3.22.

“General Order 156 Appeal” means an appeal from a decision of the Clearinghouse made pursuant to General Order 156.

“Expedited Citation Appeal” means an appeal from a citation issued pursuant to a citation program where the total citation amount does not exceed the jurisdictional limit of the small claims court, as referenced in Public Utilities Code § 1702.1. An Expedited Citation Appeal does not apply to Citation Appeals which include a license revocation or to General Order 156 appeals.

3. Filing the Notice of Appeal

Appellant must file a Notice of Appeal with the Commission’s Docket Office for a Citation Appeal by the time specified in the Citation Program or, for a General Order 156 Appeal, by the date set forth in General Order 156. The title page must comply with Rule 1.6 of the Commission’s Rules of Practice and Procedure. The caption of the appeal shall read: “Appeal of [who] from [Citation 12345] or [Clearinghouse Decision 12345] in the amount of [\$XXX.XX] issued by [Commission Division which issued the citation] or [the Clearinghouse].”

4. Extension of Time to File the Notice of Appeal

Unless authorized by a Citation Program, there shall be no extension of time to file a Notice of Appeal from a citation issued pursuant to a Citation Program or from a Clearinghouse Decision issued pursuant to GO 156. Any authorization of an extension of time to file a Notice of Appeal must be made by the Director (or designee) of the Commission Division which issued the citation, in writing, subject to the provisions of the Citation Program, and must be attached to the Notice of Appeal.

5. Minimum Content of the Notice of Appeal

The Notice of Appeal for a Citation Appeal must at a minimum state: (a) the date and dollar amount of the citation that is appealed; and (b) the rationale for the appeal as specifically instructed in the Citation Program. If a Citation Program is silent on instructions for setting forth the rationale for the appeal, the Notice of Appeal must state the grounds for the appeal. The Notice of Appeal must also set forth additional items, if any, as required by the Citation Program. Pursuant to Rule 4, if the Citation Program authorizes appellant to request an extension of time from a Division Director to file a Notice of Appeal, any extension received must be in writing and attached to the Notice of Appeal.

The Notice of Appeal for a General Order 156 Appeal must set forth (a) the date and dollar amount of the Clearinghouse Decision that is appealed; and (b) the grounds for the appeal as required by General Order 156 § 7.3.1.

6. Minimum Service Requirements for the Notice of Appeal

The Notice of Appeal for a Citation Appeal must be served, at a minimum, on the Chief Administrative Law Judge (with an electronic copy to: ALJ_Div_Appeals_Coordinator@cpuc.ca.gov), and on the Director of the Commission Division issuing the citation on the same day that the Notice of Appeal is filed. The appellant must file a proof of service to this effect at the same time appellant files the Notice of Appeal. The Notice of Appeal must also be served on other entities if required by the Citation Program.

The Notice of Appeal of a Clearinghouse Decision pursuant to General Order 156 must at a minimum be served on the Chief Administrative Law Judge (with an electronic copy to: ALJ_Div_Appeals_Coordinator@cpuc.ca.gov) and on the Clearinghouse that issued the decision on the same day that the Notice of Appeal is filed. The appellant must file a proof of service to this effect at the same time appellant files the Notice of Appeal.

If the General Order 156 Appeal involves the Clearinghouse's determination of another entity's women, minority, disabled veteran and lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender

business (WMDVLGBTBE) status, the entity whose WMDVLGBTBE status is challenged must also be served with the Notice of Appeal and may be a party to the appeal. The appellant must file a proof of service to this effect at the same time appellant files the Notice of Appeal.

Rule 6.1 Expedited Citation Appeal Procedure

This procedure is applicable to citation appeals where the total citation amount does not exceed the jurisdictional limit of the small claims court, as referenced in Public Utilities Code § 1702.1. The Expedited Citation Appeal Procedure does not apply to Citation Appeals which include a license revocation or to General Order 156 appeals.

- a) No representative (attorney at law or other representative) shall represent any party other than himself under the Expedited Citation Appeal Procedure. Rule 13 of these Rules, only as to party representative, does not apply.
- b) No pleadings other than the Notice of Appeal (see Rules 3-6 of these Rules) and the Compliance Filing (see Rule 7 of these Rules) are necessary.
- c) A hearing without a court reporter shall be held within the time period specified by Rule 10 of these Rules.
- d) Separately stated findings of fact and conclusions of law will be made in the resolution addressing the Expedited Citation Appeal.
- e) A party who is subject to the Expedited Citation Appeal Procedure may at any time prior to the swearing in of the first witness at the evidentiary hearing request termination of the Expedited Citation Appeal Procedure, and that the matter be recalendared for hearing under the Commission's regular procedure for Citation Appeals. The Commission or the assigned Administrative Law Judge, when the public interest so requires, may at any time prior to the filing of a resolution addressing the Citation Appeal, terminate the Expedited Citation Appeal Procedure and recalendar the matter for hearing under the Commission's regular procedure for Citation Appeals.
- f) The parties shall have the right to file applications for rehearing pursuant to Rule 20 of these Rules. If the Commission grants the rehearing, the rehearing shall be conducted under the Commission's regular procedure for Citation Appeals.

- g) Resolutions rendered pursuant to the Expedited Citation Appeal Procedure shall not be considered as precedent or binding on the Commission or the courts of this state.
- h) The following Citation Appellate Rules continue to apply to the Expedited Citation Appeal: Rule 1 Applicability; Rule 2 Definitions; Rule 3 Filing the Notice of Appeal; Rule 4 Extension of Time to File the Notice of Appeal; Rule 5 Minimum Content of the Notice of Appeal; Rule 6 Minimum Service Requirements for the Notice of Appeal; Rule 7 Compliance Filing; Rule 8 Service List and Parties to An Appeal; Rule 10 Commencement of Hearing; Rule 11 Burden of Proof; Rule 12 Hearing Venue; Rule 13 Party Representative/Evidence (only as to evidence, not as to party representative); Rule 15 Obtaining an Interpreter; Rule 16 Submission of the Record; Rule 17 Issuance Date of Draft Resolution; Rule 18 Issuance of Draft Resolution for Comment; Rule 19 Ex Parte Communications; Rule 20 Rehearing ; Rule 21 Service of These Rules and Resolution Adopting them With All Citations and Clearinghouse Decisions Concerning General Order 156; and Rule 22 Applicable Procedure When Pilot Program Appellate Rules Are Silent. The following Citation Appellate Rules do not apply to an Expedited Citation Appeal: Rule 9 Exchange of Information; Rule 13 Party Representative/Evidence) (only as to party representative, not as to evidence); and Rule 14 Obtaining a Transcript.

7. Compliance Filing

For a Citation Appeal, no later than 14 business days after the Notice of Appeal is filed, Staff issuing the citation must file with the Commission's Docket Office a Compliance Filing which includes a complete copy of the citation, including all attachments, which is appealed. The Compliance Filing must be served on the Chief Administrative Law Judge (with an electronic copy to: ALJ_Div_Appeals_Coordinator@cpuc.ca.gov) and appellant on the same day the Compliance Filing is filed. Staff must file a proof of service to this effect at the same time it files the Compliance Filing.

For a General Order 156 Appeal, no later than 14 business days after the Notice of Appeal is filed, the Clearinghouse must file with the Commission's Docket Office a

Compliance Filing which includes a complete copy of the decision, including all attachments, which is appealed. The Compliance Filing must be served on the Chief Administrative Law Judge (with an electronic copy to: ALJ_Div_Appeals_Coordinator@cpuc.ca.gov) and appellant on the same day the Compliance Filing is filed. The Clearinghouse must provide a proof of service to this effect at the same time it files the Compliance Filing.

8. Service List and Parties to an Appeal

The Commission will establish the service list for a Citation Appeal or a General Order 156 Appeal and maintain that service list on the appeal's Docket Card.

For a Citation Appeal, the parties to the appeal will be appellant and Staff which issued the citation which is appealed. Other interested persons may be placed on the information only section of the service list.

For a General Order 156 Appeal, the parties to the appeal will be appellant and the Clearinghouse, except in the case of an appeal of a Clearinghouse determination of another entity's women, minority, disabled veteran and lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender business (WMDVLGBTBE) status. In this case, the parties to the appeal will be appellant, the Clearinghouse, and may be the entity whose WMDVLGBTBE status is challenged. Other interested persons may be placed on the information only section of the service list.

9. Exchange of Information

No later than three business days prior to the scheduled hearing on a Citation Appeal or General Order 156 Appeal, the parties must exchange all information they intend to introduce into the record at the hearing which is not included in the citation or Clearinghouse Decision and the Compliance Filing already filed with the Commission pursuant to Rule 7 of these Rules, unless otherwise directed by the Administrative Law Judge. The information exchange is not to be filed with the Commission or served upon the Administrative Law Judge or other decision makers.

10. Commencement of Hearing

A Citation Appeal hearing or a General Order 156 Appeal hearing must commence by the time specified in the Citation Program or, for a General Order 156 appeal, by the time set forth in General Order 156.

If the Citation Program is silent on when a hearing must commence, the hearing must occur promptly, with the parties notified at least 10 days in advance of the hearing. In this instance, the Administrative Law Judge may for good cause or the parties' agreement grant a reasonable continuance of the hearing.

11. Burden of Proof

The burden of proof in a Citation Appeal or a General Order 156 Appeal is governed by the language in the Citation Program or General Order 156. For Citation Programs which are silent as to which party has the burden of proof, the following rule applies:

Staff has the burden of proof by a preponderance of the evidence and accordingly shall open and close the hearing. Respondent/Appellant has the burden to prove affirmative defenses it might raise. The Administrative Law Judge may, in his or her discretion, alter the order of presentation at the hearing.

12. Hearing Venue

The venue for a Citation Appeal or a General Order 156 Appeal hearing will be as set forth in each Citation Program or in General Order 156. To the extent a Citation Program is silent on venue, the venue for the Citation Appeal hearing will be in either San Francisco or Los Angeles, California, at the Commission's discretion.

13. Party Representative/Evidence

For all Citation Appeals and General Order 156 Appeals, appellant may be represented at the hearing by an attorney or other representative, but such representation will be at the appellant's sole expense. Rule 13.6 (Evidence) of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure is applicable.

14. Obtaining a Transcript

For all Citation Appeals and General Order 156 Appeals, appellant may order a transcript of the hearing, and pay the cost of the transcript in accordance with the Commission's usual procedures.

15. Obtaining an Interpreter

For all Citation Appeals and General Order 156 Appeals, upon a good faith showing of language difficulty, the appellant will be entitled to the services of an interpreter at the Commission's expense upon written request to the assigned Administrative Law Judge and the Commission's Public Advisor's Office not less than five business days prior to the date of the hearing.

16. Submission of the Record

The submission date in a Citation Appeal or a General Order 156 appeal is governed by the time specified in the Citation Program or General Order 156.

If a Citation Program is silent on the submission date for the appeal, the following rule applies: Ordinarily, the appeal will be submitted at the close of the hearing. In the Administrative Law Judge's discretion, the record may be kept open for a reasonable period to permit a party to submit additional evidence or argument.

17. Issuance Date of Draft Resolution

The Administrative Law Judge will issue a draft resolution resolving the Citation Appeal or General Order 156 appeal expeditiously, and no later than 60 days after the Citation Appeal or General Order 156 appeal is submitted. The draft resolution will be placed on the first available agenda consistent with the Commission's applicable rules.

18. Issuance of Draft Resolution for Comment

A resolution addressing a Citation Appeal or a General Order 156 Appeal is subject to the public comment period as set forth in Pub. Util. Code § 311(g) and Article 14 of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure (Rules). The draft resolution will be placed on the first available agenda, consistent with the Commission's applicable rules.

Any person may file comments on the draft resolution and as otherwise provided in Rule 14.5 of the Commission's Rules.

19. Ex Parte Communications

For all Citation Appeals and General Order 156 Appeals, ex parte communications as defined by Rule 8.1(c) of the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure, with a decision maker, including any Commissioner, Commissioner advisor, the Chief Administrative Law Judge, any Assistant Chief Administrative Law Judge, the assigned Administrative Law Judge, or the Law and Motion Administrative Law Judge, are prohibited from the date the Citation or Clearinghouse Decision issued pursuant to General Order 156 is issued, through the date a final order is issued on the Citation Appeal or General Order 156 Appeal.

A final order means the date when the period to apply for rehearing of the Commission resolution on the appeal has expired and no application for rehearing has been filed, or if an application for rehearing is filed, the date when the period to seek judicial review of the decision finally resolving the application for rehearing has passed without any party seeking judicial review; or if judicial review is sought, the date any court cases are finally resolved.

20. Rehearing

A resolution resolving a Citation Appeal or a General Order 156 appeal approved by the Commission is subject to rehearing pursuant to Pub. Util. Code § 1731 and to judicial review pursuant to Pub. Util. Code § 1756.

21. Service of these Rules and Resolution Adopting Them With All Citations and Clearinghouse Decisions Concerning General Order 156

Commission Staff must serve either (a) a copy of these Rules and the Resolution adopting this program with all citations issued; or (b) a concise summary of appeal instructions applicable to the cited entity, provided these instructions have been reviewed and approved prior to their use by the Commission's Legal Division and that

the instructions contain an electronic link to the complete copy of the Commission's Citation Appellate Rules and the resolution adopting them.

The Clearinghouse must serve a copy of these Rules and the Resolution adopting this program with all Clearinghouse Decisions concerning General Order 156.

22. Applicable Procedure when Citation Appellate Rules Are Silent

For a Citation Appeal, in the event these citation appellate rules and the applicable General Order or Resolution authorizing issuance of the citation which is appealed are silent on a procedural issue, the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure are applicable.

For a General Order 156 appeal, in the event these citation appellate rules and General Order 156 are silent on a procedural issue, the Commission's Rules of Practice and Procedure are applicable.

(END OF APPENDIX A)

END ATTACHMENT 1