BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE
STATE OF CALIFORNIA
COMMISSIONER JOHN REYNOLDS, in attendance
COMMISSIONER DARCIE HOUCK, in attendance
ASSISTANT CHIEF ALJ W. ANTHONY COLBERT, in attendance
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE THOMAS J. GLEGOLA, presiding

Application of Pacific Bell ) PUBLIC
Telephone Company D/B/A AT&T ) PARTICIPATION
California (U1001C) to Relinquish ) HEARING
its Eligible Telecommunications ) Application
Carrier Designation ) 23-03-002

Application of Pacific Bell )
Telephone Company d/b/a/ AT&T )
California (U1001C) for Targeted ) Application
Relief from its Carrier of Last ) 23-03-003
Resort Obligation and Certain )
Associated Tariff Obligations. )

REPORTERS' TRANSCRIPT
Ukiah, California
February 22, 2024
Pages 111 - 312
Volume 2

Reported by: Shannon Ross Winters, CSR No. 8916
Ashleigh E. Button, CSR No. 14013
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>INDEX</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>STATEMENTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER PRATT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>SPEAKER BUSHNELL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER VALENZUELA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>SPEAKER PHILIPPI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER BOHN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>SPEAKER McGOURTY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER KRAUT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>SPEAKER LAPORTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER SIEVERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>SPEAKER DE TAILLANDIER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER MORRISON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>SPEAKER BARRETT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER ROSSER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>SPEAKER WALLACE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER TELLER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>SPEAKER HOGLE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER LEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>SPEAKER CLARKE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER HAYS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>SPEAKER VASSEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER DECKER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>SPEAKER TIMPY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER HEGGARTY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>SPEAKER ELLIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER HARTLEY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>SPEAKER MOREHOUSE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER EDISON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>SPEAKER JONES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER DRELL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>SPEAKER BARRE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER HAJIK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>SPEAKER HASCHAK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER HELMAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>SPEAKER B. DUTRA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER M. DUTRA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>SPEAKER BERTEA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER AMINOFF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>SPEAKER MATSON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER HAAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>SPEAKER BEBE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER ARNOLD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>SPEAKER GALLETTI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER ZAGARIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>SPEAKER CRAWFORD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER CHITTARO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>SPEAKER AMES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER STEPHENS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPEAKER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>GOUVEIA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>WEIBEL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>KENDALL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>GAGNON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>GODOSKI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>DeFELICE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>HEAPE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>COMISKEY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>McMANUS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>POLKINGHORNE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>BUCH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>HOOKER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>DUVIVIER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>LOTTER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>GONZALEZ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>MERCADO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>BARBOUR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>McGOURTY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>MORENO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>MULHEREN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>PRIBYL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>WARSAW</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>WILLIAMS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>BEARDEN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>KURZFELD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>SCHNEIDER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>BLACKMON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>CHRISTOPHER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>EDWARDS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>FRANK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>McMartin-Rosenquist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>SCHOWENGERDT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>LISTON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>STAHL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>ALTIMARI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>BRUDER</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>APARICIO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>SIZEMORE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>RUSHTON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>SAUERS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>KABAGE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>McDonald</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>ACKERMANN</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION, STATE OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
UKIAH, CALIFORNIA

FEBRUARY 22, 2024 - 2:10 P.M.

* * * * *

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE GLEGOLA: We'll be on the record then. The Commission will come to order. Today is February 22, 2024. This is the time and place for one of two public participation hearings on two proceedings being reviewed by the California Public Utilities Commission.

As I mentioned while off the record, the first proceeding is Application 23-03-002. This is the Application of AT&T California to withdraw its Eligible Telecommunications Carrier designation, and the second proceeding is Application 23-03-003. This is the Application of AT&T California to withdraw as a Carrier of Last Resort from much of its source territory.

Today's public participation hearing, or PPHs, are being held at the Mendocino County Board of Supervisor's chambers. I very much want to thank Mendocino County for allowing us to use this room and the overflow room today. I also want to make sure that any members of the public that wish to comment they know that they may do so in both proceedings when it's their turn to speak.

I also want to make sure that everyone in
attendance understands that the purpose of today's
meeting is to hear from the public on these
applications. No action will be taken --

(Audience interruption.)

ALJ GLEGOLA: No action will be taken today.

(Audience interruption.)

ALJ GLEGOLA: This is going to be hard. So no
action will be taken today, and the commissioners and I
will discuss the procedural schedule a little bit later,
so you'll hear that too.

My name is Thomas J. Glegola. I am the
assigned administrative law judge, or ALJ, assigned to
this proceedings. The Honorable John Reynolds, to my
right, is the assigned commissioner. In addition, we
have Commissioner Darcie Houck with us, another
commissioner for the California Public Utilities
Commission, and also co-presiding is the Honorable
W. Anthony Colbert. Assistant Chief Colbert is the
assistant chief administrative law judge for many
telecommunications matters as well as broadband issues.

Commissioner Reynolds, do you have any opening
remarks. Yes.

COMMISSIONER REYNOLDS: Thank you, Judge
Glegola. It's wonderful to be here with you all. Good
afternoon, everyone. Thank you to Commissioner Houck
and Assistant Chief Colbert for joining us today. I am Commissioner John Reynolds, the assigned commissioner to these proceedings, AT&T's applications.

I want to thank the Mendocino County Board of Supervisors and the City of Ukiah for having us today. Judge Glegola will go into some matters in more detail before we get started hearing from you, but I do want to cover a few things in advance of today's public participation hearing.

First, I'd like to talk about the Public Utilities Commission a little bit. The CPUC, or the Commission --

(Audience interruption.)

COMMISSIONER REYNOLDS: -- is the regulatory agency for all of California's -- still having difficulty hearing me?

(Audience interruption.)

COMMISSIONER REYNOLDS: Yes. Is the regulatory agency for all of California's investor-owned public utilities spanning across energy, water and telecommunications industries. The Commission is headed by five commissioners with each commissioner serving six-year, staggered terms. As a commissioner, I'm assigned to a wide variety of cases, including these two requests by AT&T.
What do these requests or applications mean?

AT&T has come before the PUC asking for two separate requests: First, you have the request to relinquish their Eligible Telecommunications Carrier designation. An Eligible Telecommunications Carrier, which we'll sometimes call an "ETC," is a telephone company that operates in a specific geographic area and receives financial assistance from the Federal Universal Service Fund to provide affordable telephone service to customers at all income levels. AT&T is, essentially, requesting to no longer operate as an ETC in California.

Second, we have AT&T's request for relief from its Carrier of Last Resort obligation and certain associated tariff obligations. Carrier of Last Resort, we sometimes refer to as a "COLR," C-O-L-R. So if we interchangeably use that acronym, just be aware that we're talking about the same thing. A COLR is a telecommunications service provider that stands ready to provide basic telephone service, commonly landline telephone service, to any customer requesting such service within a specified geographic area.

AT&T is the designated COLR for many parts of the state and is the largest COLR in California. Where AT&T is the default basic telephone service provider, it must provide basic telephone service to any potential...
customer in that service territory.

    When we talk about basic telephone service, I want to emphasize this does not necessarily mean that your particular home phone service is basic service or that it is provided by the landline copper or fiber-optic wireline. Your home phone service may, for example, be provided by other technology like Voice over Internet Protocol, sometimes referred to as VoIP.

    I'd like to talk briefly about the purpose of public participation hearings, why we're here today. The purpose of these hearings at the Commission is to hear from customers or concerned Californians about proceedings before the CPUC.

    Today's public comments, in addition to the comments made at all the public participation hearings that we'll be holding over the next few weeks, will help the Commission evaluate AT&T's requests in both cases.

    It is crucial to our decision-making process that we hear from customers on the issues before us, and I want to thank the members of the public who are here with us today for sharing their views and concerns about the applications. I'd also like to talk briefly about where we are in these proceedings. After the public participation hearings conclude on March 19, Judge Glegola will hold evidentiary hearings at the
Commissions' San Francisco hearing rooms.

After the hearing, AT&T and other active parties to the cases will file legal briefs. After that process, Judge Glegola will issue a proposed decision for the Commission to consider at one of its official voting meetings, and our current schedule provides for that to happen later this year.

No decision has yet been made about AT&T's requests. AT&T has made its request, but no changes can occur without a vote on a proposed decision supported by a majority of the five commissioners at the PUC.

With that, I'd like to conclude my remarks.

And, once again, thank you for the views you'll be sharing with us today. I look forward to hearing from you all, and back to you, Judge Glegola.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you Commissioner Reynolds.

Commissioner Houck, do you have any remarks?

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: Can everyone hear me?

(Audience responds in the affirmative.)

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: Great. If you can't -- I know you're not shy -- just let me know. So I want to thank Commissioner Reynolds and Judge Glegola.

And good afternoon, everyone. As Judge Glegola stated, my name is Darcie Houck. I'm one of five commissioners at the California Public Utilities
Commission, and I'm Commissioner Reynolds' Bagley Keene partner for this proceeding, and I want to thank all of you for joining us today to provide feedback and comment on this important proceeding.

As you heard from Judge Glegola and Commissioner Reynolds we're here to discuss AT&T's two separate requests to relinquish their Eligible Telecommunications Carrier designation and their Carrier of Last Resort obligation.

Commissioner Reynolds has provided an overview of what these two items entail, and I'm not going to repeat his comments or go into detail because we really are here to hear from you today. And we understand and have received significant comments from members of the public that have expressed great concern regarding any potential limiting of landline copper service.

We recognize that many members of the public have expressed a need to continue with their current service and appreciate the time, effort, and concern that the public has expressed through emails, phone calls, participating at voting meetings, through providing public comment, and through participation in our public participation hearings such as the hearing this afternoon and this evening.

We also recognize that being here today to
express your opinion takes away from your normal daily routine and shows the importance of the issue that is before us in this proceeding.

As stated by Commissioner Reynolds, it's crucial to our decision-making process that we hear from customers on the issues before us in this proceeding, and I also want to thank the members of the public for coming to our hearing this afternoon. There is a great turn out here and we definitely want to hear from everyone.

I also just want to restate that, again, no decisions have been made in the application, and as Commissioner Reynolds walked through the process, I'm not going to reiterate that, but no changes will occur until there is a vote by all five commissioners, and so that is a little ways off, and we definitely want your perspective in the record.

So, again, I want to thank all of you for being here today to share your comments with us.

I want to thank the public officials that have shown up today; the applicant, AT&T California, and any of the other parties to the proceeding that may be here. I also want to thank our court reporters and our staff who've done a tremendous amount of work to make this meeting happen; Commissioner Reynolds, Judge Glegola and
Judge Colbert for being here.

With that, I will turn it back over to Judge Glegola, and, again, appreciate all of your work that you've done in the proceeding.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you, Commissioner Houck.

Assistant Chief Colbert, do you have any remarks?

AC ALJ COLBERT: No.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Commissioner Reynolds and Commissioner Houck provided a high-level overview for you. If you'd like more details, one, we're going to have a presentation from AT&T and the Commission's Public Advocates Office after that, but there are Fact Sheets in the back, and if you want to go to the Commission's website, you can find more information there. The website to access is www.cpuc.ca.gov/PPH.

Additionally, I'm assuming why all of you are here is that AT&T mailed a notice of its COLR application to you. So before we hear from you, we want to make sure that you have a chance to listen to a brief presentation from the applicant, and each entity, both AT&T and the Commissions Public Advisor's Office, will have five minutes.

AT&T can start.

MS. VRIHEAS: I'll turn so I can face you. So
morning -- good afternoon. My name is Tedi Vriheas and I'm the vice president of external affairs for AT&T California. Thank you for being here. And thank you for this opportunity to talk about this important topic, AT&T's Carrier of Last Resort application, or COLR application, before the CPUC.

My goal today is to clear up any confusion. The recent notices you received in the mail have generated around this proceeding and to alleviate any concerns you have about losing your phone service.

I want to assure you that no one is going to be left without service.

All of our customers will have access to voice service and especially 911.

In addition, we will continue to provide service to areas where we are the only provider, including in rural areas.

We will work to upgrade antiquated copper phone lines to ensure customers have better technologies either from us or another provider.

We will invest in our modern high-speed networks to help keep our customers, our first responders and communities in California connected.

The CPUC designated Pacific Bell, now AT&T, 25 years ago, the Carrier of Last Resort, or COLR.
As Commissioner Reynolds stated, with this designation comes the obligation to provide basic telephone service to anyone in our service territory who wants it.

And at the time AT&T was the only provider providing copper landline basic service into the home; so it made sense to have someone have this obligation.

Today there are dozens of companies providing voice services in California, and competition is here and it is robust.

Consumers are voting with their feet, leaving behind AT&T's basic service overwhelmingly in favor of more advanced technology, like fiber and wireless.

In fact, more than seven in 10 adults now live in households where only wireless phones are their basic form of service, and we've seen about 90 percent decline of our landline service provided over copper.

Because customers are choosing to receive services over alternative advanced technologies, this service is coming to the end of its lifecycle, which is why we are asking the CPUC to remove the obligation on AT&T to continue to provide this antiquated phone service.

What we are asking for, COLR relief, is not new. We were COLR in 20 other states across the
country. We have received COLR relief in 20 states. California is our last state.

No customers have lost voice service as a result of this relief. We have left no one without service, and that would be the case in California as well.

This is not an overnight transition. We are in the very early stages of a multi-year process managed by the CPUC. Your input, together with input from others, to the proceeding will be taken into account as the CPUC works towards their decision.

AT&T's commitment to our customers, to the State of California and bridging the digital divide is unwavering.

Copper-based landline phone service no longer serves the needs of the majority of our community, our customers, our first responders, students, businesses, tribal communities, anybody seeking to connect to the internet.

Our request to the CPUC will help us achieve California's goals. California is dedicating over $8 billion in federal funding to build-out broadband, high speed broadband in the state of California. They are not investing in copper.

The broadband market in California is changing
every day and copper is simply not the technology of today or tomorrow.

I have spent a lot of time over the last four months going out to communities and talking about COLR. And I want to recognize two things: People are afraid, they're concerned that their landline is going away. They also want to be able to access 911.

And through the course of this proceeding, the CPUC will determine whether voice alternatives are available.

I hear: "There's no wireless in my community." "I can't use wireless as my only form of communication."

We understand that. And we don't expect you to do that.

What we want to do is to develop the list of alternatives that are available so that we can begin to transition people to more modern technology.

I've also heard things like: "AT&T is going to be leaving their customers behind." "You're going to be raising your rates 200 percent." And "copper is safest, most reliable."

But, in fact, none of that is true.

I would like to leave you with this: AT&T is the business -- is in the business of connecting our customers. We value our customers. And we greatly
appreciate their loyalty.

We will leave no customer without service in this transition.

We are simply asking the PUC to work with us in a proven, measured, thoughtful, and transparent way to ensure that our customers in California have access to the most advanced reliable technology available.

Thank you for your time today.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next, we will hear from the Commission's Public Advocates Office, and they have a PowerPoint slide presentation.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER PRATT

Thank you, Judge Glegola and commissioners. My name is Peter Pratt. I'm the policy supervisor of the California Office of Public Advocates within the CPUC. I do policy for communications and water for the Public Advocates Office.

I am pleased to speak for a few minutes today on behalf of the Public Advocates and tell our side of how we see the COLR application of AT&T.

Next slide, please.

A brief note on the Public Advocates Office.

As I said, we are an independent customer advocacy group within the Commission. We advocate on behalf of the...
utility ratepayers and are charged by state statute to do so.

Next slide please.

Some background. What is this proceeding about? AT&T is asking the Commission to change the rules and remove the safety net that guarantees access to affordable quality telephone service in much of California. Over 29 million customers with an AT&T service territory with over 7 million here in Northern California. That 29 million includes half a million -- 500,000 -- over 500,000 customers on plain old telephone service; a majority of whom also live here in Northern California.

Next slide, please.

What is a carrier of last resort obligation?

To continue some of the comments made by Commissioner Reynolds and available on the public website that Judge Glegola mentioned, I will just pick out some of the highlights. A carrier of last resort means there is at least one telephone company in your area that is legally required to serve anyone in its service territory that requests it.

Importantly, nothing in AT&T's COLR obligation prevents the company from upgrading its networks to technology such as fiber-optic systems. COLR is so
called tech-type neutral. The Commission has not
mandated AT&T to maintain copper lines or to move to
another type of technology. The fundamental principle
here is the ability to reach all that request service in
that given serving area.

AT&T wants to withdraw as the COLR in areas
where it claims there are alternative providers. The so
called alternative providers are not equivalent
providers because none of them are legally obligated to
offer service to everyone; further, these other
providers may offer wireless or mobile cell phone
coverage, which is often unreliable, especially in areas
like Mendocino County, in rural areas across California;
and today, we have seen reports across the entire
country there's been a significant mobile communications
outage.

AT&T has not committed to maintain Lifeline
service and/or the Deaf and Disabled Telecom Program
Service of the Commission in the current COLR areas and
would have no obligation to do so. There is no clear
migration path for customers, which may result in
disruption or termination of service.

Next slide, please.

The opinion of Cal Advocates, we ask what
should the Commission do? Here are our bulleted
recommendations. Cal Advocates has asked the Commission to dismiss AT&T's application because it is noncompliant with the underlying rules of the Commission that guarantee the presence of a COLR.

AT&T has failed to meet service quality rules across the state in multiple instances and should be required to maintain reliable service. Additionally, the Commission, in our opinion, also needs to ask which provider will be obligated to provide service in a given area if the COLR obligation is relieved.

Will customers have access to reliable phone service in areas prone to wildfires, flooding and other disasters? Elected officials from these districts here, in the congressional district, in the state senate district, in their opposition to this proceeding have clearly stated the issues of public safety as have many of our first responders in public service.

Will AT&T support customers reliant on Lifeline or the Deaf and Disabled Telecom Service Program of the Commission?

Lastly, will AT&T continue to maintain its network that relies on proper facilities or remove unused network cables that may contain toxic lead?

Next slide, please.

What can you do about this. With such a large
interest here shown in Ukiah today, Cal Advocates recommends that you share your reliance on existing telephone service; that you work with your community leaders and elected officials to make sure they understand the importance of this proceeding.

We suggest that you learn about this proceeding on the website that Judge Glegola mentioned, and we have a one-page handout outside on the Public Advisors' table that you can consult and see our many party partners who are supporting our position on this proceeding.

Also, we suggest that -- as you see on this slide -- please take down, if you'd like to, the name of our assigned analyst in the Public Advocates Office. Josh Cooper is there to answer your phone calls, answer your emails and inform you about our positions on this proceeding and the proceeding itself.

With that, I would like to thank you again for your presence here on behalf of the office of Public Advocates of The California Public Utilities Commission. We look forward to working with you in this proceeding.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. So, now we will turn to public comment. Your comments will help us as -- as we gather information to determine whether to grant, reject or modify both of the applications that are before us.
In addition to considering the comments that are made here today, we will also consider all comments that have been submitted electronically or by other means in the proceeding. The last time I looked, we had over 1,500 comments on AT&T's COLR application and over 450 on the ETC application.

If you haven't already signed up, and I see there are 70-some people that have signed up, you may go to the back of the room and sign up at the Public Advisors Office table.

And before -- go ahead and do that, but I do have some ground rules. One is that our court reporters are transcribing this, so please speak slowly and clearly. Please also make sure to state your name and spell it; and after this hearing is over, our court reporters will prepare a written transcript of this hearing.

So, with that...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: How long do we get to talk?

ALJ GLEGOLA: I am going to try to keep it at the one minute, two minutes.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Three.

ALJ GLEGOLA: I think three is going to be hard, because we have 70-some people here, and we are
going to try to -- we are going to stop at 3:30 and --
or 4:30, sorry, and then start again at 6:00.

So, but --

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: Let's go with two.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. We will go with two. And
we will start with Supervisor Bushnell.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BUSHNELL

Hello. Thank you for being here today. I am
Michelle Bushnell, M-i-c-h-e-l-l-e, B-u-s-h-n-e-l-l.
I'm a supervisor in Humboldt County in the second
district, and I here today on a -- my for constituents
and -- that live in very rural areas of Humboldt, which
is all of Humboldt, so.

People moved to Humboldt County with -- knowing
that they had telephone service, and they moved to very
rural areas, ranches and communities as such, never
thinking that they wouldn't be able to have phone
services currently. Those phone -- phone services are
down a lot of the time, and cell phone services are
nonexistent or sporadic in those areas.

People -- retired folks now live in those areas
still, own their homes and are looking at high,
expensive rates to try to correct to any kind of
services if they don't have the landlines.

It is essential for public safety. People live
two hours from hospitals. They rely on their fire
departments and 9-1-1. There is no fiber optics. There
is no satellite reception. There is no cell phone
service for those folks. It is imperative that they be
able to have their landlines and are guaranteed that --
that rate, especially -- they live -- they're -- you
know, they're retired. They have a very set income; and
so, it's very imperative that they have this opportunity
to keep their landline and phone service for safety.

Also, the retirement community, that's how they
communicate with each other. They can't travel a lot,
and social -- you know, when you can't be social. It re
-- it -- it does a lot of things to you, and that is
also very important.

I am asking that you require AT&T to be the
last resort carrier in -- throughout California.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next, can we please hear from Ruth Valenzuela
in Assembliesmember Wood's office?

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER VALENZUELA

Ruth Valenzuela. V-, as in Victor,
a-l-e-n-z-u-e-l-a.

Assemblymember Wood was unable to be here in
person, so I am delivering his comments for him.
Thank you for providing an opportunity to comment on AT&T's application for relief from its carrier of last resort obligation.

We have all had those conversations on our cell phones, "Can you hear me now?" "Can you hear me now?"

This region is not known for good cell service, and in many areas, the service is very spotty; and for numerous households, it doesn't exist.

According to the news stories last night, over 70,000 people lost their cell phone service for several hours. For many people, cell phones cannot be considered a viable alternative to a landline. In the last rounds of severe storms earlier this month, 40 -- 45,000 households in our assembly district were without power. Five days after the storms were over, there were still more than 5,000 households affected. For a large number of these people, when the power goes out, so does their phones.

AT&T appears to be out of touch with their customer base and the viability of the options they believe are available. Additionally, there have been incentives for service companies to overrepresent their service area. We cannot afford to be in unintended consequence.

For many people here, losing a landline isn't
just saying goodbye to a convenience. First of all, they aren't cheap. No one really wants to pay an extra bill. The loss of their landline is a scary and dangerous proposition. These are real people, and here are just a few of the comments that we have been receiving recently.

"Wildfires have disabled service for days at a time, and we need our landline." "The information for my pacemaker is transmitted to my doctor to my landline." "Our smoke detector system is serviced through our landline connection" and, "I am old, and my landline is my only communication with the outside world."

Obviously, given the number of people here today, this is a really important issue. I hope that their comments and concerns are taken seriously, and that AT&T's application for relief from its responsibility as the carrier of last resort is denied.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next up, we have Rhiannon Philippi from Senator McGuire's office, and apologies if I mispronounced your name.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER PHILIPPI

Oh, no worries. It's Rhiannon Philippi.
R-h-i-a-n-n-o-n, P-h-i-l-i-p-p-i.

Good afternoon, Commissioners. Thank you for holding these public forums for the North Coast communities to review the impacts of AT&T's recent request to be relieved of the carrier of last resort obligation in certain areas of California. We appreciate your thorough review of this critical public safety issue.

California is a big state and a one-size-fits-all approach to safe and reliable communication doesn't work, especially here on the rugged North Coast. Plain and simple, North Coast residents will be left unexposed, vulnerable and in danger if hard-line phone systems aren't maintained or abandoned. The fact is hardwired lines are a lifeline for rural residents.

The rural north coast is beautiful, but we all know we are prone to wildfires, earthquakes and severe winter storms. On a good day, cell service is limited here in our region. This is especially true during natural disasters. For residents here, a lifeline is a must. These are real people who would be impacted -- elder loved ones, parents and children. Real people who deserve the peace of mind that comes with being able to call for help. This is why maintaining AT&T's carrier
of last resort status is so critical for those
approximately 600,000 rural residents, businesses and
seniors, who all depend on traditional hardwire lines
across the state.

AT&T's proposal to pass off this obligation and
stop maintaining their copper wire network will
literally take away people's ability to call 9-1-1 in an
emergency or get warning calls from neighbors and
friends. It's unacceptable and exactly why we need the
CPUC to ensure that everyone has access to reliable
phone service no matter where you live.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next, we will hear from Rex Bohn, the Chair of
the Humboldt County Board of Supervisors.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BOHN

I'm easy. R-e-x, B-o-h-n. Rex Bohn.

Thank you. Darcie, good seeing you again. I
know how hard you guys work. She was in my pickup one
day for 10 hours looking at power and communication
issues up in Humboldt County on the Sunday to boot, so.

But as we move forward on this and what you're
hearing, you're not getting a lot of people saying,
"Hey, this is a great idea." The only people probably
happy today is PG&E because it's got them off the front
page with their rate hikes and now everybody is focused
on this.

SPEAKER BOHN: And I -- I -- I have got a great
working relationship with AT&T, but this is nowhere
ready to be baked. This needs to come back. We just
heard today -- the first time to me, but I haven't spent
a lot of time on this -- 20 states have already had this
done. Give us some narratives on how those 20 -- how
it's working now in those 20 states because we didn't
hear that. We just heard 20 states had already done it.

Up in Humboldt County, as my colleague
Supervisor Bushnell said, we are rural. We're -- we're
-- you know, 2.7 million acres with 130,000 people, and
everybody just depends on their landlines in the far
reaching areas because the -- the cellular service is
just not reliable now.

So, as we move forward and we go through this,
I don't think what AT&T is asking for, in general -- I
understand it's a business decision. It's not
considered an upgrade to make everything better for
us -- but I have some faith in them. They've been
around long enough. I have had my landline for
51 years, so I'm stubborn. I just can't give it up.

It's one of those things.

But as we move forward, there's other reasons,
and I think what happens -- and I don't want anybody because I am 70 years old -- but if you look in the community that sits in back of me right now, they're a vulnerable community that is worried about being able to make a phone call when they need to make that phone call; and right now, they have not be given the reassurances that they would be able to make those phone calls. They're not here on a Thursday afternoon because they want to see you guys, even though it's really great to see you. They're here because they're worried about the reliability of their phone service, and I think you guys hold it in your hands to tell AT&T bring back a better -- a better project, a better thing with more -- with more narratives.

They are telling you it's not going to effect -- they -- they gave out a whole sheet of things it's not going to effect. None that is in your packet for the CP -- you know, PUC hearing. That is stuff they are saying afterwards, and I -- I don't think that they're doing it maliciously, because I have faith in the -- in the people that work there. I don't know any of the big dogs, but I am just saying I think our local people will stand up for us, and I think we can end up with a better product, because the product we have been given now does not serve the public; and you -- you
know, you know what I mean, you're the Public Utilities Commission. The public is speaking and they're hoping that you will at least make them come back or just deny it all together.

Thank you for your time. Thank you for coming within 150 miles of Humboldt County. That was awfully good of you, so thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next, we have Supervisor Glenn McGourty.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER McGOURTY

My name is Glenn McGourty, Glenn with two Ns and McGourty is spelled M-c-G-o-u-r-t, as in Tom, -y.

Well, thank you very much for allowing me to address you this afternoon. I consider our phone lines to be critical infrastructure in our county. A large portion of my district, which is District 1 in Mendocino County has limited or no cell phone service, no Wi-Fi, no cable or fiber-optic system, and the reason for this is, if you think about Mendocino County, we are two-thirds the size of the state of Connecticut. We have 90,000 people. We have the same population as the city of Elko, Nevada; and it is very difficult terrain to run infrastructure into.

For instance, we are really happy that we recently are getting the middle-mile fiber-optic cable,
which costs about $60 million. To go that last mile for
everybody would cost us close to $800 million. So, in a
poor community like ours, we are identified as an
economically disadvantaged community. It's not likely
that we would be able to pay for this.

We have many people who live below the median
economic income of the state including a lot of tribal
people, and we really don't have any access to
alternatives, so this is really essential for us.

We are an aging community. We have been very
faithful to AT&T all these years. They've been a public
monopoly. We have gone along with their rates. Our
service has declined. I basically gave up my landline,
because I couldn't use it a good deal of the time. It
would rain, and it wouldn't work. When it wasn't
raining, I would get large amounts of static, and as bad
as it is, for some people, that's all they have access
to.

So, for that reason, we really want you to
think about AT&T's proposal very carefully, because in
our rural area, this is the only option that we have
that have the infrastructures in place that actually
works.

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.
So I'm going to try to be a little efficient here. I hope you all don't mind and that's to ask that three people line up. Just that way we can have three people. Hopefully that works. The first person is Jeffrey Kraut, the second person is Jennifer Porter, and the third is Sievers.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER KRAUT

Good afternoon. My name is Jeffrey Kraut. For 40 years I was a pediatrician and emergency department physician at Mendocino Coast District Hospital in Fort Bragg. At intervals during that time, I served as Chief of Staff, Chief of Pediatrics, Chief of Emergency Medicine, and Emergency Services Director for the Mendocino Coast.

From my experience, I'm acutely aware of the need for reliable telephone communication service. Telephone service is an essential emergency service. As such, redundancy is important. There are times that cell service does not work and less frequently times that landline service does not work. Both are required. A commercial airline does not fly with just one engine.

Two, this emergency service is required by both providers of care and those receiving it. Without the redundant service, many of my patients would not have received the urgent care that they needed. These
included mothers about to give birth, infants with fevers and injured children.

Three, there is now a portion of our population who cannot tolerate the electric and magnetic field radiation of cell phones. A landline is the only option for them.

For all these reasons, I strongly urge the CPUC to deny the request of AT&T to drop its landline service requirement. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Jennifer Laporta, L-a-p-o-r-t-a.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER LAPORTA

Yes. Jennifer Laporta, L-a-p-o-r-t-a. I'm from Santa Rosa, where -- land of wildfires and lots of deaths -- where landlines are essential. I personally cannot use a cell phone for any length of time because of electro-sensitivity and so I do require a landline as well as some of my friends who have Lifeline service who cannot be here because one of them had a stroke, but Lifeline service is very important.

So AT&T is requesting permission to abandon its COLR obligation without finding a definitive replacement, and we're talking about thousands of people who are going to be affected by this, hundreds of thousands of people.

And what we just heard in the news today with
70,000 people nationwide who went without service from AT&T is pretty ominous. And, you know, AT&T's application is opposed by the Rural Counties, Representatives of California, California Assembly Member Damon Connolly, U.S. Rep Adam Schiff, Santa Cruz County board of supes, Sierra County board of supes, Humboldt County board of supes -- thank you for being here -- and Mike McGuire.

You just heard from all these officials who say that we need our landlines to be available, especially in an emergency, and, you know, this is just unfair to take this away from us. That's all I can say.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER SIEVERS
Vicki Sievers, V-i-c-k-i S-i-e-v-e-r-s, San Rafael. I assist and advocate for people who are made ill by wireless emissions, by emissions from cell phone and Wi-Fi and wireless devices.

I'd like to refer to the motion of the Public Advocates Office to dismiss AT&T's amended application. The document points to the fact that the Commission's Environmental and Social Justice Action Plan is founded on assuring widespread availability of high-quality telecom service to all customers who request it. The plan is safeguard against discrimination.

Public Advocates attorneys show that the AT&T's
application replaces the, quote, "necessary presence of
designated C-O-L-R with an uncommitted," unquote, voice
alternative. Please know that only the fully wired,
high-quality connectivity of Plain Old Telephone Service
is tolerable for the three to seven percent of the
population that is very sensitive to wireless radiation.

AT&T intends to discriminate against at least
one million people, therefore, in the census blocks in
which they seek to eliminate copper. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

The next three are Leslie De Taillandier, Linda
Morrison and Michael Barrett.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER DE TAILLANDIER

Good afternoon. My name is Leslie
De Taillandier, D-e T-a-i-l-l-a-n-d-i-e-r. I would like
to say that I strongly oppose AT&T's application to
terminate POTS, traditional copper-landline phone
service. AT&T's intention to eliminate this
irreplaceable communication system is reckless and
irresponsible, and prioritizes profit over public need
and public safety.

Seniors need copper-landline phones for
emergencies. California counties absolutely need copper
landlines for natural disaster emergencies. And for
people who suffer from electro-magnetic radiation
sensitivity from wireless devices and Wi-Fi systems,
they, too, definitely need copper-landline phone service
because copper landlines don't emit Wi-Fi radiation.

There is yet another reason to keep
copper-landline phones, and that is the internet is
vulnerable to cyber-attacks. Yet telecom wants to
replace copper-landline phones with Voice over Internet
Protocol, and VoIP needs internet connection to
function. Very recently the FBI intercepted a Russian
hacking operation of internet.

If the internet is disabled VoIP phone
communication halts. Since the internet is the backbone
of VoIP system, vulnerabilities of VoIP are network
attacks, eavesdropping, and its use of Wi-Fi network,
but on the other hand, copper-landline phones do not
need to use internet connection.

So it is clear that AT&T's POTS copper-landline
phone service is the most reliable indispensable means
of communication. Please do not support AT&T's
application to terminate traditional copper-landline
phone service. Thank you very much for your time.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you very much. I apologize
for mispronouncing your last name.

Next is Linda Morrison.
Linda Morrison, M-o-r-r-i-s-o-n, and I'm from Lake County. And many areas in Lake county, like a lot of the others, do not have access to cell phones. It just doesn't work. Okay. There are no towers. Additionally, other things are run on them. They mentioned a number. In my case, my alarm system runs on telephone service on the hardwire.

I've been told by AT&T linemen that every time it rains, I will have problems because the rain gets into the wires because they refuse to replace anything. I've already been out for 12 days this year.

Every time it rains, it gets into it. It causes static and then it dies, and takes them a week to get out there. AT&T needs to be doing their job, not trying to get out of it because that's what they're trying to do, is just drop us. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next up is Michael Barrett.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BARRETT

Good afternoon. My name is Michael Barrett, B-a-r-r-e-t-t, from Lake County. Those that know Lake County pretty good, I'm near beautiful downtown Finley, and there's a lot of places that have no cell service, not only in Lake County but other counties throughout
the state, probably the country.

And AT&T -- God bless them -- they have shown a
total lack of regard to the health and welfare of the
population, and it is time for the PUC to say: Oh,
okay. This is what we can do. We can deny your request
or better yet, you forfeit your involvement with the
telecommunication business, give us all your funds, and
we will set up a stand-alone telephone company that will
provide the needed service to the population.

And it's not just -- well, there's a bunch of
old folks here today. You know, what if we're at home
in the evening, and, you know, watching TV and all of a
sudden you're getting chest pains. How are you going to
get ahold of an ambulance? How are you going to get to
emergency, you know, if you don't have a landline
because that's the only way to guarantee that you're
going to make it.

And who'd be responsible if -- if people die
because of AT&T's actions? Who would be responsible?

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three commenters: The first one is
Kit; they did not identify their last name. The next
one is Cynthia Wallace, and the third is John Teller.

///
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER ROSSER

Hello. I usually don't speak in public. My name is Kit Rosser, R-o-s-s-e-r.

(Audience interruption.)

SPEAKER ROSSER: I'll do my best.

Thank you for holding this hearing. I made it a point to be here because there's too many people my age range that don't have the mobility to get here. There's also a lot of caregivers who will be affected by this who don't have the time to analyze what it means to -- what this means to their connection to their medical care and their support.

I've lived in the same home in Sonoma county 45 years at the intersection of two rural roads. This is also the intersection of utility lines that I see from my picture window about 40 feet away.

AT&T has been quite responsive for repair calls. Please note, that is repair calls. There's a difference between repair and maintenance. AT&T has not maintained their landline system for as much as 20 years. I've been watching out that window.

All of the AT&T marketing promotes wireless connectivity. I've never seen or heard the promotion for the landline system and its attributes. AT&T did not and does not encourage landline as an option. Their
webpage does not offer an option for a landline. You've got to go searching if you want a landline connection at this point. It's very hard.

AT&T has purposely avoided generating revenue to fund this system. AT&T has facilitated the atrophy of the landline system.

My daughter has early onset Alzheimer's. She resides in a residential care facility for the elderly 65 miles from me. I am her conservator. I have changed cell phone manufacturers, carriers, installed boosters to improve connectivity of my cell phone. I have worked with this. I believe in progress.

Only the landline guarantees the standard of service necessary to carry out the medical decisions with hospice and the facility.

I've watched the actions of the CPUC for many years now, and I'm sad to say that your decisions don't support our social contract. Clearly, corporations must and should fulfill their missions. That's fine with me, but please understand, the CPUC decisions are weakening work and web strands of our social fabric.

Please stop and take note of who we are now and where do we want to go. Many of our social institutions are in flux, and the CPUC has a very strong role in the direction we are going to go. Thank you.
ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next is Cynthia Wallace.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER WALLACE

Hi. I'm Cynthia, C-y-n-t-h-i-a, Wallace, W-a-l-l-a-c-e. I'm from Santa Rosa. Our family has a copper line in Sonoma county and one in Placer County.

Dear Commission Members reliable, certain telephone connectivity means life or death in California. Please reject AT&T California's Applications 23-03-003 and 23-03-002. What's good for AT&T is not good for California. AT&T is not ready for copper to be pulled.

You can force their 42.5 billion Broadband Equity, Access, and Deployment program, their participation in that in California, their calculations, to include every copper line's continued support until every line has the same performance or better with the BEAD implementation.

POTS copper lines are identified with a fixed address making it possible to provide fast medical assistance to 911. Unlike San Francisco's experience this morning with AT&T. AT&T is noticeably silent on whether there's a proven alternative replacement, performance cost or reliability. AT&T receives an outsized amount of public funds. They must continue to
I know the Sonic executives have traveled multiple times to DC seeking telecommunications infrastructure expansion funding. They can't get Congress's attention. AT&T has the legislature's attention effectively elbowing out smaller, vibrant, competitive fiber service providers away from government funding.

AT&T was awarded $259 million in telecom support contract from the USDA. They received FirstNet Authority investment of 6.3 billion with an additional two billion ongoing spend as it builds a wireless safety network. They then issued press releases to position themselves as safety providers. We've heard differently today.

AT&T's use of ORAN technology will radically cut its telecom costs, and those could approach 14 billion over a five-year term according to Reuters.

AT&T wants it both ways. Do not reward them further with removal of obligations that have life or death consequences. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Next up is John Teller.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER TELLER

Good afternoon, my name is John Teller; that's
T-e-l-e-r. I am going to go a little different with this.

I have been having experiences with AT&T that started last November when water apparently got into the wine, and about three days after I complained to the PUC about inability (sic) to get repair service, I got a visit from the Fort Bragg Police Department telling me that I had an open 9-1-1 line. I told the officers that my phone had been out of order for three weeks.

The next thing that happened was my phone was disconnected. No notice. No -- my phone was paid. AT&T just turned it off. Now, I have gotten it turned back on, but it was a call to the FCC that, I think, accomplished that.

No way would I support giving the -- AT&T the right to abandon copper lines. And, yeah, please don't do that.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sir, before you go away, I just want to make sure you do have your service now, though, right?

SPEAKER TELLER: I do.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. Thank you. I just -- just wanted to be certain.

Our next three are Steve Hogle, Barbara Lea and Brooke Clarke.
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HOGLE

Hi, for the record. Thank you, Commissioners.

My name is Steve Hogle, spelled H-o-g-l-e. First name is Steve.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sir, can you please speak up, I am having a hard time hearing you.

SPEAKER HOGLE: Yeah. Our landline is our lifeline. We live in rural Sonoma county, and we have had a landline for 35 years since we've lived there; and I use it every day because it's our telephone communication.

Our telephones are -- our cell phones are completely spotty, and we even had a service recently with AT&T and a -- a technician who came out to visit and help us out said he driven from Calistoga all the way over to where we are, and he said, "I didn't have more than a bar all the way over here," he said, "no wonder you guys have trouble." So, there is no reliable cell phone service.

In an emergency, which we had a very real one, in 2019, it was the Kincade Fire; and had we not had a wired copper landline POTS telephone system, we would not have been informed on the Kincade fire in enough time to evacuate, and that fire went right through our property. We had no -- we would have had no other
If there's a fire that goes down, the cell tower, they burn. The -- right now, the cell -- the copper landlines are protected, and we have a battery. If the power goes out, there's a battery that does maintain communication for enough time that we would get notifications when necessary.

So, I urge Public Utilities Commission to deny AT&T of their requests.

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next up is Barbara Lea.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER LEA

Barbara Lea. L-e-a is the last name.

Thank you for this opportunity.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Ma'am, can you please get closer to the mic?

SPEAKER LEA: Hello, can you hear me? Thank you for the opportunity to object to this regulation of landlines being unlawfully taken.

I was an employee for AT&T for 30 years. I worked for -- as an operator, I worked in the switching. I worked all offices from south San Francisco down to San Jose. We had an earthquake. We live in rock and roll county. In 1989, when cell towers went down, there
was no cell service; and as PG&E was trying to put back the lines, they commented to us, "We are grateful that you kept the lines open. It gave us an opportunity to restore service a lot quicker and a lot more certain."

So, I request that you not let AT&T off the hook with this unlawful taking of service to citizens of California.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Next up is...

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER CLARKE

Brooke Clarke.

ALJ GLEGOLA: That's right. Brooke Clarke.

SPEAKER CLARKE: B-r-o-o-k-e, C-l-a-r-k-e.

I very much -- I very much disagree with the lady from AT&T when she said copper lines are not reliable. I -- I am a retired electrical engineer, and I believe they're the most reliable kind of communications there are, period.

We heard people today say they had problems with their landlines. That's not because of the design of a landline; it's because AT&T is not maintaining the landline although they're collecting rates to do that. I think they're taking money and not providing the service they said they would provide.

I have had DSL for a couple decades or more. A few years ago, I got a WISP connection, W-I-S-P, a
little disk for ubiquity on my roof, aims to the neighbors and so on. So, I had the WISP and the DSL a few years ago, and PG&E said, "There might be a fire. Let's turn off the electricity." Well, the WISP died right away, within an hour. Guess what? The DSL left working and kept working for days, and the reason was AT&T -- I've got a photo here if you want to see it -- brought a generator out to the diesel line box and kept it going.

The landline system is designed as the central office and powers the whole system. This man that had a battery, didn't need a battery. All you need is an old phone. You don't need batteries or AC power in your house if you have a landline --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That's right.

SPEAKER CLARKE: -- the phone will ring and you can make calls, so that idea is wrong.

The cell phones are not going to work in an emergency. SB 431 never made it out of committee. There's no back-up power on cell towers. The power goes out; the cell goes out. I have a friend in Redwood City that experienced this three or four times in the last two years.

So, I highly recommend, do not allow this to happen. It's going to be a catastrophe if -- if it
Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

The next three are Melissa Hays, Michelle Vassel and Walt Decker.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HAYS

Hi, I'm Melissa Hays. M-e-l-i-s-s-a --

ALJ GLEGOLA: Ma'am, can you please use the microphone?

SPEAKER HAYS: H-a-y-s. Thank you.

I just wanted to show everybody, because I wasn't sure that people have seen this map of the 580,000 households with landlines in California; and I wasn't sure if you had seen it either, so I leave that for you.

It also now shows where our fires have been in Northern California, so you can kind of get a sense of our fire disasters and how close they are, and how they are in landline areas.

I am 70 years old, and I am single; and I live alone, and I have a landline. And I live in an area without cell phone reception, and the only way that I can call out or receive a call is through my landline.

AT&T has submitted a request to no longer be the carrier of last resort nor to help lower income with...
Lifeline. They have just found that it's not profitable although what I have found is that last year, AT&T managed to give their stockholders close to $8 billion, but they cannot find any money to manage our lines.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Wow.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Boo.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Wow.

SPEAKER HAYS: I don't support the unlawful taking of a public utility, and the carrier of last resort puts Californians at risk. It puts me at risk, and I would like to leave you with a question of how would you feel if you were faced with losing your telephone? If you couldn't call your elderly parents or your kids or call to make a doctor appointment, or if you fell, you couldn't call your local volunteer fire department to help you. It's a very scary thing, and I hope that you can see where we feel very threatened by this situation.

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Ma'am, before you go, I just want to make sure you want us to have this.

SPEAKER HAYS: I want you to have that.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. Thank you.

Next up is Melissa Hays.
SPEAKER HAYS: That was me.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Oh, I'm sorry.

Next up is Michelle Vassel. Sorry.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER VASSEL

My name is Michelle Vassel. That's V-, as in Victor, a-s-s-e-l. I am here with Vanessa Rios and Angie Garcia. We are representing the Wiyot Tribe. I'm the tribal administrator, and these are two of our council women. Our council -- the Wiyot Tribal Council sent us here today to let you know our concerns.

We are asking you to reject AT&T's request to be relieved of its carrier of last resort obligations. We are also asking that you -- that you reject AT&T's request to give up its designation as an eligible telecommunications carrier.

Our biggest concern is that the only service that we have on our reservation is -- is basic cable service. So, you know, we are a government. We have emergency operations. In emergencies, that's our only way to operate. We have a red phone that we pull out of a toolbox, plug it in -- and like the last woman was speaking about -- we can operate it with without -- without electricity; and we receive -- there's a lot of reasons why electricity goes out in our area. We live in really -- really rural area and electricity goes out
all the time, because of storms, because of earthquakes, because of rolling blackouts, because of fire concerns and wind issues so, you know, that's our only way to provide services to our tribal citizens; it's our only way to operate in a -- in an emergency.

Additionally, I wanted to -- to mention that our -- our tribal citizens will be really impacted by this, because more than 60 percent of our tribal citizens live in rural parts of our county. They do not have any other service except for the basic service.

Also, a lot of our tribal citizens, particularly elderly folks, our -- our elders and disabled folks, have the universal Lifeline. The combination of increasing costs of all of our utilities, and the fact that this would -- this would increase their cost to have a service, which is the only service available, is the reason why we want you to reject both of these applications.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. And how do you spell that Tribal Council you are representing?

SPEAKER VASSEL: The Wiyot Tribe. We are in Humboldt County.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay.

SPEAKER VASSEL: And all of our ancestral territory is in Humboldt County, and that's where the
majority of our people live.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. Thank you very much.

SPEAKER VASSEL: Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Next up. We have Walt Decker.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER DECKER

Good afternoon and thank you for this opportunity to respond to your mailing. My name is Walt Decker, D-e-c-k-e-r. I am from Fort Bragg.

I built my home in a rural subdivision southeast of the town of Fort Bragg in 1982, and I have had AT&T landline service since then.

I would like to respond to the situation that's being proposed here, and then close with some information about my current landline not -- not functioning.

I live on timbered parcel. Most of the parcels in my subdivision are timber. They're one-acre plus parcels, and the tall timber on three sides of my property and the State forest -- Jackson State Forest on the west side prevents me from getting a reasonable cell service strength.

I can very occasionally get one bar of cell service strength. It is not a -- a responsible or dependable form of communicating.

Without landline service, it -- life would be
very difficult; and in emergency situations, it would be
dangerous or life threatening. I am opposed to
eliminating the hard line itself -- or the hard-line
land service.

For the last three to four weeks, I have had
static so bad on my landline that communication --
conversations could not take place. I have, at three or
four different times, called and asked that repairs get
made, and I know that at least three different linemen
have been out to work on it. I will let you know when I
get home tonight if I have any service.

I guess that's about all I have to say. I just
echo what everyone else has said. The landline service
is very important to us. It's essential.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sir, I want to make sure that I
understood you correctly. You're having trouble right
now?

SPEAKER DECKER: Yes.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Could I just ask someone from
AT&T to assist this gentleman just to make sure that his
issues --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: They're outside on the
side.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I will walk him there.
ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay, great.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm the vice president.

I will walk him there.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. And Assistant Chief Colbert, you said you had a question?

AC ALJ COLBERT: Are there any AT&T representatives in the room currently?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No, they left.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No, they bug out.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, she's here.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Okay. So, can we have the representative from AT&T who gave the opening statement?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, she's out -- she just stepped outside.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Okay, Judge Glegola. I have a question for her when she comes back in.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. So, our next three are Mitch Timpy, Marie Heggarty and Mark Ellis.

Before folks speak, I do want to mention that we have about 100 people on the speakers list, so please try to keep your comments to two minutes or less.

Thank you.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER TIMPY

Good afternoon, my name is Mitch Timpy. That's spelled T-i-m-p-y.
I live three miles from Highway 1 where there's no cell service. There is no internet service. The last time I had anybody come up there to do any kind of work, they brought a Starlink and hooked that up, so that they could take and work on my stuff. That tells everything right there.

Without that landline, we are dead in the water. There is no excuse for the unbelievable destruction and waste of -- if there was a war, that landline is the only thing that is going to be working. That's what I got to say about it.

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. And next is Marie Heggarty.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HEGGARTY

That's Marie Heggarty, H-e-g-g-a-r-t-y.

I want to thank everybody that has come here fully prepared. As I live in a rural area, I do not have internet or cell service, and often I have to go into town to get online or to use my cell phone. I am absolutely terrified for myself, my elderly husband with medical issues and all of my neighbors that I might have to leave an emergency to drive to get a signal to make a call for help.

The other thing I would like to say is that
AT&T is not maintaining their copper landlines.

SPEAKER HEGGARTY: Every time it rains, it is static. Over a year ago, I was getting ghost phone calls or my phone would ring and I could listen to somebody else's conversation. I talked to a service representative with this, he admitted to me that they had a problem with the lines underground underneath Highway 1 and did not want to spend the money it would take to shut down the road to fix those lines. Okay.

I am on Comptche Ukiah Road, three miles from the Highway 1. They've admitted there's major problems. They've admitted they don't want to spend the money to work on them, yet they are willing to leave us with no way to call 9-1-1. No way to contact our friends and family.

And on the last note, I have an elderly mother also suffering from Alzheimer's. The one thing that she remembers to do every day is call me at 4:00 on my landline. I can't imagine losing that.

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Marc Ellis.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER ELLIS

Hello, everybody. For the record, my name is Marc Ellis. It's M-a-r-c E-l-l-i-s. I am from Reno,
Nevada. If you guys are wondering why I'm here, a gentleman asked earlier if somebody would speak from the other states where this happened. Well, it happened to us, and let me tell you exactly what AT&T would do because I go there every day. I'm a technician for AT&T. I work in rural Nevada. It's a mining area. It's called Austin, Nevada. Google it if you want.

There's 75 people there.

I have to do whatever I can to keep these lines working. They will not upgrade and will not maintain them. I ask them about it every which way, and then I have to tell these elderly customers: I'm sorry, ma'am. I can fix this maybe three more times. I can't tell how long it's going to last, but when I fix it the last time, you've got to find an alternative way to communicate.

Don't let it happen to California what happened in Nevada. It's a horrible idea. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.
AC Colbert, you had a question for AT&T?
AC ALJ COLBERT: Thank you.

We've had questions about AT&T's proposal and the proposal to do away with the copper infrastructure.

In your opening you talked about that there will be replacements and other services.
What specific types of services will there be?

Will there be fiber services? Wireless services?

Briefly, what is AT&T's specific plan if the copper infrastructure goes out of service?

MS. VRIHEAS: It's my understanding that the definition of "alternative service" would be worked out through the evidentiary proceeding based on --

(Audience interruption.)

AC ALJ COLBERT: I would appreciate, as Judge Glegola indicated, that in order for the assigned judge and the commissioners to get the information, everybody needs to be heard and everybody needs to be respected. So I would appreciate it if you could -- sorry. Go ahead.

MS. VRIHEAS: It is my understanding -- I'm not a lawyer, so I don't represent AT&T in that capacity, but my understanding is that the definition of "alternative services" would be worked out through the evidentiary proceedings, and so that is what I said in my statement.

And all of the information that we have provided to show that there is alternative services available is -- is also part of that which we've already submitted, and we'll be presenting when the evidentiary proceedings begin.
AC ALJ COLBERT: So is it accurate that the specifics are not available right now?

MS. VRIHEAS: Absolutely. And that is -- that is my -- that -- that is what I'm experiencing when I'm out meeting with communities because I'm hearing that, you know, either our wireless service is inadequate to be an alternative, but we do -- we understand that this is all going to be worked out during this proceeding, this part of the proceeding.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Thank you. Appreciate that.

ALJ GLEGOLA: I think I see an attorney from AT&T.

MR. UMANA: I'm here for AT&T. (Inaudible.)

(Audience interruption.)

ALJ GLEGOLA: I need you to speak up too.

MR. UMANA: The information your Honor seeks is available in our public filings. We have submitted --

(Audience interruption.)

AC ALJ COLBERT: Two things: The reporters can't hear you speak right now, sir. The second thing and I reiterate to the audience, who is very passionate about this, everybody needs to give the speaker time to speak. Judge Glegola will indicate if they need to speak louder.

MR. UMANA: Thank you, your Honor. Hopefully,
everyone can hear me right now.

The information you seek is available in our public filings. I don't have -- we've submitted over 100,000 pages of evidence in this proceeding. So I'm happy to take this back to my colleagues and we can get a specific citation for you.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Well, thank you. As Judge Glegola and the commissioners have indicated, we have another hearing at 6:00; so, hopefully, we can get a more specific answer by then.

MR. UMANA: We can do that. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three are Phil Hartley, John Morehouse, and Miranda Edison.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HARTLEY

I'm Phil Hartley, H-a-r-t-l-e-y. Your Honor and Commissioners, thank you for this opportunity. I'm here today representing the Konocti Fire Safe Council of Lake County. The Konocti Fire Safe Council is an incorporated 501(c)(3) organization, and we represent -- we service an area of about 17 miles, bordered on one side by Clear Lake and on the other side by Mount Konocti, which is a wildland area. We are the definition of urban-wildland interface.

The thing you need to know about this area is
it's the second largest population area in Lake County. The entire area has been officially designated by the California -- by Cal Fire as a very high hazard area. This is the highest level of hazard designation that Cal Fire has and that has been officially updated to include this entire area that's being proposed to lose our cell system.

The area is a documentable wildfire danger area historically as well, and the last eleven years my community has been evacuated three times, three times in the last 11 years, and the agency and all of us in Lake County work hard to have as fire safe a community as we can, but the backbone of that -- the whole backbone of that is Lake Alerts and Lake Alerts sends out a warning over both kinds of telephone lines.

We have no commercial television station in the county. No commercial AM or FM station in the county. Very spotty as you heard. Cell phone system, very, very spotty, and very spotty even on lines. That's the lifeline. That's how you know to evacuate, is that call comes through on the phone system. And we know, talking about the people in our area, that many of them, a great percentage of them, depend on that landline to receive that evacuation notice. No landline. No evacuation notice, and people die. Thank you.
ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Can we have our next commenter, please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER MOREHOUSE

John Morehouse, M-o-r-e-h-o-u-s-e. I have a direct quote here from the Fire Safe Council for Life Alert, quote, "Frontier is endangering the lives of community members," unquote. It doesn't get more direct than that. It doesn't. I have very bad landline service. I don't have cell phone service.

I've done a lot of things in my career. Most of you up here know me as "Long John." I'm a radio DJ. I've also worked for Cal Fire. I've been the first respond- -- first reporter for many fires. I can't do that without a telephone. I also worked for digital telephone seven years.

This is a non sequitur here. When AT&T says that there's going to be something in the alternative, but they can't say what it is yet. Wait a minute. We call that vaporware in the real word. It doesn't mean anything. They say, "Oh, we'll work on it later on."

Well, if there's no cell phone service now, how are they going to work it out?

That doesn't make sense. What AT&T is saying is disingenuous totally without reserve.

Now, I actually am a Frontier Telephone
customer, and I think we need to expand this topic to Frontier Telephone. They may not have a proceeding right now before the CPUC.

And a lot of us have problems with the CPUC because the way they rubber stamp the PG&E rates. So I need to see the PUC to have some teeth here. They really do. I cannot even call Frontier to cancel my service. I have relays in the central office that are not working. And there's spanner boxes between central office and us in the mountains. The guy -- our telephone service up there, Ray, he admitted those boxes don't work any more, and when the power goes out, they don't work at all.

I've had four heart attacks. I've had to be flown out to the trauma center in the helicopter four times. If I can't call 911, who is going to be responsible for my death? AT&T says, Well, it's not our fault.

Come on, people. I ask you to actually be a regulatory body and really pay attention to what the people are saying here. It's not just AT&T. It's Frontier also. They cover a lot of our county and Humboldt county too. So this is a bigger problem, AT&T.

So if they're going to abandon it as the COLR, but then out the other side of their mouth they're
saying, but we're not going to drop any services. That
doesn't wash. That's a non sequitur, folks. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next is Miranda Edison.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER EDISON

Miranda, M-i-r-a-n-d-a, Edison, E-d-i-s-o-n.

Today I'm thinking about an 88-year-old man who lives up
the road from me. He completely depends on his landline
to call for help. Not only does he refuse to use the
internet, it wouldn't reach him there anyway deep in the
woods.

It applies to all of us. I can't get Nextel
and can't receive a cell phone call. And if the power
goes out, I need my landline, but what keeps me up at
night is a fire. We worked hard in Elk to set up our
own landline call system: One neighbor calls neighbor
on down the line because none of us can count on our
cell phones if there's a fire. They just don't work in
wooded hills.

Do you really want death on your hands because
we couldn't warn each other, couldn't help each other?
Couldn't help that 88-year-old -- my dear friend up the
road trying to call for help.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three are Gwyneth Jones, David Drell
and Freddie Long.

(Audience interruption.)

ALJ GLEGOLA:  Are you Gwyneth Jones?

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER JONES

Okay. Gwyneth, G-w-y-n-e-t-h, Jones, J-o-n-e-s. The AT&T proposal to abandon the landline phone system in rural northern California will put an older, more isolated population at risk during emergencies.

Today, cell phone provider AT&T is experiencing a massive national outage that is affecting cell service in my home county, Lake County, California. AT&T doesn't know the cause, but they're working on it.

How appropriate that I come to this hearing today to testify for the maintenance of landlines in northern California. Today San Francisco Fire Department advises people to use landline phones to call 911 as the AT&T cell system is not working. Failing a landline phone, find a friend or relative with a functioning cell phone.

Senior citizens are advised to maintain their landlines in the event of a Public Service Power Shutoff to access emergency services. My landline has been the source for advisory and mandatory fire evacuations issued by County Office of Emergency Services for the
River Fire, 2018.

In Lake County, the cellular infrastructure is limited due to geography and tower locations. If I want to make calls, I have to go outside of my house day or night, no matter what the weather, because I only have one bar of service and I have a metal roof. That's what my cell phone provider told me. So I want to clearly speak with someone, I use my landline phone.

AT&T is a publicly traded corporation: It's only duty to its shareholders is maximize profit, not to provide a service to the people.

When watching various telecom companies advertise for their cell service, a large swath of northern California shows no 5G service. I believe this corresponds to the area AT&T proposes to abandon. There's just too few people up here for corporations to spend the money on infrastructure. Digital or wire, landline remains the only feasible service solution for access to emergency services in rural northern California. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Before you go, sir, I just wanted to ask, a woman mentioned she was giving up her time; who was that?

MS. LONG: Freddie Long.
ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. Thank you very much.

Please continue, sir.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER DRELL

My name is David Drell, D-r-e-l-l. We've had a landline service in rural Mendocino County for 50 years. It has worked most of the time and has not required a whole lot of maintenance except for, finally, last year, the wire -- the 50-year-old wire broke, and it was repaired.

We live in a narrow valley east of Willits in Mendocino County. There are hills on four sides of us: There's no internet; there's no fiber optic; there's no cell service; there's no cable service to provide us with voice service, which we need. We need voice service to have a life where we live right now.

We want AT&T to continue to provide us with voice service. We think that their request for -- to be relieved of the responsibility to be the COLR and to not be required to provide service to poor people and other people that need this service.

They've been given lots of public money, billions of dollars in public money to maintain the system and maybe they should be asked to give all that money back.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.
Our next three are David Barre, John Pourroy, and Steve Hajik.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BARRE

David Barre, B-a-r-r-e. I'm here to beat a dead horse. If you want to know the frustration of cell service in the county, when you have a copper landline, it goes out. Try to contact AT&T to come and repair it. If your landline doesn't work, you can't call them on that. Your cell phone, I ended up going up the hill, finally got them, and then get on hold and not even a person for 30 minutes or more, and continue that over two weeks until your service is finally restored.

This was as a result of the fire, so I can't blame AT&T for the line going out; however, it does routinely fail in the rains.

The last time it failed this last week, and when I was able to report it over the noise on the line, the earliest they could get a tech out was four days. That was later postponed one more day. When we finally got it repaired, he said, he was surprised I had any communications at all because the copper connectors had completely corroded.

As far as other available sources, when the copper line fails, all they have to do is ask their own techs. When they come out to make the repair -- had to
do it at my house -- they then pulled out their cell
phone to check in to see if the line worked.

And I had to tell them: Well, if you want a
signal, then you have to walk up the hill a little ways.
If that doesn't work, then drive down the canyon and
back up onto the ridge and then maybe you can get
somebody.

AT&T has to maintain what they have before they
abandon it. That's all I have to say.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Do we have our next commenter, please. The
next speaker is John Pourroy.

(No response.)

ALJ GLEGOLA: Mr. Hajik, why don't you go.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HAJIK

My name is Steve Hajik, H-a-j-i-k. I live in
Brooktrails. I oppose AT&T's proposals based on the
reasons that the Public Advocates gave. I have no cell
phone service where I'm at. I live in Butte Trails. We
had a nasty fire in 2019. I really needed that copper
wire, and it's funny. I thought I was unable to have --
it had a problem with the static on the line, but every
time it rains, the same thing happens to me. I can't
use my phone for a while, and it takes five or six days
to get someone out there, and it's hard to call someone
when your phone isn't working.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next, could we have Supervisor John Haschak.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HASCHAK

Good afternoon and thank you for being here. I am John Haschak, H-a-s-c-h-a-k, 3rd District Supervisor representing the northeast section of Mendocino County. Supervisor Dan Gjerde, 4th District Supervisor representing the 4th section of Mendocino County could not be here but concurs with these remarks.

Just this morning on national and world news, there's a story of cell service providers including AT&T having a massive service outage. People have been contacting me ever since this AT&T plan was proposed. People are afraid, and rightfully so, that they will have no coverage when AT&T walks away from landlines. This fear is shared by law enforcement and first responders. The risks are too high. I have seen cell service coverage drop in the times that we need to communicate most.

During the August Complex fire and the Redwood Complex fire, cell service went down. During the huge snowstorms that we had last winter, cell service went down. When we had the latest rains, and we had thousands of people without electricity, cell service
went down. Landlines provided many people with their sole connection to the outside world.

   Even in the best of circumstances, cell coverage in Mendocino County is sporadic and very spotty. I would like to invite you to travel the main highways and the side and back roads of our beautiful county to see what kind of cell service you have or more likely don't have.

   We all have experienced the redwood curtain where cell phones don't work on one side of the county or the other. Landlines are a safety net for almost everyone in the county. AT&T has an obligation to the health and wellbeing of our residents by maintaining reliable and effective landlines.

   Please ensure that your decision takes into account not just the bottom line of AT&T, but rather that pact with our communities to provide for essential services, and this means communication. That means maintaining landlines in our rural mountainous beautiful county. To do otherwise would put peoples' lives at risk.

   Thank you.

   ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. And Supervisor, thank you for the use of this space, too.

   SPEAKER HASCHAK: Okay.
ALJ GLEGOLA: Next three are Diane Helman, Beverly Dutra and Marvin Dutra.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HELMAN

Hello, my name is Diane Helman. I live in Forest Hill, California. D-i-a-n-e, H-e-l-m-a-n. I -- I have -- I am repeating some things of difficulties with cell phone use. We are in a very -- well, rolling and steep canyon, ridge tops, kind of terrain where frequently people have to drive away from their homes to have any cell phone reception. So, basically, there's -- just cut that short, it's obvious what that means.

So, thank you very much and maintain our landlines.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Next up is Beverly Dutra.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER B. DUTRA

Beverly Dutra, D-u-t-r-a. I live just over the hill in Philo, Anderson Valley. We are subject to wildfire, windstorms, snow stoppages, earthquake -- you name it, we experience it.

In the latest wind -- big storm, we lost nothing. We had ring, ring, ring. Our rotary phone that is probably older than most of you sitting up there
worked, and a little voice said, a daughter, "How are you? Are you okay? Do you need anything?" I can't tell you what that -- as an 86-year-old, what that meant to me. It was a voice saying, "You'll be okay," and we were. We were able to call out and get our road cleared. We can have emergency service, medical service, social business things. Those are all important to all of us for survival.

I have been pay -- I am 86, I have been paying AT&T -- first Pac Bell with executives who I don't think would have made this kind of decision -- and then AT&T for 66 years. That is a contract with that company. I paid on time, every month in full as most of the people here have.

I think they should be honor bound to go back to the drawing board and come up with a new plan that provides us with the idea that there is somebody already in place who can take over this service and is willing to do it and is able to do it and is already there in place. They should have that plan and not some -- it's out there, and it's in the paperwork, and you'll see it later. Let's see it now.

It's a matter of equity otherwise it's a form of abuse for the elderly. I don't think you want to see that.
And my last comment is I would like to have more faith in the Commission. I'd like to see that happen in our state. You are called the California Public Utilities Commission. Let's make "public," a more important word. Let's hear from you on our side.

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Next speaking is Marvin Dutra.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER M. DUTRA

My name is Marvin Dutra, D-u-t-r-a, and I like that last speaker.

The -- I think the main issue here for you and the PUC is are you going to give us an accomplished and well-funded giant to protect us, or are you going to give us someone who is barely able to handle the situation? You already know -- you've already heard plenty of our problems, but what are you going to -- who are you going to give us to take care of us? Somebody substantial like AT&T, I hope.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Our next three speakers are Christina Bertea, Sarah Aminoff and Bob Matson.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BERTEA

Christina Bertea, B-e-r-t-e-a.
Even in Oakland, my landline is my lifeline. I have a corded phone next to my bed, so I can hear emergency calls in the middle of the night when my hearing aids are out. If I suffer a heart attack or mild stroke or any other crisis, like an intruder, the phone is right there and 9-1-1 can find me. It's a safe phone. It doesn't have interference with passcodes or needing an iCloud or whatever.

So, I do not hear on cell phones, and I don't want to hold them close to my head so they're not an option for me. I don't want to be forced to be dependent upon a cell phone. I keep them off at night. I keep them far from my body. During the day, I keep them away from me. I try to handle them as little as possible, because I am very aware of the health hazards of cell phones. There's a huge body of literature about this, about biological effects of using cell phones and the radiation that they emit.

So, I just want to say that abandoning landlines -- AT&T abandoning landlines would be putting the public health and safety at risk in a different way than that has been mentioned because cell phones are not safe for us to be using biologically.

This would strand people with no safe and viable alternative and decommissioning landlines would
amount to discriminating against people who suffer with
debilitating symptoms when they are in a proximate --
proximity to wireless devices and EMFs, so we have to
really protect those people. We don't want to be
discriminating against them. They need landlines.
That's the only -- the only kind of telephone
communication that doesn't cause them undue suffering.

What else is there to say except for if AT&T
won't behave and take care of our copper lines and give
people copper line service when they want to it, then we
need to take the copper lines away from AT&T and create
a public utility that will maintain those lines and
provide proper service.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next commenter is Sarah Aminoff.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER AMINOFF

Sarah Aminoff, A-m-i-n-o-f-f, Union City,
California. I'm in the San Francisco Bay Area.

I live -- I am not in a rural area. I actually
live very close to Silicon Valley, and like some of us,
we have so many cell towers, we got overexposed. So, I
am not in a rural area like you guys but in a saturated
cell tower area, so I cannot tolerate the wireless
because I OD'd on it like a lot of people who work near
tech, so I have a landline as nec -- necessary medical
situations.

The thing about -- please reject the AT&T's
request to decommission copper landlines. A, it's
tied -- the landlines are tied to an address, making it
the most dependable emergency communication. Wireless
and VoIP -- VoIP is not a replacement. It basically --
they -- they don't work with power outages.

During the Santa Rosa fire, where people I knew
were fleeing for their lives, landlines were the only
reliable source of communication. Lives were saved
because of landlines.

I also want to just repeat a message from Alert
Gaithersburg.

There are reports of cascading cellular
service outages among major
telecommunication providers such as AT&T,
T-Mobile, Verizon. The reported outage has
also affected FirstNet. If you need to
contact 9-1-1 for emergency service, please
utilize a landline.

I can't emphasize this enough including all the
people who -- I think 30 percent have some, you know,
EMF sensitivity and landlines are required by some
doctors for autistic children in terms of -- they say
have like -- have a neutral household, so they actually require this for, you know, when -- I believe that is Dr. Klinghardt requires no EMF.

So, please do the right thing. Please protect all constituents.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next speaker is Bob Matson.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER MATSON

Good afternoon, I am Bob Matson. B-o-b, M-a-t-s-o-n.

I'm the fire chief in the Elk. Elk is a small town of about 500 people. Rural town on the Mendocino Coast.

In addition to being the fire chief, I also run the tow service, and I have an auto repair garage, and I don't want to be redundant on what all the previous speakers have said. I think you've got an earful, but I want to emphasize, I'm a -- I'm an active member of the Mendocino County Fire Chief's Association, and I think all of my fellow chiefs -- there's 20 departments in the county -- I think all my fellow chiefs will concur with me of the -- how vital the landlines are for communication in emergency situations, but I want to move onto my business.

We have been the AAA provider for the Mendocino
Coast for almost 100 years, and I want to make you aware of a personal situation that happened with my business and AT&T. About nine months ago, I was notified that AT&T -- AT&T wanted to remove the landlines to the commercial businesses in my community; and so, of course, we asked what the alternatives were. Well, they threw out fiber optic to us, but fiber optic was not available in our community; and what started to happen -- residential and commercial bills are different, and what started to happen was we started to -- we have two landlines into our business, and for years, we were about $300 a month rate, $150 a landline; and then what started to happen was our monthly bills started coming, and it went from 300 to 400 to 500 to 600 --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Jesus.

SPEAKER MATSON: -- when it got to $1,000 dollars a month --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh my God.

SPEAKER MATSON: -- I said enough is enough, and I called AT&T and was on the phone for an hour and a half and finally got through to somebody that could give me some answers --

(Audio interruption.)

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sorry.
SPEAKER MATSON: -- and I asked them what the alternative was and they said, "Well, the alternative is cell phones," and so, for $100 dollars a month, $50 a cell phone, we will provide you with smart phones, one for each of your landlines, because we wanted to keep our phone numbers that we had had for years.

So, they put me through to a salesman, and I said, "You know, AT&T cell phone coverage in our area is really sketchy," and he said, "Well, I have got a map in front of me," --

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sir --

SPEAKER MATSON: -- "and it shows" --

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sir, I am really sorry, but we have, like, 100 people on the speaking list. Can you please wrap up?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We want to hear him.

ALJ GLEGOLA: You want to hear him?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes, we do.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay.

SPEAKER MATSON: I -- I think I am probably the only one in the room that has a -- has a story to tell about the alternatives to the landlines.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No, not really.
SPEAKER MATSON: And so -- anyway. He assured me the phones would work, told me where the cell phone towers were. I said they're nowhere close to me, and he said, "No, I think they'll work," so they pulled our landlines, sent us two smart phones, and for 7 months, we put up with it; and what happened was our customers started to say, gosh, we can't get through to you. What's going on with your phones? And half the time the phones would work as they were supposed to, but the other 50 percent of the time, the call was either dropped or it went to voicemail, which meant my gal in the office had to jockey between two phones, constantly checking missed calls, and we went from there.

Now, I have to tell you that the tow service, we tow for the highway patrol, and we also tow for AAA, and it's essential that these landlines work to get ahold of us.

So, after 7 months, I got ahold of Assemblyman Wood's office, and they got a hold of you folks, the PUC, and guess what happened? The office of the president, California of AT&T, got through to us, and my landlines got reinstated; and right now, we are back to normal.

So, when the landlines got reinstated, we realized how much this impacted our business for 7
months, and I have no way of estimating revenue loss, but I am here to tell you, and listen to everybody in this room, don't let this happen because these landlines are essential to us.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you, sir.

AC ALJ COLBERT: To the point, and just for members of -- of the audience who are here. If you have an issue with your phone service, AT&T or not AT&T, the reason that we're here is that the Commission regulates phone service and you can complain directly to the Commission, file a complaint. There's various ways on our website and as Judge Glegola has asked several issues, if there are key issues, please bring them to our attention, and we will look at that.

Thank you.

Sorry, Judge Glegola.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Oh, that's okay.

I do want to mention to folks, because I know -- I know some folks were unhappy that I interrupted the last gentleman. I do want to make sure you are all aware that we do have close to 50 speakers left. We are planning to adjourn at 4:30. We may go a little bit after that, and then come back at 6:00, but we are not going to be able to go through 6:00. We -- we need to
take a break, too, so I just want to make sure --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What number are we on?

ALJ GLEGOLA: -- people know that.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What number are we on?

ALJ GLEGOLA: 38.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's going to be a long day.

ALJ GLEGOLA: So, I just -- so, I -- I hope you understand my point. It's not because I'm -- I'm trying to be rude. I'm -- I am very much against being rude.

So another way, if you want to speed things up, if you agree with a speaker that spoke before you, you could always say you just agree with them, and that's perfectly fine.

So with that, our next three are Anthony Haas, David Bebe, and Jean Arnold.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HAAS

My name is Anthony Haas, H-a-a-s, and I came up from Sonoma county. I live in Glen Ellen in Santa Rosa. People spoke so eloquently. On the general issue, I'm going to focus on two things: One is that AT&T in their presentation says very clearly, don't worry about losing your existing service because we're going to take care of you in that time and nobody will lose service, but I know through my own experience that I wouldn't trust
that for two seconds, and here's why.

About -- I depend on the landline most importantly when the power is out. My sketchy cell service doesn't work when the power is out, and my sketchy internet doesn't work when the power is out and the landline provides its own power, but during a power outage, maybe a year or little more ago, I discovered that my landline went out too.

I called PG&E. And they said, no. It's power, and we can't test it because the power is on now. I couldn't call them until the power came back on. Finally I insisted they send a tech out, and he told me, Yes, AT&T is no longer servicing the backup battery systems that they have. They've stopped doing that.

They're not telling the truth about that. They do have battery backup systems to ensure that there's power on that line when the power goes out and they're not taking care of it.

Furthermore, he said, they are submitting false or less than true information to the CPUC about coverage. They submit coverage maps without reward to the actually topography. So they can submit a map, for example, that shows an area fully covered by cell service, but it doesn't show that there's hills and valleys and canyons and trees that don't work in a
deliberate attempt to obfuscate and obscure what's going
on.

I have pursued this for a year and I've called
PG&E (sic) on a number of occasions, and I've been lied
to. I've been avoided. I've been told that they
haven't served these battery backups for 10 years. And
when I called the Press Democrat and got them
interested, they called AT&T, and I got two calls from
the Office of the President of AT&T who then said: Oh,
yes. We service them, but we don't have the equipment.
We can no longer get the battery backups. We just found
somebody to provide them. There's over 300 of them in
your area, and we will, in fact, provide these battery
backup systems again that allow the emergency service,
but they don't be up until end of 2024.

So having had a year of people in various
service things tell me they didn't do it, other people
refused my calls. One call to the newspaper and a
subsequent newspaper article, all of a sudden AT&T gives
an answer.

That means that for this year, I have no
emergency backup, and I think I would trust no word of
AT&T's that they're going to keep things going until
they have something in place. They need to have
something absolutely in place before you guys even
consider this.

And the landline is an absolutely necessity when the power goes out as it does. We've had fires. We've had the 2017 fires and other fires. My wife is in her 80s and I'm in my 80s. We've had to call an ambulance, and there's no other way when the power is out. At the present time the line isn't functioning simply because they don't bother to do it, and I understand it's outmoded --

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you, sir. Could I ask you to wrap up, please.

AC ALJ COLBERT: And also we have AT&T representatives here so you can speak to them as I indicated previously. You can also, if you're having problems with your service, you can make a complaint with the Commission.

SPEAKER HAAS: Thank you.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Next is David Bebe.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BEBE

David Bebe, B-e-b-e. I live nine miles northwest of Willits in the hills. I don't have cell service at my house nor do I want it. I've had a landline since it was a party line, six people on my line. That's 50 years ago.
So -- and people on my property that do have cell phones have to go to different places on the property, way up high somewhere, to get any kind of cell service. I don't have internet. I don't have satellite or any of that stuff.

And there's a lot of older people, like I, that came up here in the early '80s and '70s that rely on our landlines for what we do. When I'm talking to somebody on my landline who is on a cell phone, I can only pick up a third of their conversation. Cell phone coverage is the worst.

You guys in the city may have it great with towers every 200 feet, but out in the country, we, number one, don't have that many towers; and, number two, we don't want them. And so the landlines are very important to us.

So for our fire safe community, for a long time, I was the only one that had a phone, and people 10 miles out had to come use my phone. And so now they have a hard line going out there. So if they drop these lines and promise people cell service everywhere, they're not going to get everybody, and a lot people will die. Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next commenter is Jean Arnold.
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER ARNOLD

Jean, like a pair of pants, J-e-a-n, Arnold, like Benedict A-r-n-o-l-d. I've condensed my thoughts, having had some thoughts. The first thing I want to say a friend of mine worked for Mo Udall, and he asked: Why do all these senators have to say this? You know, say the same thing over and over again? And he said, Everything has been said, but not everyone has said it.

So the three things I have to say is, one, I'm requesting that you initiate an investigation into all these landlines that are not working. Sounds like it's a wide area and maybe a survey could be sent out by mail and then you could look into all the lines that aren't working.

My second thought is, I'm guessing that insurance rates for homeowners would go way up if we had no reliable service to report fires. I'm sure they would find some great excuse for dropping homeowner's insurance.

And my third thought is just don't you think all these people would have some other service if there were one available that was reliable and affordable? I'm pretty sure they would because what you're hearing is even what they have doesn't work, and the cell service is horrible.
On my way here, somebody in a big, old cattle truck came over the line on 128 and almost hit me and I kept driving. I maneuvered. And I got to Philo. Philo has one bar. I couldn't reach the CHP. They got a dropped call, and so I went to Boonville and I was able to reach someone from there, but that's just indicative of what we have here. And this was an emergency today, where I was trying to get here to do this. People have driven from Oakland, from Elk, from all these places --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Five hours.

SPEAKER ARNOLD: What?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Five hours away.

SPEAKER ARNOLD: Five hours away. For me a total of two hours 45 minutes. So I just feel people need to -- I hope to god you guys are getting it. I think we've been really clear. Thank you.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Thank you. And just to note, there is a service quality proceeding for service and Commissioner Houck is the assigned commissioner, so that is being looked into. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: And I am the assigned judge.

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: And Commissioner Reynolds is my Bagley Keene partner.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Inaudible.)

AC ALJ COLBERT: Let's not have shouting from
the audience, please. Again, there's a service quality proceeding. I think Commissioner Houck was about to speak. Judge Glegola is the assigned judge and Commissioner Reynolds -- Commissioner John Reynolds is Commissioner Houck's partner in that.

So, Commissioner Houck, were you going to say something?

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: I was just going to say that that proceeding number is R.22-03-016, and so if you want to provide any comments, you can provide public comments similar to this proceeding in that proceeding.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can you repeat the number?

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: R.22-03-016.

ALJ GLEGOLA: And we have -- I don't know how many we have received at this point. We'll just say it's a lot. There's a lot of interest.

So our next three commenters are Ron Galletti and Sue Crawford.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER GALLETTI

Ron Galletti, G-a-l-l-e-t-t-i. I don't want to sit here and repeat a lot of the things that everyone said because I have those same thoughts, but please, please hear what the people have said today.

I'm a retired AT&T Lucent Technologies middle
manager employee for 38 years, and things have changed a lot, but the bottom line: Cell phones do not work in this area or most of northern California. So please do not allow AT&T to do what they want. Thank you for your time.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next is Chief Kim Zagaris.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER ZAGARIS

Kim Zagaris, K-i-m Z-a-g-a-r-i-s. I live in Auburn. I'm a retired state fire chief for the Governor's Office of Emergency Services, a position I held for 18 years of my 35 years with them and my 45 in fire service.

Like most of you, I've watched our communications evolve. And when I say that, I think about from landlines to cellular to VoIP. You know, we've gone from pay phones to landlines to push button, and even the wireless-handheld phone. It's been an evolution.

I've worked with AT&T both as a citizen, who had it in their house, and as somebody who always picked up the phone called on hard lines on major emergencies and other emergencies within the state, and I still work that through the wireless side of the house.

I've had a pretty good relationship with them.
Not always on the -- like anybody else, there's been some bumps and bruises along the way, but we've always worked them out. They continue to find 911 support for next generation. They are providing FirstNet service to public safety.

No other carrier in this country put in for that bid, and we continue to work with them on that side. And FirstNet was approved by Congress in the public file 112.96. Western Fire Chief actually supports fiber and wireless service across California, across the western United States.

We believe it's all going to be in policy when we're finished, but most of all, I think everybody in the room is looking for how we transition for everybody, for our citizens, for public safety.

We're looking for reliability, resilience, and that's going to depend on -- you know, just like we had for many years. At the end of the day, Western Fire Chief expects that we do work together and work to get better connectability (sic). So thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next speaker is Sue Crawford.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER CRAWFORD

Hello. Sue Crawford, C-r-a-w-f-o-r-d. I just want to paint a quick picture of what happened in the
last storm session. I live in deep redwoods and I'm too far back from the phone line. I can't get cable. I have too many trees to get satellite. I've investigated all possibilities for internet and it's not possible where I am. I have a trusty landline. It's nothing fancy. It's the old-fashioned kind.

And during the last series of storms, my neighbors, who are close to the road, are able to get cable internet. So they changed their landline and all their cell phones now work on VoIP, or Voice over Internet Protocol, and they thought were very safe.

Well, during the storms there were various electrical outages. When the electricity finally came back on after six days, their internet would no longer work; therefore, none of their telephones would work.

I had neighbors from the entire neighborhood coming to use my phone because I was the only one that had a landline left. So, finally, it turned out they called Comcast, and Comcast said it would take them five days to get there because we were so rural.

And for about 15 days they had no means of communication other than using my landline. So electrical things can fail and they do, and internet is sketchy. And, please, maintain the landlines. They are a lifeline for whole neighborhoods.
ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three speakers are Carrie Chittaro, Lawrence Ames and Dana Ames.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER CHITTARO

Good afternoon. I am Carrie Chittaro recently living in San Francisco and about seven years ago moved to Boonville. I personally would love to see the newer technology come into play. I feel what's happening in Comptche in the last -- I don't know -- three or four months, five months of -- what's happening is an upgrade to where we need to be.

That said, I would say what I've heard in this room that no technology is perfect for every situation. I've been in earthquakes in San Francisco where my landline does not work. My cell phone has worked in situations where other landlines have gone out.

So it's -- it's a hodgepodge of what's happening and I can understand the emotions attached to it when we're in rural areas. Technology is getting better. I would ask of you a couple of things: One, I think, you're holding AT&T accountable for something that as competitors came to this marketplace, we, as consumers, should have more choice for this and we don't, and that's why we are where we are today.

And, secondly, I would expect that as cell
sites and things come into play, a lot people don't want
them up. This is why services aren't doing well and
it's like this mixed bag of how do you want me to fight
for what, when, and where?

So, for me, I love the availability of fiber
coming in, additional services, most of -- everything
I've ever got in an emergency are texts or through apps
that I've signed up for have really helped me understand
what I need to get out of the way or hunker down, and I
had no issue communicating with others.

There's definitely two sides to a story, and
that is mine to you. And I would ultimately like you to
open up the competition totally in California or take on
you guys owning the copper, which it doesn't even seem
like you want to invest in. And I get it.

So bring in the others to compete with them,
and if they don't want to be here doing what they're
doing at least give us choice, so thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next is Lawrence Ames and then Dana Ames.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER AMES

Hi. I'm Dana D-a-n-a, Ames A-m-e-s. My
husband is Lawrence. He had to leave for another
appointment and apologizes he couldn't take his turn.
He wanted to make two points: He has worked both as a
park ranger in BLM and in private capacity search and rescue. He has been an EMT and he has worked in wildland fires as a wildland firefighter.

And all 911 calls on landlines automatically generate an address for dispatch and first responders in which he has been one for many years. 911 from cell phones are routed to the central call center with no way to pinpoint the caller's location.

And the second point, the proposals appear to be AT&T next volley in the on-going attempt to abandon copper landlines entirely.

Now my comments: I grew up in Fort Bragg in the '60s and '70s. My parents were involved in the operation of ambulance service here before it was taken over by the district hospital. So that let's you know how old I am. I have some knowledge of how important telephone service has been for providing emergency aid, especially for people in the most rural areas.

Pacific Telephone was the only provider, and it was an actual lifeline for people here. Who knew that at the other end of that thin copper wire was the help they required. Most people don't realize that a cell phone is a radio with a tiny computer attached.

Radio frequency transmission can be affected by any number of environmental factors and can be easily
compromised. It is therefore unreliable for accessing emergency services. In view of the public safety factor with regard to clear, timely, and accurate and dependable communication, until such time reliable fiber optic service is available to every portion of rural areas, I will never voluntarily give up my copper landline. A landline is by definition not wireless, and only AT&T has the copper wire infrastructure to my knowledge.

I don't believe any other phone company has it; therefore, they should be required by law to provide basic telephone service to anyone who wants it and to provide maintenance of the supporting copper wire infrastructure as a matter of public safety and public service. This, rather than the bottom line, the almighty dollar, needs to be AT&T's business model. I remember a time when it used to be.

A company with more than 17-and-a-quarter billion in gross product in 2023 can certainly afford to do this both financially and as a matter of goodwill toward and service to the citizens of this county and this country.

Please reject these applications by AT&T.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.
So, we will tell folks, we have hit the 4:30 mark. We are going to hear from five more speakers, and then -- but I will say everyone who is on the list will be the first on the list when we start up again at 6:00.

So, the next five are Robert Stephens, Joan Dixon-Smith, Alix Levine, Anna Marie Weibel and Hugh Brady.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER STEPHENS

Thank you. My name is Robert Stephens, S-t-e-p-h-e-n-s. I serve on the Board and was the recent president of the Bennett Valley Community Association.

Bennett Valley Community Association represents the 1,200 landowners in Bennett Valley in unincorporated Santa Rosa in Sonoma County. We are in our 55th year as a community nonprofit. We don't support this application, because we have several areas where there are currently no other options.

We are asking the CPUC to ensure rural broadband funding options and education especially on, like, replacement options. I read the -- I glanced through the 150 pages of the two documents that were attached for today. I even fed it into ChatGPT, and I said, "Are there other options?" And ChatGPT also informed me that it could find no detail regarding other
options. I don't -- and, personally, I don't have any other options where I live in Bennett Valley. AT&T is the only provider.

Now, copper and DSL is not my preferred resort. Starlink is actually not an option. I've tried it. I bought the dish, and I can't get the right signal. Comcast isn't an option, and it's less than a mile from my house. It's just teasing me.

AT&T back-owned fiber is 300 yards from my house. A neighbor somehow got them to open it up for him, but they pay $4,000 a month. I -- plus they take the copper. I just ask you to use this moment to enforce them to provide details on other options.

Lastly, I talked to a bunch of local small business wireless internet providers, and they don't have any real information on federal broadband funding. There's a lot of businesses who would like to offer the alternatives, so I would like to see you help educate with more data on your public site regarding the -- the options that are available.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Our next commenter is Joan Dixon-Smith.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I have a question, sir. I'm sorry.
Is it possible I can speak? I am on the very end of your list, and we came five hours. This is my second trip hoping to get to speak, and I just want two minutes of your time.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sure. Can you state your name and spell it, please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER GOUVEIA

My name is Kelly Gouveia. I am here for Mark Gouveia, and we are nobody. We are nobody fancy, but I am hoping I can bring God in this room.

You guys have heard everything, everything; and your Honor, you're going to make a decision you're going to recommend to the esteemed commissioners. I live in the Bay Area in an unincorporated, annexed out area of Mountain House. A multi-million dollar community, and I run a small non-profit rescue for animals. My landline is everything, like it is to all of us here.

What is really amazing is the incredible power that Government has. Government has ultimate in the end, and it's growing and it's growing, it's become a bigger machine. Judge, your power -- and commissioners, your power, you're here for all of us. All of us in this entire state. You're not here for AT&T. They're nothing.

AT&T used to be a small company with MCI,
Verizon, Pac Bell, Ma Bell, and they went to you guys; and they asked for the right, the right to be able to merge and become the largest conglomerate; and in doing so, it margined out every bit of pricing. They took full control and they said, "We want to be the provider," and now 15 years later from then, nobody else exists, and now they say, "We don't want to be it," and then they say, "We are going to provide alternatives." Yeah, they will. They're going to be high-priced bundled alternatives to seniors who don't have the option.

You think about all the hundreds of people that have showed up. Think about all of those up in Susanville, all of those up in Nevada County. Think of all of them even in Oakland. Little old ladies who don't have -- parts of -- of the valley down in -- San Bernardino, all over, Indio -- all of these people who don't even know how to use a cell phone, who like their old fashioned ways, who have closed captioning on their phones, who the -- beautiful Public Utilities Commission, thank God we have it, really truly.

I had a problem, 15, 20 years ago that I had to come to you, in-person on Van Ness Street, and they solved it; and it was an unbelievable problem that nobody in this room would ever even fathom. I had a law
enforcement officer hacking my cell and shutting it
down. It's unbelievable what has happened.

I am probably asking you the greatest thing
that you can do here is tell AT&T no. You don't owe
them anything, but they make you think they do with
their paperwork that says antiquated copper, antiquated
this. It's not antiquated. I've got copper utensils
that are hundreds of years old. It'll stand the test of
time, and considering my bill has gone from 40 to 100 in
less than two years, they're getting paid very well to
maintain it, but they're utilizing their fancy words,
their marketing and everything else to manipulate you
guys; and the greatest power that you have is the
ability to say no.

And if you don't want to do that because
they're kind of enticing you with all this and all that,
and let's come up with something a little more modern.
There is nothing better than high tech. There's nothing
out there, and we are going to have to replace tons of
5G because the network span for that is two to three
miles versus the 4G that we've got now. People aren't
happy with it.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Thank you.

SPEAKER GOUVEIA: Okay. So, I just -- I ask
you to say no. Revisit it, go back and tell them come
back in three or four more years when you do have
something in place.

Do you really want the headache of what they're
going to present to you over the next five years?

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

SPEAKER GOUVEIA: Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: So, there's Joan Dixon-Smith, and
then Alix Levine and then Anne Marie Weibel.

Is anybody...

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER WEIBEL
Anne Marie Weibel. A-n-n-e, M-a-r-i-e, Weibel,
W-e-i-b-e-l.

I live in Albion. I live alone. I'm retired.
I had a stroke. I have (indecipherable). I use a CPAP
machine, and I'm sensitive to electromagnetic fields.

You've heard all about the earthquakes, the
fires, the -- the tsunami prone areas on the coast. I
live in Albion. We have eight old bridges between
Navarro River and Fort Bragg, and it is a lifeline. We
need it.

I have had it for 40 years, and I am asking you
not to approve the last resort proposal nor the
electrical telecommunications carrier. I am also on
Lifeline, and in your own papers, AT&T says that it has
to be affordable for anyone. Well, we have heard a lot
of comments from AT&T about all the things they are
going to do for us, and as you heard from the locals
here, most of the other ideas don't work.

There was some research being done that eight
of the companies that would be available maybe in this
area, none of them are going to work if you can't deal
with cell phone energy. Some of them might work with
Wi-Fi. You can't force us.

It's a health issue, and it's an equity issue.
People around here don't have much money. They might
not have a car to go and get help, or they just can't
afford all this fancy other stuff that AT&T might ask us
to, you know, get or use. I can't receive cell phone
service at my home and, you know, I am told I could get
some company to come to do Wi-Fi that charge $400 to
climb in a tree. If there's a power -- if there's a
storm, then somebody has to climb up a tree again, and I
will pay another $400. That is not even covering the
service.

So, please reject the proposal.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Commissioner Reynolds, do you have any
comments?
COMMISSIONER JOHN REYNOLDS: I do want to thank everyone again for coming to join us. We will return at 6:00. We have staff who have traveled here as well who need to have a chance to take a break, and we will return at 6:00 to hear your comments. I look forward to hearing from everyone else. We will see you then.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: And if you've already been here, just -- you're -- you're next on the list. You're first.

Commissioner Houck, do you have comments?

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: I just want to thank everyone for showing up today and your patience, and we will see you at 6:00.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What number are you on?

ALJ GLEGOLA: We are on number 51.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Please let me --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: You have to let me stop first.

This concludes the 2:00 p.m. public participation hearing for A.23-03-002 and A.23-03-004.

We are adjourned and off the record.

///
(At the hour of 4:42 P.M., this matter having
been continued to 6:00 p.m., February 22,
2024, the Commission then adjourned.) ]

* * * * *
ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE GLEGOLA: We will be on the record. The Commission will come to order.

Today is February 22nd, 2024. It is the time and place for the second of the two public participation hearings.

On two different proceedings, which I told you off the record the first one is Application 23-03-002. That's the application of AT&T California to withdraw its Eligible Telecommunications Carrier Designation.

And the second proceeding is Application 23-03-003. This is the application of AT&T California to withdraw as a Carrier of Last Resort from much of its service territory.

Today's public participation hearings are being held at the Mendocino County Board of Supervisor's chambers. I very much want to thank Mendocino County and the City of Ukiah for allowing us to use this room today. I also want to make sure that any members of the public that wish to comment, they know that they may comment on both proceedings when it's their time to speak.

I also want to make sure that everyone in attendance understands that the purpose of today's hearing is to hear from you about these applications.
No action will be taken today. The commissioners and I will discuss the procedural schedule a bit later.

My name is Thomas J. Glegola. I am the assigned administrative law judge for this proceeding. Also on the dais are the Honorable John Reynolds, who is the assigned commissioner, the Honorable Darcie Houck, another commissioner at the Public Utilities Commission, and the Honorable W. Anthony Colbert who is an assistant chief administrative law judge at the California Public Utilities Commission.

Commissioner Reynolds, do you wish to make any remarks?

COMMISSIONER REYNOLDS: I'll be brief this evening because I made more extended remarks for our earlier session. I recognize there's a lot of folks who are with us this evening who were also with us during the afternoon session and didn't get to make their comment. I'm looking forward to hearing from the folks who were there further about these applications.

And I just want to mention briefly that we really appreciate your time. Many of you have traveled to be here with us to make comment. Out of courtesy to everyone here, we will appreciate it if you will focus on keeping your comments to two minutes. If you have more extended comments that you would like to make, we
do have written comments available on the Docket Card for both of these proceedings online where you can make more extended comments.

We will also be hosting a virtual public participation hearing on March 19th for those of you who may have friends or neighbors or family members who couldn't be here today, but who would like to share their views, there will be an opportunity for them to dial in and provide comment in that forum as well.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Commissioner Houck, do you have any remarks?

COMMISSIONER HOUCK: Just very briefly because I want to make sure we're able to hear from everyone. I just want to thank all of you for coming here today. It's very important that we're hearing directly from you and would just second the comments of Commissioner Reynolds regarding if you have extensive comments and want to provide those in writing, that can be done on the docket card or you can contact our Public Advisor's Office, and there's a table up front.

We do read the comments. We do really appreciate all of your time. And we understand that this is an important issue for you to be here this evening. So I look forward to hearing from those of you
who are on the comment list, and thank you for being
here, and our staff, and Judge Glegola, and Commissioner
Reynolds for his leadership on this.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Assistant Chief Colbert, do you have any
remarks?

AC ALJ COLBERT: No.

ALJ GLEGOLA: So at the 2:00 p.m. public
participation hearing, the commissioners gave a pretty
extensive, high-level overview and I'd just refer you to
those since many of you have already heard that. If
you'd like more details on the applications, there's a
fact sheet available on the table in back, and you can
also go to the following website which is
www.cpuc.ca.gov//pph.

Additionally, AT&T should have mailed you a
notice of this Carrier of Last Resort application. And,
finally, you'll be hearing two presentations today: One
from AT&T, and one from Cal Advocates.

So with that I would like to ask that the
representative from AT&T come up and provide AT&T's
presentation. And, please, keep it to five minutes.

MS. VRIHEAS: Good evening. My name is Tedi
Vriheas and I'm the vice president of external affairs
for AT&T California. Thank you for being here and for
giving me this opportunity to speak with you this
evening about a very important topic for AT&T.

This is our Carrier of Last Resort
application -- or COLR, as it's been shortened to --
before the PUC. My goal today is to clear up any
confusion the recent notices you have received in the
mail may have generated around this proceeding and to
alleviate any concerns you have about losing your phone
service.

I want to assure you that no one will be left
without service. All of our customers will have access
to voice service and especially to 911.

In addition, we will continue to provide
service to areas where we are the only provider,
including in rural areas.

We will work to upgrade antiquated copper phone
technologies either from us or another provider. We
will invest in our modern, high-speed networks to keep
our customers, our first responders and communities in
California connected.

The CPUC designated Pacific Bell, now AT&T, the
Carrier of Last Resort, or COLR, 25 years ago, and with
this designation, it means that we have an obligation to
provide basic service to anybody in our service
territory who wants it.
At the time AT&T was the only provider. This was back in 1997. We didn't have cell phones. They were just in their infancy. We really didn't have DSL, barely dial-up. And at this time, we were the only provider installing phone services within our service territory.

So it made sense to have a COLR back then, but today, there are dozens of companies providing voice service in California and the competition is here and it's robust.

Consumers are voting with their feet leaving behind AT&T basic service overwhelmingly for more advanced technology and for better fiber wireless services.

We've seen about a 90 percent decline in our landline service over copper during those 27 years. Because customers are choosing to receive services over alternative advanced technologies, the service has come to the end of its lifecycle. Copper networks are not giving our customers the services that they need in order to run their life. We learned this during the pandemic.

We are -- customers are demanding more advanced services, better technology, which is why we're asking the PUC to remove the obligation on AT&T to continue to
provide this antiquated phone service.

What we are asking for, COLR, is not new. We're the COLR in 20 other states throughout the country. Every single state has provided COLR relief to AT&T. California is the last state.

No customers have lost voice service as a result of this relief. We've left no one without service, and we -- this will be the case in California, but this is not an overnight transition.

This is going to take a long time to transition. We are in the very early stages of a multi-year process managed by the CPUC.

Your input, together with input from other parties to this proceeding, will be taken into account as the CPUC works towards their decision.

AT&T's commitment to our customers, to the state of California and to bridging the digital divide is unwavering.

Copper-based landline phone service no longer serves the needs of the majority of our community, our constituents, our first responders, our students, our travel communities, anybody seeking to connect to the internet.

Our request to the CPUC will help us achieve California's goals. California is dedicating over
$8 billion to build out high-speed broadband in the state of California. They're not investing in copper.

The broadband market in California is changing every day. And copper is simply not the technology of today or tomorrow. I've spent a lot of time over the last four months out in the community speaking with people and I understand the concern.

That copper phone is possibly their only available lifeline to 911, to their loved ones, to the community. Through the course of this proceeding, the CPUC will determine whether voice alternatives to this basic service are available to customers.

If they determine there is no alternative, AT&T will remain the COLR for that area until an alternative becomes available.

I also heard things like: AT&T is leaving their customers behind, and rates will go up 200 percent, and copper is the safest, most reliable network. None of these statements were true. And I would like to leave you with this: AT&T is in the business of connecting people.

We want to bring our customers with us as we transition from old copper to new advanced services that are more reliable, that offer more services, and that are much faster to repair.
We value our customers and we greatly appreciate their loyalty.

We will leave no customer without service in this transition.

We are simply asking the PUC to work with us in a prudent, measured, thoughtful and transparent way to ensure that our customers in California have access to the most advanced reliable technology.

Thank you for your time today.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you very much.

I do have one question for AT&T, and I think it's the question Assistant Chief Colbert asked at the 2:00 PPH, and the question was: What are the alternatives? And I think he asked that there be a response at the 6:00 PPH.

MS. VRIHEAS: Sure. So -- our -- the alternatives that we have identified are all in our proceeding. They have been -- they are down to the census level. So they very granular, and I think --

ALJ GLEGOLA: You're not going to identify a company?

MS. VRIHEAS: I'm sorry?

ALJ GLEGOLA: You're not going to identify a company?

MS. VRIHEAS: So there are many other
providers. So do you want me -- I mean, I'm happy to say, "Comcast, Verizon, T-Mo."

I'm sorry. I don't understand the question, but maybe Andy can help me.

MR. UMANA: I'm Andy Umana, U-m-a-n-a, Counsel for AT&T.

I think the question that is being asked is, what are those alternatives?

And what Ms. Vriheas was getting to is our application includes alternatives at the census block level for our service territories, and a part of that includes facilities-based hard lines and wireless providers the likes of Comcast, Verizon, T-Mobile.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Does that satisfy you for now?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We cannot hear you.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Remember that the audience -- please do not shout, vocalize, unless you're a speaker.

The question for AT&T -- and it's going to be brief so we can hear from the members of the public who have come out this evening -- is: So are the plans different providers or in the presentation we just heard, that AT&T is going to deploy high-speed networks? So is this AT&T providing high-speed networks? And are those high-speed networks wireless based or fiber-optic based?
And is the alternative that you're talking about at the granular level -- I think you said -- are those going to be other providers or AT&T or a combination?

MR. UMANA: Thank you, your Honor, for that clarification.

It will be a combination of AT&T.

As your Honor is aware, AT&T Mobility provides wireless service in AT&T California service territory, and then also there are the likes of T-Mobile, Comcast, and other facilities-based providers that are within our service territory that would be also -- that would be part of the list of alternative providers in those areas.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. Thank you.

Could we hear from Cal Advocates.

MR. PRATT: Thank you, Judge Glegola. I'm going to join AT&T in facing the audience with no disrespect to the commissioners and AC Colbert and Judge Glegola. It's a pleasure to be here this evening. My name is Peter Pratt. I'm with Communications and Water Policy supervisor of the Office of Public Advocates. We are a quasi-independent unit of the California Public Utilities Commission.

I'm pleased to speak briefly on behalf of the
advocates about our role in this proceeding, and what we
have put on the record in this proceeding, and how we
react to what AT&T has put on the record.

Slide Number 2, please. The Public Advocates
Office. As I say, we are an independent customer
advocacy group within the CPUC. We advocate on behalf
of utility ratepayers and are charged by state statute
to do so.

Slide Number 3, please. Some background. What
is this proceeding about? AT&T is asking the Commission
to change the rules, to remove the safety net that
guarantees access to affordable, quality telephone
service in California throughout their service
territory.

Over 29 million customers, California
residents, in AT&T's service territory and over seven
million of those residents, customers, here in greater
northern California. That number of seven million --
I'm sorry. The 29 million includes over 500,000, closer
to 580,000 Plain Old Telephone Service customers, the
majority of whom also live here in greater northern
California.

Slide Number 4, please. What is a Carrier of
Last Resort? The commissioners and Judge Glegola have
talked about this rather extensively. It is a notion
that goes back to the Telecommunications Act in 1996, and it is still with us today for one reason. The former monopoly provider, AT&T, was required by the Commission to serve all customers in its designated service area. That is a fundamental concept of California's universal service standards and a fundamental concept of universal telecommunications that service across our country enforced by the FCC and written by the United States Congress.

The Carrier of Last Resort means that there's at least one telephone company in your area that is legally required to serve anyone in its service territory that requests it. Importantly, nothing in AT&T's COLR obligation prevents the company today and going forward from upgrading its networks to technology such as fiber-optics systems.

And thank you Assistant Chief Colbert for asking that question.

AT&T wants to withdraw as the COLR in areas where it claims there are alternative providers. And, again, we thank members of dais here for drilling down into that issue. Yes, AT&T has identified providers across their service territory, down to census block or track level; however, not one of those providers has come forward and put their hand up, and said, We will
take on the legal obligation to serve all housing units, all business residents, any person or business in that service territory that requests service.

Slide Number 5, please. If CPUC grants AT&T's request, it means that AT&T could decide not to provide service to you as soon as six months after the application is granted. That six-month threshold is imposed by a separate proceeding of the FCC.

AT&T has not committed to maintain the California Lifeline Service and/or Deaf and Disabled Telecom Program, disabled folks, low income folks who are relying on those state programs for basic voice telephone service. There is no clear migration plan for customers which may result in disruption or termination of service.

Again, what any company might say here verbally tonight is not legally enforceable by the Honorable Commissioners sitting behind us. Nor should it be because it isn't really a rulemaking of the Commission.

What should the Commission look at in our opinion? Cal Advocates has asked the Commission to dismiss to AT&T's application because it is noncompliant with the rules that guarantee the presence of a COLR.

You can see from the slide that we have other points that we suggest to you.
 Recommending to the Honorable Commission that they investigate this proceeding, but that is really number one. We have to remain within the guardrails of the rules of California.

Lastly, Slide 7. What can you do about it? We've heard from elected officials that represent this legislative and congressional district. Your voice is being heard. They're expressing their opinion to the Honorable Commission, and communities across California are doing that. That's part of the way that this information can get properly to the Commissioners for them to evaluate it and for them to understand the importance of it.

Learn about this proceeding. We have a one-page handout at the Public Advisor's table outside, and on Slide 7, you'll see our lead analyst at the Public Advocates assigned to this proceeding Josh Cooper. Please send him an email. We are responsive to your questions and going-forward strategies.

So thank you very much on behalf of the Office of the Public Advocates of the Commission. Thank you.]

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Thank you.

Now, we are going to turn to the public comment portion of our meeting. Your comments will help us gather information to determine whether to grant, reject
or modify these applications. In addition to considering the comments that you might make today; I also want to point you to the fact that we do have a docket card. It's been mentioned to you before, and we have received, last time I looked, over 1400 comments on AT&T's COLR application and over 450 on its ETC application.

If you would like to provide comments today, one, we are going to ask you to keep it to two minutes and -- because we do have a lot of people here, I am just -- in respect of people that are here, I am going to -- at two minutes and thirty seconds, I am definitely going to ask you to end your comments at that point.

I apologize for that ahead of time, but there are a lot of people, including people that didn't get to speak at the 2:00 meeting that are still here, and I want to make sure that we get to them.

Finally, I want to mention if you have a customer specific question, there are AT&T folks outside.

And finally, some ground rules. Biggest one is please don't interrupt folks. You want your voice heard. Everyone should respect that, and you should -- you should also let them speak, too even if they disagree with you.
When you do come to speak, there we go -- when you do come to speak, please remember that we have transcribing today's hearing, so we need to speak slowly, you need speak into your mic, and if you can spell your name before you speak, we very much appreciate that.

With that, if we could start with Sheriff Matthew Kendall.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER KENDALL

Good evening, honorable members of this board. I appreciate the ability to speak this evening, and I apologize, I'm really, really tired. I had a long day. I was up early, so if I stumble over my feet just a little bit, my apologies. My last name is spelled K-e-n-d-a-l-l.

Mendocino County is unlike a lot of other counties in the State of California; however, we are very similar to many in these rural areas. Myself and the other sheriffs in Northern California have been discussing this topic since we first heard of it a few weeks ago. I can tell you that I spent my entire adult life working for the sheriff's office here in Mendocino County. From the time I could legally walk in the door and purchase a beer, I have worked here. So, I've spent -- I know I look pretty young, but it's been about
three and a half decades now.

Mendocino County is not ready for this. Our
representative from AT&T said that cell phones were in
their infancy in the 1990s. Well, in Mendocino, cell
phone coverage is in its infancy here. I have gone from
one end of the county to the other, from Gualala to
Piercy, you know, I have over 100 miles on 101 and very
few places where my cell phone works.

Our office of emergency services or emergency
service coordinator is Miss -- or excuse me -- the
coordinator is Ms. Darcie Antle, our CEO, I'm the -- I'm
her deputy, and I deal with response in the county. One
of the main things that we look at, and we talk about
every year at the end of fire season and before winter
really hits us hard, we sit down and we go over
everything that we can do better; and the one thing that
always comes up every single time is our connectivity,
our messaging, how will we get the word out because in
Mendocino County, we have very few -- very few EMS
public safety personnel. Almost all of our firemen are
volunteers. We have got to be able to stay in touch
with these folks.

I grew up on an Indian Reservation. All right.

When you get out to these out -- out of the way corners,
we don't have the ability to have cell service that is
reliable.

I live just a short amount of distance from Ukiah, between Ukiah and Boonville, I have no cell service in my home; and when the tower goes out, we still have an old rotary phone on the wall. The kids don't know how to dial it, but I do.

These are the things that we are still stuck with here in Mendocino County, and I can tell you that I am one of those people who is not good with technology. Every time my cell phone updates, I have to call my daughter, and she -- it's like someone went in my shop and moved all my tools around, and she can help me work -- she can help me work it out.

But I know that we have a -- we have an aging population in Mendocino County, a lot of people who are not good with technology. I got my father a cell phone years ago, when he was living alone, and he loved to be out in the forest. He thought that it didn't work because he couldn't get a dial done out of it, and I had to spend a little bit of time helping with it, but these are things that I suffer with, and these are the things that he suffered with; and when we got to put out a reverse 9-1-1, you don't have to sign up for a reverse 9-1-1 when you have a copper line. It goes out to everybody that I need to it to go out to.
A lot of folks, they have the cell phones and they sign up for Everbridge and these various things, but I've noticed that a lot of people move and don't change the way that they have signed up, and they're getting notifications for where they used to live because they're just not up with the times; and sometimes that is a tall, tall order to ask these people to be able to keep up with this. Unless they've got family members who are going to help them do it, it's -- it's going to be a tall order.

Right now, this is a gamble, and I'm telling you, I am not going to slide my chips forward thinking I am going to win on this one. Someone is going to -- someone is going lose their life over this.

During the 2017 fires, the cell service went down in Redwood Valley. The only thing that worked were the copper lines. In Mendocino County, what works for us reliably every single time has been copper lines and local radio stations, and how do we get ahold of them? We go to firehouses, and we call them, and we tell them what's going on, and they help us get that information out; and that's because we still had those copper lines there in 2017.

I just don't think we're ready for it. If I was a betting man, I would not slide my chips forward on
the hand that is being dealt to us right now.

So, I would beg you folks, please, let's not to this right now. We are not ready for it right now.

There may be places in the state that are, but it's not here.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Amen.

SPEAKER KENDALL: Anyway, thank you for your time. I really appreciate it.

ALJ GLEGOLA: If you were with us at the 2:00 PPH, you know, I was asking people to line up and -- in groups of three just to try to help be a little more efficient.

I am going to start with where I left off.

First one is Karen Schortemeyer. The next one is Christina Sansi, and the next one is Jim Gagnon.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I am none of those people, but I was unaware there was a signup list.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Oh, there is one --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's right -- it's right outside.

SPEAKER GAGNON: I was third in line.

ALJ GLEGOLA: You may be the first one, sir.

It may just be you.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER GAGNON

Good evening, my name is Jim Gagnon. It's
G-a-g-n-o-n. I represent Comptche Broadband Committee.

Taking together AT&T's proposals A.23-03-002 and -003, would relieve AT&T of its objections as a carrier of last resort. There are many misconceptions about what this means. It does not mean that AT&T will end people's copper landline service.

In the last decade, 20 states have ended COLR and not a single landline has been disconnected. What it does mean is that AT&T no longer has to bear the cost of installation of new phone service. Expensive new installs would have to be paid for by the customer. This will impact Mendocino County. As many new installs are difficult and expensive.

As many of our residents are poor, an expensive install means that some will go without a landline. As much of our county has no cell phone service, this means these people have no way to contact emergency services eventually causing needless injury or death.

If the CPUC self-service maps were 100 percent accurate, one could propose keeping COLR in places without cellular, but while greatly improved in the last few years, the CPUC maps are not accurate enough to be risking lives over.

If AT&T had waited until the satellite to cell phone service were in place providing true 100 percent
coverage, then COLR could be safely removed but neither of these are true thus the Comptche Broadband Committee feels that AT&T's proposal should be denied.

With all that said, I have a lot of sympathy for AT&T. There are only 800,000 POTS customers left in the state of California, which would roughly mean $100 million in revenue. AT&T says it costs them a billion dollars a year to maintain the copper network in California. This is an unviable situation and, you know, I don't know how it's going to resolve.

Finally, I would like to thank the Commission. We brought our advice letter in front of you about a year and a half ago, you looked favorably on it and just this last week, we had our fiber service turned on in Comptche. We are proud to be the first community in Mendocino County that is fully fiber-to-the-home, and once again, thank you very much. Good evening.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three are Sotocreek Store, Jan Godoski and Mark Spinler.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Before the next speakers, I would request that members of the audience please silence your phones.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: So, one more time, Sotocreek
Store, Jan Godoski and Mark Spinler.

(No response.)

ALJ GLEGOLA: No one? If you're one of those, sir, please come up and identify yourself.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER GODOSKI

I am Jan Godoski, J-a-n, G-o-d-o-s-k-i, and I was here earlier today; and I think this hearing needs more S bombs. If the sheriff is in the house, that was S as in -- as in Sam; and what comes to mind is Superstorm Sandy 2012. 15 people were lined up in my brother's driveway to make calls on his copper line. There were -- there was no power. You couldn't -- they couldn't pump gas. People with generators and gas supplies ran out and that place was a mess.

So, another word is seismic. We may not have a Superstorm Sandy, but we have atmospheric rivers and something like that.

Another S word is satellite and communication satellite. Vladimir Putin just put a bunch of them up there and what are they going to do, they're going to shoot them down, and that doesn't sound too good.

I hope you look at age discrimination and economic discrimination, because this sure sounds like it. Looking at the average age of a person of 70, it's -- it's definitely weighted.
So, reject, withdraw and dismiss and thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

The next three are Rebecca Spinler, Lou Morgan and Valerie McKiver.

(No response.)

ALJ GLEGOLA: I am not seeing any of them. I will -- I will keep moving.

Next three are Anne DeFelice, Shawn Heape and Sylvia Manna.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER DeFELICE

Good evening. I'm Anne DeFelice. A-n-n-e, D-e-F-e-l-i-c-e.

I am here from Butte County. Cohasset is the community I live in. It's up above Chico. And you've heard all the sad stories about not having cell phone service. I am -- I am -- I am one of them.

I have a cell phone. It's my computer. If I want to send an email, I go to Chico to do it, so I don't have Wi-Fi either.

I do have a cell phone because I have a property in Klamath on the coast where Verizon works there; and so, that's why I have a Verizon phone. It does not work at my place in Cohasset. But I just wanted to share a couple of examples when I was working for the city of Chico. Some big storms come through.
It was an Easter Sunday; dispatch is making callouts because multiple trees had come down in the town. I'm at the bottom of the list. I've got a landline phone. They got ahold of me, and the guy that I met, he had a landline phone. We were the only two in the city of Chico for 9 hours removing downed trees from the streets, so that the emergency services could get through the streets of Chico. Landline phones, both of us.

Later, I became a wastewater treatment plant operator. I was either a trainee or maybe a grade one operator. I got a -- a call from an auto dialer, went all the way down to the bottom of the list, calls me on my landline phone, which is a dialer phone when I am not having power. I had to drive out there to the plant, under power lines that had broken off the top of the -- the top of the power line broke off. I had to drive under the lines to get to the gate to close the gate that was sending not complete treated fluid out to the river.

I need my landline phone. Thank you for listening. I appreciate you guys being here and hearing all of us.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Next is Shawn Heape.
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HEAPE

How are you guys doing? I want to say thank you. Thank you again. I was with you guys in Clovis, and here I am again. My name is Shawn Heape. I am the union representative of Communication Workers local 9400, and I want to recognize my guys here in the front row. All these guys -- can you please stand up? These are the guys that fix your lines. These are the guys that go out every day and night to fix those lines.

And we have another guy over here. We are the ones that fix those lines for these people. We understand your concerns. We do it day and night. I hurt my own leg doing this. That's why I am limping. Day in and day out.

I was here recently with President Picker, you heard me tell you this in Clovis, in this same very room; and you know what we were doing then? Fighting a different beast. It was AB 3295. What's the difference between those two? Let me tell you, nothing. It's just a different number. Still getting out of the rural areas and the big cities. That bill, with your help, didn't pass. Thank you. Thank you for that.

We are asking you again, listen to your customers, listen to the people out there in the field, they know what it takes to get the lines up and running.
It's not our fault. We work very hard. Our engineers draw up the jobs, our managers send us out, we perform night and day for these people. It is us that don't have cell service while we are out there doing this. We can take you anywhere around here, we don't have cell service. Satellites won't work everywhere either.

That's also part of this bill. There is no satellite service in this area. You have to clear a lot of trees.

To some of these people, they can't clear all those trees. That's a lot of money to climb up those trees and get people to climb up those trees is dangerous work.

Our network needs help. It needs to have pure copper put in again, not string lines. Okay. We can do that. You guys can help us do that for these people that don't want cell service. They don't want alarm clocks. It hurts them. It hurts them. I can't even imagine. I sleep next to my phone. I can't even imagine that. Can you guys? Because I can't.

I know how technology works. I represent the wireless workers. I represent the Direct TV workers. CWA has a real goal to provide all services equal to all its customers that we serve.

With that said, I am going to give the floor to the rest of these people.
Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

The next three are Sylvia Manner, William Rogers, and Bryan Comiskey.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER COMISKEY

Hi. Thanks for -- thanks for having me. Bryan, B-r-y-a-n, Comiskey, C-o-m-i-s-k-e-y, like the ballpark. Okay. I am a cable-splicing maintenance technician for AT&T. I'm one of those guys that comes out when you say, My phone doesn't work.

The one thing I haven't heard mentioned all day long is that there are so many other services that are provided on this copper network that we're talking about. Anybody who has U-verse internet that's not fiber to your house is on the copper network. The same one that provides you your dial tone.

There are also reporting circuits for fire, for water districts for flooding, like along the Russian river. Those circuits are in our copper network and have been forever. We fix those too.

Based on what I heard, AT&T, the company, said that they wouldn't -- it wouldn't affect anybody who has no other alternative, but for people who do have an alternative, they can walk away from the copper network. That means that all of those things would be left to...
rot, flood, corrode, and all those things would go away,
your U-verse internet, your reporting circuits to fire,
water, and all those other things would go away, and I
don't think that that's too good of an idea.

And the other thing is that I think the
pandemic expedited the realization that we want to do so
much more in our homes besides talk on the phone. We
want to -- we want to live at home. We want to work at
home. We want to learn at home. We want to entertain
at home. I had two kids in college at the time, and at
that time to do online learning with next to nothing, as
far as an internet circuit, which is provided on the
copper network that we're talking about was a big deal.

So we talk about this all the time because we
know that the future is that to be able to do all those
things, but nothing I've heard from us today says that
that's where we're headed. We're just saying we want to
walk away from something.

And what we're saying is, we need to get the
new stuff there, and then you can talk about walking
away from the other.

So, anyway, thank you for your time.

ALJ GLEGOLA: The next three on the list are
Shannon McManus, Cheri Carlstedt, Dina Polkinghorne.
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER McMANUS

Good evening. Shannon, S-h-a-n-n-o-n, McManus M-c-M-a-n-u-s. I'm also an AT&T employee for 25 years; 16 years has been cable maintenance, maintaining and trying to keep this copper network operating. Like Bryan said before me, the company has talked about abandoning the copper and switching over to more modern technology.

The question's been asked twice. It was asked here earlier today and it was asked again this evening, and they beat-footed (sic) around the answer, and that question is: What is that?

I can tell you what that is: It is nothing. There is nothing else except what's already available, and we already know how reliable those services are.

The other question is, we have about 90 percent in Sonoma county of our customers are relying on internet service and it's in copper. I have most -- all of my repairs that I do for U-verse internet -- and that's even Sonic customers -- are copper repairs. We have very little overlay of fiber optic.

After the fires in -- let's see -- when the Tubbs Fire came through, it was all -- we put some of the burned copper back up, and were told: Go fix it. Do what you can do. Very little fiber optics was put
up. Very very little. This was 2024, and we talk about modern technology, but we're still pushing everything we can through this copper.

The only answer is to me is you're going to have to redo the copper. You're going to have to put some more money into it. It's going to have to be there. It's going to be there forever. It's going to be there for a long time.

We have customers that are still saying that they have their dial tones. It's going to be no different. It's the same thing. It's -- it's -- to get rid of it, to abandon it, is going to be abandoning 90 percent of your customers in Sonoma county alone.

My belief is that we're looking at abandoning northern California. Maybe keep Sacramento, but the rest of it, the company is just going to write it off. So those are all the people that are going to lose service. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER POLKINGHORNE

Can you hear me okay? Good. I'm Dina, D-i-n-a, Polkinghorne, P-o-l-k-i-n-g-h-o-r-n-e. I'm a recent-retired executive director for Project Sanctuary, the domestic violence and rape crisis center serving Mendocino county. I also currently serve on the Board
of Directors, as an officer, for the California Partnership to End Domestic Violence. We're a statewide coalition of domestic violence providers for the whole state, and probably the largest coalition in the country.

So I'm here to speak on behalf of isolated rural survivors of domestic violence and sexual assault and the small rural agencies who serve them. Victims of domestic violence or sexual assault crisis need access to 911 100 percent of the time. Not most of the time, but 100 percent of the time. And right now they can only be guaranteed through a landline.

In addition, to isolated rural survivors of abuse, the small, rural safety-net agencies in each county, who serve these victims, also need 100 percent connection as a lifeline to this vulnerable population.

In northern California, several of these agencies operate in areas with extremely spotty internet service. And in order to provide 24x7 response, which they are mandated by law to do, they rely on teams of certified hotline counselors, who themselves live in areas with intermittent internet -- excuse me -- that's prone to frequent power outages.

So, you see, there's an entire infrastructure of emergency response that relies on landlines in rural
California.

I also serve as an intern general manager -- excuse me -- for our county's public radio station, KZYX. There are no TV stations that serve our county, making our station one of the primary emergency broadcasters in the region.

We have county emergency staff on speed dial -- you heard the sheriff talk about it earlier -- so that we can broadcast critical information for folks during these crises. Until VoIP can guarantee 100 percent connection, we must maintain a landline to ensure these communications.

I think you learned today that in rural California at this point in time neither VoIP or cell phones provide guaranteed connection to 911 like a good old-fashioned landline.

I'm sure we'll get there someday. I hope we do. I think we will. But until we do, I urge you to reject this application. From where I sit, it is not hyperbolic to say rejection of this application will absolutely save lives. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

The next group of three are Madaline Kline, Vernan McNamee and Becky Tunen. I'm not seeing any, so I will go to Deborah Moss, Rob Buch, and Mike Lloyd.
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BUCH

Hi. My name is Rob Buch, B-u-c-h, and first of all, I want to welcome you guys to the community, and thank you for coming here. We really appreciate you being here. I was also a little surprised and wanted to make a shout-out to our local AT&T technicians because they really bust their buns out there. So some credit really needs to be given to them.

There's a couple things that I noticed that I haven't heard from people in this discussion, which is that we are really looking to see if landline service is going to go away.

It sounds like what AT&T is saying is that it's not going to right away. Unfortunately, this sort of leads us down the path realizing that maybe that is where they want to take it.

I think what we've heard from our community here, from other communities in the state and the public at large is that they would like to keep landline services. I think there's a distinction as well to be made between landline services and internet services because they are not the same.

A telephone conversation on a landline is a telephone conversation on a landline. You know, if you have a fiber connection, that's great. You have
internet, but if the power goes out for three days, how
are you going to make a phone call?

I think that needs to be underscored here
extremely.

So, you know, with that -- you know, I think,
like I said, the last thing I'd like to say is that the
public has kind of spoken about this issue.

People want landlines to make phone calls, and
I think that, you know, that is what people are asking
for. So thank you again for coming and listening to
what we have to say here.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.
The next three are Mike Lloyd, Frank Wetton,
and Liz Helenchild. I don't see any of those.

Next is Cosmo Omsoc, Margaret Jean Hooker, and
Joseph Duvivier. I botched that last name.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER HOOKER

Hello. My name is Margaret Jean Hooker,
H-o-o-k-e-r.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Ma'am, would you mind speaking up
a little bit, please.

SPEAKER HOOKER: Hello. My name is Margaret
Jean Hooker H-o-o-k-e-r. A number of years ago, AT&T
sent out a letter saying -- giving us a great rate. I
don't remember what it was. I don't remember how many
years ago it was. It was like $30 a month. Great.

I'll take that. I called them up. They sent me to a
phone person, a young woman named Flora. She made the
appointment. They came.

And they started taking out my landline. I
said: Wait. That wasn't in the letter. That wasn't --
obody told me this. I said: You can't take away my
landline.

Since that time, I have not been able to call
out from my phone in town, and I have been paying my
full bill because I knew there would come a day when I
could speak and I want the person from AT&T to back up
the years, figure out when that happened, pay me the
difference, and I want my phone back.

I can receive calls; I can't call anybody. I
have left letters in my bill. I have sent letters out.
I put letters -- AT&T has a great big building downtown.
I've put letters there. Never a response.

Finally, about -- I don't know -- less than a
month and a half ago, I put a note under an AT&T truck
parked out front under the windshield, and a young guy
came to my house.

And he was very earnest. He wanted to help me.
And he said, Your wire's working. I don't understand.
I said, Neither do I, but I need help. He couldn't help
me. The next week or so, I put a letter under -- a note
under the windshield of another AT&T truck. A young man
came out. He was earnest. He really wanted to help me,
and I appreciated it.

But he went to a supervisor and the supervisor
gave him a number. The number was referred to somebody
in Texas. Then I've got a note asking me to relinquish
everything about AT&T that's supposed to serve me. I
didn't sign it. I have the letter in my pocket.

You all know that the fires in Redwood Valley
killed people from PG&E. And I really appreciate you
being here and hearing us.

The landlines are the only thing that work.
Children died. My kids went to the school before those
children died, but they died from fires, and only things
that worked were landlines. A lot of people had cell
phones and they burned up.

There was nothing left for the community to do,
and I really appreciate you being here to listen, and I
really hope you listen. Look at all these old fogies in
here. We're old fogies. It's a little hard to deal
with new technology, but I know young kids out in the
woods, not necessarily growing pot. They want to be
farmers. They want to farm food and sell it to the
co-op at the farmer's market. They don't have cell
phones either. So it's not just old people. It's young people too.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you, ma'am.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER DUVIVIER

My name is Joseph Duvivier, D-u-v-i-v-i-e-r, and I am yet another who was in an area where the cell phones don't work. When PG&E says they fix the line, and they're going to send me a text, well, that doesn't work either.

I'm not against, you know, switching to a more advanced technology. I'm still waiting on my flying car, but let's keep what's in place that works. Keep it the way we're doing it. I don't see why Carrier of Last Resort should be lifted when that's the way you can get a phone now that actually works. That's all I have to say.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three are Larry Jones, Kate Marianchild, and Kelly Gouveia. I may have mispronounced it.

I'm not seeing any. So we'll go to Bettie Badal and Robert Reed. Still not seeing anyone. We'll go to Sheila Tracy, Marvin Kramer, and Mark Gouveia.

Again, I apologize if I'm mispronouncing names.

So that concludes the list of folks who signed
up -- let me finish -- who signed up at 2:00. So now
those of you who signed up at 6:00, I'm going to start
with that.

The next three names are James Lotter, Kristi
Mercado, and Gerry Gonzalez.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER LOTTER

Hello. My name is James Lotter, L-o-t-t-e-r.

I've been fighting with AT&T over related issues in this
situation for over 20 years. I have had a -- well, the
joke is: You can tell when winter comes to the south
coast because the static on your phone line gets so bad
that you can't understand the people on the other end of
the line.

I have talked to techs about it. They tell me
that the -- when they open up the big tubular boxes on
the cables that it looks like somebody stuffed them with
cotton balls they are so full of fungus.

They also tell me that if they had fiber optic
installed in lieu of copper, that we'd never see them
because fiber optic is so reliable.

Now, wireless is not practical on the south
Mendocino coast despite the fact that I had a person
from the Office of the President of AT&T tell me that
the future is wireless. And I said, No.

Why? Because there are so many nooks and
crannies and places where you don't get line sight to any potential cell tower that unless they build ten or 15 towers in our area on the south Mendocino coast, you're going to have areas where you don't have coverage. And as other folks have said, that can be a matter of life and death.

My hats are off to the techs that come out every year and salvage my phone lines. This last couple of months ago, I had all three of my business phone lines go down.

Why? Initially a tech error, and then when they tried to fix it, they said, The cable is trash. We can't fix it. We're going to have to go to a different cable.

The end result, I was down with my business, which is a resort on the coast for several weeks and that cost me thousands of dollars in business since the phone is the way I get my reservations.

So I urge the PUC to mandate reliable fiber optic for the coast because the cables and salt water don't mix, and ditch this application for getting rid of the COLR designation for AT&T. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you, sir.
Can we have the next commenter, please?

///
Hello. My name is Gerry Gonzalez, G-e-r-r-y; last of Gonzalez, G-o-n-z-a-l-e-z.

I am the former police chief for the City of Willits. I was a police officer for 30 years. I am currently the vice mayor for the City of Willits. I retired in 2016. Right after I retired were the fires, and -- the 2017 fires, and the only way we were able to communicate in town and formulate -- we were planning our evacuations plans was using the copper wire system.

I know, as the last speaker just said, the technology is here, but it's not here on the North Coast. I don't want to repeat what the Sheriff said, but in an emergency, I want to be able to -- be able to evacuate our citizens. I was a former resident of the Brooktrails subdivision in this area. Again, it was kind of one of those areas that before I moved to the City of Willits that if there had been a fire, it would have been like an Oakland Hills fire there, and they did get evacuated this past -- the last fire that we had.

So, again, I urge the Commission, thank you for coming here and listening to our people. And again, I am here in my personal capacity. We didn't vote on anything, so I just want to make that clear, but I urge you to tread cautiously and make sure that we have
something. The North Coast, the Mendocino County area is totally not prepared. I know that I may have alternatives. I'm an AT&T customer both wireless and -- in fact, I even have the DSL and the landline, but mostly I keep the landline because in case I need to communicate, it is my communication source of last resort. And even in my own house, I don't necessarily have the best cell service in different parts of my house.

So, again, I don't think we are quite ready and, again, please tread lightly for the people. Again, it's going to cost somebody their life.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Our next commenter, please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER MERCADO

Good evening, I'm Kristi Mercado, M-e-r-c-a-d-o. I'm with FirstNet here in the state of California, and I recognize all the voices here in the room and I appreciate that, but I am here to talk about public safety and my personal experience out in the field. I specialize in every (indecipherable) there is from boots on the ground, and I have been involved here in the community on several different incidents both with the public and then also public safety.
So, what I have seen personally is technology evolve over the years, and it's critical as we use old technologies, moving to new technologies, to actually provide better situational awareness not only for public safety but for the public themselves. I also have elderly people I work with and are in my family, but if they could dial 9-1-1, that system underneath next gen 911, provides critical information to help save their lives.

So, as we evolve here, I just want to also mention my biggest concern is evolving technology. What I mean by that, and we have seen it firsthand over the years, everyone in this room has, parts become obsolete. You can't physically get parts anymore after a certain timeframe to fix things that are in place today. So, that's my biggest concern that I have is I want to make sure we work collectively together as a team to become, you know, where we need to be in the future, right, with the technologies evolving.

So, I want to thank everybody here. I want to say also that, you know, for public safety and also for the public, new technologies will actually help save lives, so please take that into consideration.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. The next group of
three is Annie Barbour, Jan McGourty and Juan Moreno.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BARBOUR

Good evening. My name is Annie Barbour, last name is B-a-r-b-o-u-r; and I am here in a little different topic.

So, I am a 2017 Tubbs fire survivor from Coffey Park, and I was a member of the board of Coffey Strong. I now work for United Policyholders, which is a very small nonprofit which helps people navigate their insurance after disaster. One of the things we also do is a preparedness piece. In all of these fires, I sit on their long-term recovery groups. The majority of these fires are rural areas. They do not get alerts.

It is imperative that when looking at this big picture that we recognize that AT&T is saying that they're going to go through the process. It's going to take time. What are we going to put into place to save lives? Our greatest resource at this time is an app called Watch Duty. It's very near and dear to my heart. It will tell you when a fire starts. It will tell you the resources that are being pulled in. It will tell you the rate of speed of the -- of the fire. It will tell you when they stop calling for resources, when they send resources away, and when they have a hose around it.
Those are the kind of things that we need to make sure people in this these communities, these rural communities have. Had they had that in Maui -- Maui lost their internet and they lost their power, those people were hunkered in their homes because there was hurricane force winds. They were not looking for a fire. There was no alerts. We have -- it's -- it's very classic. Every time there's a major fire, there's issues with alerts always.

Had they had those alerts coming in, they would have known that there was fires happening around them long before they lost internet or power, and they would have been on the lookout as opposed to hunkered in their home; and I know this because I have worked in Maui extensively since their fires.

So, I implore you to look at the big picture. In Coffey Park, we lost five of our people. We had 19 percent of alerts that actually went through. 19 percent in a community that is suburb. That is sad. We are now up to a -- to a high of 60 percent, so we need resources that are progressive to get the word out. I am not saying you don't need landlines; I am simply saying we need to progress in all of this.

Thank you for your time, and I am sorry I went over.
ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you very much.

Next speaker, please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER McGOURTY

Good evening, my name is Jan McGourty. Thank you all for coming. I understand this is like one of the first times that the Commission has appeared here, so thank you.

What I wanted to say is that power, water and communications are important for the wellbeing of any community but they're also important for civilization in general.

Our power supplier, PG&E has already been allowed to greatly increase its rates, which has created economic hardships for people in this community; and communication in many rural areas like ours are dependent on landlines, as you've heard, because our geography prohibits cell service, so landlines are not only really important, but it's imperative that they work.

So, I actually had to let go of my landline because every time a storm came, it was static, and then there was nothing and, fortunately, I have a cell tower right across the river from my house but most people aren't that lucky. It's especially important for our tribal people who often can't afford cellular service,
which also isn't available to them because of the geographics (sic).

Rural communities shouldn't be ignored. This is where headwaters of our rivers are, which are water sources for the state and where much of agriculture is produced. We need to remember the concept of the service. Serving all humanity with basic service.

Now, new technology is fantastic, but it shouldn't be prioritized over providing basic service for everyone nor should it be prioritized for focusing on just monetary gain.

So, please don't abandon Mendocino County by allowing AT&T to withdraw as a carrier of last resort, because many lives are dependent upon it.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Our next speaker is Juan Moreno.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER MORENO

Good evening. First name, Juan, J-u-a-n; last name, Moreno, M-o-r-e-n-o, and I just want to say thank you for having me up here, the community up here in Mendocino and Ukiah. You know, I live in a small town as well. I live in Dixon, California.

I am here representing -- I am with AT&T. I'm on a local fiber team, right? So, my primary job
function is local community engagement. Bottom line of that is I assist in transitioning copper-based customers over to our fiber infrastructure, right, upgrades.

I have been with the company now for over a decade. Customer experience is everything to me, as I came from local retail store now in doing what I do now, so it's important to me, but it's also important to us, AT&T and, you know, I have been with a company for a decade, so trust me when I -- that is in my heart.

My belief is that this is how customers, in general, across all companies are retained, great customer experience and customer service, right, and although we are at this juncture with the COLR application and future alternative uncertainty in a rural area is that moving -- is that moving forward in this direction will allow us to build on our reliable fiber network and so forth, right?

That being said, you know, on a daily basis -- on a daily basis, I interact with customers in a wide variety of age -- age range that transition from copper to fiber, and I am going to say that customers are beyond excited about fiber so, you know, that is what I focus on. In most instances, they save some money on their monthly bill but, with that change, they are the
most excited about is the new and improved internet
connectivity, which some of you touched on the pandemic
and so forth and having reliable internet, having
students learn from home; and so, that is what fiber
does for you, right? Also, the crystal clear talking
over the voice over internet protocol home phone.

When asked what they enjoy about their -- the
service the most, those are some of the statements that
I hear the most is their faster, reliable internet
connection compared to their antiquated copper services;
and like some of the examples that I have heard is
staticky copper lines. You don't get with that fiber.

So, thank you for having me. Hopefully that
sheds some light, you know, I have been -- I have seen a
lot, and I know it's a little scary sometimes to think
about change, but I deal with residents that see change
every single day. So, that's it.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you, sir. Just one
clarification, you were speaking on behalf of yourself
and not AT&T, correct?

SPEAKER MORENO: I work for the company, yeah.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. I just wanted to --

SPEAKER MORENO: Sure, sure, sure.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Because AT&T is a party.

SPEAKER MORENO: Sure.
ALJ GLEGOLA: So, our next -- oh.

AC ALJ COLBERT: Is the AT&T representative still here? Thank you.

We just heard the last speaker talking about fiber and copper. Just wanted a clarification. I think you answered it, but I just wanted to make sure that it's -- that I was clear.

Right now, the proposed replacement is not one-to-one copper for fiber, is it?

MS. VRIHEAS: That is correct, it is not.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

So, our next three are Mo Mulheren, Renee Warsaw and Wilma Pribyl.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER MULHEREN

Good evening, members of the Commission. My name is Maureen Mulheren. I'm the 2nd District Supervisor for the County of Mendocino, the Chair of Board of Supervisors and a Ukiah resident. The Mendocino County Board of Supervisors has an agenda item on for Tuesday for a formal letter to your agency, I am here this evening to speak as a citizen.

I have not had a landline in over 15 years. My mother is elderly and very low income. She is a California landline recipient. There are four siblings, and each day before she gets in the shower, she calls
one of us to let us know that if she doesn't call us back in 30 minutes that we need to go check on her.

It is critical that we create a path for our -- our elderly, our poor, our folks that have lack of access to new technology; that we have a -- a safety measure for them, and that we have a very clear path forward. Maybe wireless is the future and, as I said, I haven't personally had a landline, but in Mendocino County, we have a long way to go before we get there.

So, I thank you very much for your time today. I appreciate all of our residents that have come out to speak with you and share their stories all the way from Humboldt County, and I think that you have a lot of consider as you deliberate and try to come up with a plan that will make sense for rural communities that have lack of access like ours and also, bring California up into new technologies as well.

So, thank you very much for your time this evening.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Can we have the next commenter, please?

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER PRIBYL

My name -- my name is Wilma Pribyl, W-i-l-m-a, P-r-i-b-y-l, and I would like to speak about the landline availabilities.
During the fires, we lost our cell -- we lost our power, because I believe we only had one power line into the area, so we lost our power. After three days, we also lost our cell phones because the towers do not -- only had between one and three days backup, so we had no cell phones. So, the only phone that worked was my landline.

So, only the people that had landlines could get ahold of 9-1-1 or the police or whatever they needed to get ahold of emergency-wise. So, we need to be able to protect that facility. We need to keep our landlines.

I called other companies to see if we could get a different kind of line into the house. There is no companies in this area that provides phone service to the house. They provide cell phones, but they do not provide phones to the house, and I was wondering how many of the 180 million AT&T cell phone customers that lost their power today, lost their service today, had landlines so they could go to 9-1-1.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Can we please have the next speaker?

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER WARSAW

My name is Renee Warsaw, W-a-r-s-a-w. When I
turned off my cell phone, I had one bar in the building, and we are in downtown Ukiah. When I went to Willits recently, I had no service to be able to call down to Ukiah, and I was in downtown Willits. So, cell phone service is not necessarily a good alternative, and I don't know if you drove down State Street when you came here or just even crossed Bush on Low Gap, all of the road that is disrupted is due to infrastructure updates that is just happening right now as they upgrade from -- I don't know if it was the '70s or not.

Let me start with my ending and that's -- and circle back. End of AT&T obligation of landline service in California should not be granted by the PUC at this time, maybe in future, but not right now. We are not ready.

Too many existing customers, rural, poor families, families with kids, elderly, small businesses, work at home, rely on the landline. Yes, a good number of people have dropped landlines but many, many, many, do not, cannot and -- and/or have personal and safety reasons for needing a landline.

During the pandemic, we moved to -- from the Bay Area to my husband's grandparents' house that was built in the '70s. We live on 20 acres, and we are 10
minutes from here. We have -- we have not been able to
get DSL to work very well out there. The only way we
were able to get internet is when Starlink finally
became available, and we are able to afford it because
we are former AT&T employees who have a good retire
pension, because here in California, AT&T was very well
financed from -- I worked for them from 1983 to 2020,
and I -- I retired as a project manager, and I retired
service as -- in my last seven years on my job.
   I knew it took a long time for it to go, but I
also know we doubled prices. We did everything we could
to get customers off the service, but we had an
alternative to migrate them to. We don't in this
instance, at this time, in this area.

   Two weeks ago, we had 17 hours in which we had
a power outage. The only thing that worked in our home
was our AT&T landline. Our elderly -- my in-laws live
across the road from us, and we were able to check in
with them. The lights went out at 7:00 p.m., did not
come on until the next day. My mother-in-law, who is 81
years old and asked me to come here tonight to urge you
to keep the landlines in place, needs her landline to be
able to communicate with us, with anybody.

   The wildfires. We have been evacuated twice.
The only way that we were notified -- we were notified
in advance to prepare to evacuate, and then we got a
call, get out; and that has happened twice. We only
have one way in and one way out.

I --

ALJ GLEGOLA: I'm sorry, ma'am. We still have
several people.

SPEAKER WARSAW: Okay. Okay.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Can you please wrap up?

SPEAKER WARSAW: Yes. All I know is that the
wildfires made us leave. The cell phones did not work.
The county has a grid number to -- to alert people, and
it makes no sense, but we knew and we got a call to get
out.

Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thank you, lady.

ALJ GLEGOLA: The next three are Ted Williams,
Lillian Bearden and Lorri Kurzfeld.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER WILLIAMS

Hi. I'm Ted Williams, W-i-l-l-i-a-m-s. I'm a
county supervisor for District 5. I sit on the left
side there. When I drive over, it's a 90-minute drive
from my home. I usually leave early. I have four cell
phones in my car and two chain saws. It's a rural
county. I know when I'm coming here and I have
checkerboard schedule, I have to leave well in advance,
hours early, because there's a few spots I can pull off
the road and I can get cell service to conduct the
meeting.

I've also been a firefighter for 17 years.
Joining the board got me out of being fire chief because
it was a conflict.

I can't tell you how many times I've been
trying to write an incident report on a cell phone or a
tablet at a scene, and there's no cell service. I have
multiple carriers. I always touch the hood of the car
when I get there. When it's cold, that's a bad time.
Somebody's been waiting for a long time. Lack of cell
coverage has been an issue.

But, now, if you apply that to homes -- I mean,
I used to think the structure fire was the big call.
For an 85-year-old woman, the big call is a ground level
fall. It's terrifying. And that landline in a lot of
cases is the only way she has to call for 911 for help.

If you take that landline away or if you don't
allow it to be installed in new houses, you will have
the sheriff called for a welfare check instead of fire
and EMS calls.

SB 156 is historic funding that should provide
broadband for all. I was posting that everywhere:
California Equity. And we're a poor, rural county that
can't afford to do a lot of the mapping and the
analysis. So I called it a three-quarter billion dollar
project for a long time.

Finally, we got the estimate down to the house
level, 770 million, and as you know, we're receiving
about 56 million. And I know B funding will help, but
the point is we're not even 10 percent of the way there.

I don't expect private industry to come in and
pick up. Okay. This is a county that didn't have
anti-cherry-picking laws in the franchise agreement with
cable. So when we talk about alternatives, other
providers, yes, Comcast is here. Adelphi installed that
service. They came through communities and picked up
the most profitable customers, skipping over the rest of
the community.

Unfortunately, the maps that you're going by,
the maps that AT&T is using are census level. We hear
those are granular. The census block is not granular in
this county.

You can have a couple customers along Highway 1
and it will show the whole block. And then the address
system adds to that. I'm not going to get into it.
But, you know, zero starts at the courthouse. Zero
north-south starts at the Navarro river. This is not
Portland, Oregon. It's a county that has windy roads.
North, south, east, west don't make a lot of sense.

Addressing hasn't been perfect. As a result, when you enter some of those addresses, it will show broadband service miles and miles -- maybe 15 miles -- away from where there's actually coverage.

We know these maps are bad. The CPUC knows that we've had inaccurate maps for a long, long time.

It still hasn't been rectified.

I see you have the public -- I'm a public servant. Like, your job is to take care of these people. You're causing stress for the people with the process. It's not a bad idea to upgrade technology, but to sit here and talk about alternative coverage, there is no alternative.

Last, I'll volunteer to take the Commissioners out. I'll take you to where I grew up. I didn't have a telephone as a kid. Finally, telephones came, and we're talking about ripping it back out.

Let me take you out there, and ask you: You're having a medical emergency; you don't have a landline; what are you going to do?

I'll give you all my cell phones. These people will give you their cell phones. Show me how you're going to call for help.

This is the pattern throughout this county. I
can take you to a whole lot of communities that the map
shows are fully covered that are on the letters that
have gone out. And there may be a few people who have
cell coverage. They're on a mountain top, and it works,
but most people won't be able to call for help.

I really appreciate you being here in our
county. This is really what it's all about. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Next speaker, please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BEARDEN

Hello. My name is Lillian Bearden, L-i-l-l-i-a-n B-e-a-r-d-e-n. I would like to make my
intention as clear as possible to you as to why I'm
standing here. I do not have a landline. I have no one
that I know that relies on a landline. I'm a
25-year-old girl who has my cell phone in my pocket at
all times, and I have very good cell phone service
luckily.

I work in here in Mendocino County. I'm still
here because I'm the clerk. I have to close when you're
done. However, I had a landline for 20 out of 25 years
of my life. I stopped having a landline once my
grandmother passed away and I moved to Ukiah. I
understand the importance of the landline, and I
understand the importance of what these people are
saying to you.
I hope that when you look at the statistics and you look at the information that has been provided to you in this application, that you -- a billion -- over 100,000 billion dollar company -- 100 -- but, anyway, I hope that you don't see numbers. That you see the people that come to you in these forums. That you remember these voices that are speaking to you, and that you remember their concerns.

I do hope that you deny the application or if you do choose to approve the application or approve it with the modification, that AT&T ensures uninterrupted services with copper-wire customers while upgrading to fiber optic.

Mo had it right -- I'm so sorry. I don't remember her name, but the girl who spoke right before her had it correct: Mendocino county and rural counties are not ready for this type of a change.

I came here. I signed up. Hoping that I would have something from a company who relies on their landline. I do not. They probably don't have the cell phone service. So I'm standing in front of you, just as somebody who understands what it's like to need a landline. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER KURZFELD

Hi. I'm Lorri Kurzfeld, K-u-r-z-f-e-l-d. I'm here because I'm in one of those spots that doesn't get cell service, and I'm glad of it. And I don't really want cell phones. And I bring students to my place and they don't get cell service, and it's good for them, and they actually are glad that they don't get cell service. So that's kind of beside the point.

The point really is the landlines are important. The infrastructure is there, and it should stay as long as we need it. And it seems obvious from what everyone has said that we still need it.

So I hope you guys hear that, and vote accordingly.

And if it's really too expensive -- I don't know the numbers for AT&T -- if they're not making enough money and can't afford to keep those lines going, then maybe the Commission should find a way to get them some money. Okay. Thanks.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three are Rick Blackmon, Robert Edwards, and Richard Schneider.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BLACKMON

Rick, R-i-c-k, Blackmon, B-l-a-c-k-m-o-n. I want to thank the Commission and legal counsel for being
here, giving us this opportunity to speak.

I got involved in emergency service, mainly fire, in 1976, and I'm just going to throw some questions at you: One is, where I work I have to work with two command centers. There's backup lines coming in that. I'd have to rely on your technology with backup lines. I was actually involved in building a command center 10, 12 years ago, and got four backup lines in there. I believe those are landlines, hard-wired landlines.

I haven't heard anything -- you know, before we pull the plug on this, what is the plan? Right before I was walking into this meeting, I had received two calls from very concerned citizens, elderly, Vietnam vets, that you just turn the switch off on them. What do they do? We don't want to be like that. Let's have a plan.

You know, what's going to happen with alarm systems? You know, you turn the switch off, what's going to happen with that? What is the plan? What about putting a plan in place, proven plan, before we turn that switch off?

What is a life worth?

I have three cell phones in my command vehicle. The Valley Fire, none of them worked. I went and got
into a house with a landline, you know, because communications.

You know, in my world once we get a major incident, there's a green sheet produced, and the green sheet is the investigation, what happened when somebody was injured or a fatality. One thing is a common pattern on there: Communications.

That's always in there. What took place. Whether it was a fatality or injury, the green sheet, I read them. Communications. You know, communications -- right -- to build that relationship too.

You know, it's not like -- you have the insurance companies. Some of those people don't have that. So just consider -- let's really have a good plan put in place that's going to work, and it's tried and true, and then maybe consider that. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Can we have our next speaker, please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER RICHARD SCHNEIDER

My name is Richard Schneider, S-c-h-n-e-i-d-e-r. Thank you to the CPUC. And I'm a nurse practitioner. I work in two critical-access hospitals and two rural health clinics here in Mendocino county.

And I'm speaking on behalf of my patients.
Many of the audience here are of the age demographic of my patients, and they've told you their stories, a lot has been said about medical emergencies.

What's not thought about is mundane medical needs. So many of these patients, many of my patients, live in places where they don't have cell phone service, and they require a landline to receive phone calls from the pharmacy when their medication is ready. Phone calls from the doctor's office saying the appointment needs to be changed. Phone calls from medical supply companies saying that their hospital bed, their walker, their oxygen, their wound care supplies need to be delivered.

So without the security of the landline -- because they don't have cell service -- they can't get that very -- equally important as life-saving, but life-supporting information they need.

And, secondly -- this is just more a personal story. I live in Redwood Valley, which is an unincorporated town, halfway between Ukiah and Willits, and so I moved here four years ago from the east coast, a very cosmopolitan area with lots of services.

I moved here. I didn't get a landline because I thought, hey, the map said cell phone service is good, and for the most part, it has been, but so there's been
times it's not.

May 7th, a year ago: My wife's in town. I'm at home with my three children. I had a hypoglycemic event. I'm a diabetic. I passed out like that. Hit the ground. I'm blacked out. My three little boys call my wife on the cell phone, AT&T cell phone. It wouldn't go through. Service was interrupted and failed. Cell phone service failed, and I was in a life-threatening emergency.

They had to run across the cul-da-sac to a neighbor, who was finally able to help get -- because they had a different provider -- through so that I could get the help I needed.

So thank you for your time.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you very much.
Next speaker please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER EDWARDS

My name is Robert Edwards. That's my legal name. My name is Bob Edwards. I'm from Redwood Valley, and it's E-d-w-a-r-d-s.

And I live in a fire area, high-fire area, and we've probably -- the fire department wouldn't probably come up our road to put out fire. They have before, but they -- but I've been with AT&T since 1964.

And in '64, we had to find a phone booth, but
you can't find one today, but we use our lines. I'm known across the United States for medical providing. The town of Ukiah uses my phone number for I.D. and I'm known in the trucking business and our home phone number is the number they identify. They don't identify me as "Bob," but they identify my phone number.

And I -- a lot of -- and I can't get medical supplies without that phone number. They use that number to provide my medical supplies. So if we don't have that number, I don't know where we're going because don't -- we don't get the privilege of cell with medical supplies. So I appreciate that we keep on using our AT&T phone numbers as our suppliers.

So thank you very much for your time, and I agree with everybody here that we need to do something different, but not at this time. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: The next three are Portia Schneider, Richard Christopher, and Margo Frank.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER CHRISTOPHER

Good evening. My name is Richard, R-i-c-h-a-r-d, Christopher, C-h-r-i-s-t-o-p-h-e-r. I'm a retired nurse, and a part of Brooktrails that has no cell service, and I oppose AT&T's application.

I fear that this application is the first step in withdrawing services from my household and households
of people who have no or unreliable cell service, and
lack access to the high-tech services that AT&T
representatives spoken so feelingly about.

AT&T's presentation is full of soothing and
earnestly-vague, not-exactly promises that I find hard
to trust. AT&T wishes to save money at our expense, and
that's what this is about. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: We'll have our next speaker,
please.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER FRANK

My name is Margo Frank, M-a-r-g-o F-r-a-n-k.
I'm a clinical social worker, and I work with the
geriatric population. I understand those needs that
other people have spoken to. I also have a family
member who is an AT&T lineman, and I'm very aware of how
short the staffing is in this county and how little --
you know, I'm just very aware of the profit motive that
underlies everything that AT&T is doing.

When we moved from one house to another, right
into the center of Ukiah, we had to make numerous phone
calls to AT&T in order to try to get a landline at our
new home although there was a box and service had been
there before.

And, finally, my son-in-law said, Well, you
need to tell them that you're elderly and in an
emergency, you need to have a landline.

And that, finally, with someone who was understanding worked, but even though AT&T still says they provide those landlines, they will do anything they can not to provide them, and I wanted you to be aware of that.

Today's big blowout of AT&T service all over the country is a reminder of how important it is that we not only rely on the cell phone and internet for being connected.

In this time of dramatic climate change, the incidents of major disasters and power outages is only going to grow in severity and frequency, and given what everyone here has already said, we really need to continue to have landlines available.

My income is limited. I don't want to continue to pay $66 a month for a phone that I almost never use except to ignore spam calls, but I know that it's essential in an emergency.

That's all I have to say, and thank you so much for coming to our rural area.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. I just want to make sure I did not accidentally skip over Portia Schneider.

(No response.)

ALJ GLEGOLA: Okay. Then the next three are
Joyce Schowengerdt, Scott Liston and Jay McMartin-Rosenquist.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER McMARTIN-ROSENQUIST

I'm Jay, J-a-y, like the 10th letter of the alphabet, McMartin, M-c-M-a-r-t-i-n hyphen R-o-s-e-n-q-u-i-s-t.

I would like to thank you for being here tonight. I live over in Fort Bragg and grew up on the Mendocino Coast. We had a summer cabin on the Skunk train previously known California Western Railroad since mid to late 1960s. And when we originally left the line, we were a mile from the company ranch, and we had to pay quite a bit of money to get AT&T to bring a phone line to our rural little cabin area.

So, we are -- 35 to 40 minutes by train from Fort Bragg or longer by car, about 40 minutes if the roads are good; and there is no cell service out in the middle of the redwood trees. There's a group of cabins there that were established back in the '40s and '50s.

So, I am just going to give you a few things of what some people here -- and I will try and talk fast.

So, this happened a few years ago, including the hunt for Aaron Bassler, we were headed out there to our cabin the day Jere Melo was killed. We had friends at our cabin, and we were able to call them and tell
them to hunker down, stay in place or evacuate because
they were looking for a murderer; and Mr. Bassler knew
the woods like nobody else did.

So, the train had just gone past there, and
they heard the gunshots, and there was a BOLO put out at
the time. Our chief of police was Scott Mayberry, and
he called us as we were driving out there, and said,
"Where's your mom?" And he said, "There is all kinds of
law enforcement out there, turn around, don't go out to
the cabin," but we were able to notify the people that
were out there.

Another incident was friends were at our cabin,
and my friend got a call from her son's girlfriend
letting her know that her son was in the hospital with a
broken neck. She would have never been able to get to
the hospital to take care of her son or see what was
going on had we not had the phone.

I can go on with several incidences. There's a
time -- another time when a young boy fell off the ridge
down into the -- off the cliff and my stepdad was out
there, and we were able to -- he was able to call 9-1-1
and try to get the people -- medical people out, and the
sheriff along having to take a speeder from Fort Bragg.
The Skunk train would have had to provide that.

Another time, a fire started on the tracks, and
the speeder had already gone past the train, and we got
the fire out, but we could call the Skunk train and let
them know they needed to come and check their stuff.

So, when we first got our line, it was a party
line. Remember when we had dial-up? I had dial-up
service. I could take my little laptop and take a phone
cord, and I could actually get online, but some of our
people in our communities still have dial-up, so I urge
you to stay in our communities, to keep landlines for
all of us that still rely on them in our daily lives.

When I give out my phone number, I give out my
landline, because I know I don't have cell service
everywhere.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Can we have the next speaker, please?

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER SCHOWENGERDT
I'm Joyce Schowengerdt. That's spelled
S-c-h-o-w-e-n-g-e-r-d-t.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Ma'am, can you please get closer
to the mic?

SPEAKER SCHOWENGERDT: S-c-h-o-w-e-n-g-e-r-d-t.

Now, that I have used half of my time, I may
not speak as eloquently as those ahead of me or
represent such important groups as some of them, but I
can tell you for me, personally, I live in the redwood forest; if a fire -- no cell phones work there. I was hoping technology would catch up. It hasn't. I tried as late as last year to try to get a cell phone to work there. It just doesn't work.

I do have a landline, and that is my lifeline.

If a fire started, my landline is the only way I can call to report it, not only for myself, but for the community at large. It's not uncommon for us to lose power in that area. Without my landline, I wouldn't be able to let PG&E know that I was sitting in the dark for sometimes days.

And on even a more personal level, I have balance issues, and I am in the group that Ted Williams mentioned. My fear is that I will fall, and without a landline, I would not be able to get anybody to help me.

So, I thank you, and I hope you'll consider this very, very cautiously and earnestly.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

And our next speaker is Scott Liston.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER LISTON

Hello, my name Scott Liston. S-c-o-t-t, L-i-s-t-o-n.

We live in a very rural area in Point Arena
where there is no cell coverage whatsoever. We have tried using multiple carriers, different phones at different times and nothing seems to work. The one thing that works reliably is a landline, which we have had for many, many years. We rely on it for emergencies, which is extremely important.

I am currently employed by the County of Mendocino, Department of Transportation; and I am frequently called upon to clear trees, clear debris from roads any time of day. I am also what is called a disaster relief worker. So, my supervisors need to get ahold of me at a moment's notice, and the best way for them to do that is via the landline when we lose power. That is our only source of communicating with other people.

So, it is extremely important for -- for me and for Joyce to have this landline, and I appreciate your time.

Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next three are Wallace Stahl, Neil Altimari and Patty Bruder.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER STAHL

Hello, Wallace Stahl. Thank you all for being here. I know it's -- you've pretty much got the idea of
how we all feel, but it's probably important that I pursue my deep thoughts here.

We live in a folded and wrinkled landscape. In decades past, the phone companies actual -- the phone companies, actual public utilities rather than investor-owned utilities, were required to provide service to every customer far and wide to provide for the common good and commonwealth of all.

These existing lines still go to where the signals, tower signal dependent cell towers don't reach allowing AT&T to abandon the far flown customers who live outside or below the available microwave signals stopped by the mountains or below them in canyons like (indecipherable) and Brooktrails just a mile or two outside of Willits.

No -- no service where I live. I'm a small contractor, work in a home office. I can forward my landline to my mobile, but it doesn't work the other way around. So, I re -- I rely on the landline just to be able to carry on my life.

Let's see. To -- to allow them to abandon them is an abandonment by you, the Public Utilities Commission, and pardon the cynicism here, but whose name almost implies and reveals possible divided loyalties.

AT&T still makes a profit as they have for
decades maintaining POTS lines. Until universal services are well universal, please maintain the carrier of last resort designation.

AT&T was rather vague and general and a little ingenious when they said, "The majority of the state has gone to wireless." Well, yes, because they live in valleys, live in mountain tops. They have lots of good -- they have cable to their place because there's a density of homes to allow that. That's not the case here in our landscape. Really, the -- I -- I think the stories will come out afterwards in two or three years if this is allowed to happen, and all -- all the horror stories will come out of people who weren't able to call the fire department, and the homes and -- whatever that due to loss of their landline service, lives are lost, and it will reflect back ultimately on decisions you all make in the near or distant future.

Thank you for your time. Seriously.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Neil Altimari.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER ALTIMARI


So, I live locally here in Mendocino County, Redwood Valley. It's about 15 minutes just north of
here and about closer than eighth mile off Highway 101.

So, first (indecipherable), and at that spot, we have got two cell phone carriers up there, and I have my landline through AT&T. One cell phone is through T-Mobile and it gets one bar, a lot of dropped calls; and another one is through AT&T, and it gets one bar and a lot of dropped calls, but do you know what works great? That AT&T copper landline.

I don't have any Comcast there despite being right off the highway. I don't have a fiber line, and I can't get even get fixed wireless. I am down a little bit of a hill with a lot of tall trees; and also, there's a lot of small trees, because those are pretty valuable.

So, I keep hearing that this is antiquated technology, a copper line is antiquated technology. The irony today that our digital technology put millions of Americans without any cell phone today, yet the copper technology is what still worked for everyone. You know, analog technology is still reliable. It still has a place. Not sure if you're familiar with the TV transition from analog to digital, but it's all or nothing now; and I invite you to come over to my house anytime and watch a movie or a show with me, I get signal from my antenna, and it's a lot of digital
pixilation of nothing, whereas analog still has some
service. So, there still is a value to it.

I work as a paramedic. I have been in EMS for
18 years, paramedic for 16 years, (indecipherable), I
work up here in Laytonville, California
(indecipherable) if you're not sure where it's at. And
in that fire station -- in the fire station, I have got
no cell phone service through T-Mobile and nothing on
the AT&T cell phone, but the copper line to the fire
station still works.

Life -- you know, the copper lines are a
lifeline for many people. I have seen it in my time as
a paramedic working on the ambulance, the -- the copper
line, the landline gets a quicker response. When it
goes to dispatch centers, there's less of a lag time.
We can respond quicker to those areas, and -- and it's
the same thing for -- for -- sorry -- lost my train of
thought for a second.

I am not sure how any of you got here, whether
you guys live north, south or west, but I guarantee you
that whatever way you go, if you look at your cell
phone -- don't do it when you're driving -- is you're
not going to have cell phone service; and if you happen
to get in a wreck on your way home or you're going up
north to stay at one of the beautiful areas that we have
up here and you happen to get in a wreck,
(indecipherable) respond to on the (indecipherable) fire
station, your response is usually going to be from
someone that can get to a call box with a copper line or
one of the locals who have a copper line at their house
that can call 9-1-1 for you.

So, if you're driving home, think about the
areas on the cell phone, if something happened to you
right now and then, that antiquated copper line is going
to save you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sir, can you please wrap up? We
have more people --

SPEAKER ALTIMARI: Yeah, absolutely.

My final thought is just -- if they want to
build out a fiber network replacement, that is great,
let them do that. Let them invest that $8 billion. Let
them get through it, see where we're at, and then maybe
in 10, 20 years once they've done that -- it seems to
take a long time -- we can rehave (sic) this -- we can
revisit this conversation and do it then.

Thank you for your time tonight. I appreciate
it.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next speaker is Patty Bruder.

///
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER BRUDER

Hello. My name is Patty Bruder, B-r-u-d-e-r.

I am one of those people that cell phone does not work at my house. I am not opposed to new technology. I do have a cell phone. I use it for work, but it does not work at my house.

I -- in November -- I have now been without a home phone since November. In November, MCI let us know that they were no longer going to be our provider, so I called AT&T, and we worked on getting AT&T set up. I kept -- I was told I couldn't keep my phone number that I have had for the last 45 years; and so, I looked for other alternatives. I went to Community Phone, which they said worked in our area. They tested it. They said it works for all but one percent of the people, and lo and behold, we found out we are in the one percent. It did not work for us.

I went back to AT&T, and that is why I would say that I do not trust the lady that talked from AT&T about what they're going to do. When I went back to AT&T, I was told things like, "We really don't want landlines," "You can't have a landline in your area." I was given so many runarounds that it was -- it would have been comical if it wasn't so important to us to have our phone; and I know that we -- we can tell that
clearly they don't want our business. That the way we are treated -- I ended up at the office of the president through our Assemblyman's office -- the office of the AT&T President, and it took me a full month for them to say, "Okay, you can have a phone line." We went through a series of mishaps, and they came out finally and put a phone in. It worked for one day, and then it quit working; and so, we're back to trying to get ahold of them again.

Ironically, my husband is not here tonight because we were told AT&T was going to show up today to put -- fix our phone, and he needed to be there until 6:00 tonight. Four times we were told that, and it certainly isn't the repairman's fault. We were just -- we're given bad information. They never call you. And so -- you know, although, if I had any other alternative, I would not go with AT&T because of the way they treat us.

So, I am just saying that I understand the importance of cell phones, and please keep this going for us. It's our only choice.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you. Our next three are --

AC ALJ COLBERT: Excuse me, ma'am. One of the AT&T representatives will be talking to you right now, correct, AT&T?
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER APARICIO

Good evening. My name is Victor Aparicio. It's V-i-c-t-o-r, last name is A-p-a-r-i-c-i-o. I am a tribal member from the Manchester Point Arena Band of Pomo Indians. I am also on the Board of Trustee for Point Arena School District.

I am here to speak about the landlines and what AT&T is planning on doing. I heard the guy in the back with the glasses over here, the AT&T rep, talk about Comcast and all these wonderful things and, you know, AT&T wireless and all of that. Well, anybody that lives on the South Coast in Point Arena specifically knows that that is merely impossible. I am the water operator for my tribe. I was a former tow truck driver also, and I covered almost 100 miles of -- of land while I was a tow truck driver and probably had cell service maybe 30 percent of the time. That is a big area to cover.

Also, you know, we -- I -- I speak for my tribe and for the elders of my tribe, and I am sure I speak for a lot of elders in this room, a lot of them have landlines. My aunt Mim is 92 years old and she solely
relies on landlines. She has tried to get internet. No internet is available for her. We only have Further Reach, and we have Sky Fiber and neither one of those work because they depend on satellites, and she is covered -- you know, in an area that's covered by trees. She can't get cell service out where she's at because of the -- because of the trees. So, there is no help for her. She's tried T-Mobile, AT&T, Verizon, US Cellular, none of them work. The landline is only thing she has.

It's funny, because today before I came here, I was assisting the Point Arena Water Works deal with a broken water pipe, and you know what they use to run their plant that basically supplies water to the entire town of Point Arena? It's a copper line from the phone line. You get rid of that, there's no other source. Telemetry doesn't work. So, I mean, basically you're putting a whole town out of water.

So, yeah, I just want to thank you guys for giving me the time to come out here. I won't waste any more of your time.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

And can we hear from our next speaker.

///
STATEMENT OF SPEAKER SIZEMORE

Good evening. My name is Helen Sizemore, S-i-z-e-m-o-r-e. What I have say to you is just say no to AT&T. They spent over a year developing this proposal. You're only having three community hearings spread out across the whole state, which is not very many.

People had to drive many, many miles to get to this hearing as well as the other ones you are having, and you would have a lot more information in the negative towards AT&T if you had more hearings because everyone is concerned about this.

The taxpayers paid for AT&T to have the installation of their wires and for phones in our houses, and now they want more tax money to put in the fiber optics. So we're paying double, and it's not okay to take away the phones before everything is replaced, and then we can decide if we're paying for the fiber optic or not.

They're a -- they're a corporation and we are people. And corporations are not people no matter what the Supreme Court says. They have plenty of money. They get money -- they get money from everybody, and I'm sure they have a big nest egg that they're sharing with their shareholders who are concerned about their money.
It's not about money. It's about people, and it's about saving the lives of people that need those phones. So, please, just say no to AT&T. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next group of three is Judith Rushton, Shawn Sauers, and Dan Kabage.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER RUSHTON

Hello. I'm Judith Rushton, R-u-s-h-t-o-n, and I'm a former PacBell employee. I also live in the city of Ukiah by postal code, which my residence is approximately two miles from this building, just across the river, and cell phone service in our county, not just in rural, tiny little enclaves, but all over this county is woefully inadequate to act as an emergency backup for any kind of access.

For example, today, my cell phone (sic) was my only resort, once again, because my Wi-Fi -- which is not through AT&T -- it is through a different provider -- went down today for about an hour and a half. And good thing I had the landline because my cell phone does not work when my Wi-Fi is down.

It is also not an issue of aging solely. My daughter, who is a technologically very advanced person living in the south bay, came to take care of me once I was recovering from a surgery recently, tried to use the...
existing Wi-Fi for connectivity to her work; woefully inadequate. Did not work. I'm glad we didn't have a fire then. Thank you very much.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next speaker is Shawn Sauers.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER SAUERS


I don't want to repeat all the things that have already been said. I just want to reiterate how important it is. During the fires, we were -- my wife and my family, did -- you know, were awakened by the phone ringing, and just I thank God for the copper lines.

I really didn't know how important they were. I'm terrible at speaking in front of people. Forgive me. I'm nervous. I'm actually just a layperson. I'm a lineman. I work for a large power company. Don't throw rocks at me. I just maintain and try to deliver reliable power to the people, to the public, to the community which I live in and I'm part of. So I take great pride in that, along with the telephone guys. We're the guys out there trying to get your phone back on and the power back on in the middle of the night in the rain and storms.
But the phone stuff, it really irks me to hear. I don't know if that gentlemen was advocating for fiber up here? Because there is no fiber up here that I'm aware of.

You know, it sounds great, but I can't just subscribe to, you know, a fiber line. There is none. It's copper. And I've talked some of these gentlemen and they say the same thing over and over: We need new copper lines up here to be more reliable, and it really is an emergency kind of situation.

Just like the sheriff, who used to be the chief of police, what they were saying, I totally agree with all that. I think they should redo the copper, and they should be held accountable.

They got deep pockets just like PG&E, and I think they should be held accountable and they should -- as some of these other people have said, they paid for those lines, and they need to maintain them, just like we do. And I think they can do it. I think they just don't want to. Thank you, guys.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next speaker is Dan Kabage.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER KABAGE

Close enough.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Apologies.
SPEAKER KABAGE: No worries. My life-long curse. My name is Dan Kabage, K-a-b-a-g-e. I would like to tell you how ready AT&T is to provide alternatives. They are so ready that they give our employees a Verizon PUK for when we don't have AT&T coverage.

Just some stories from our repair calls:

Sebastopol Unified School District recently switched everything over to VoIP. The Fire Marshal comes out and says: All right. Turn the power off; make a phone call; they couldn't.

There was no power provided to the equipment that gives them VoIP services. They were ordered to install 12 landlines for emergency services for the children at the school. And it's not just them that are affected when the power goes out. We have Life Alert. Life Alert people are connected to the landlines. They cannot call. They cannot press the button.

Alarm companies: If they're forced, they have to go to a cellular card. All this is cost incurring on everybody else. Pump circuits: Pump circuits out on the Russian river. They can't run on cellular. They can't run on fiber. It's direct communication. This one speaks to this device. That's how ready AT&T is for all the alternatives. They can't do it right now.
There's no way. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

Our next speaker is Ronilyn McDonald.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER McDONALD

Spelled R-o-n-i-l-y-n M-c-D-o-n-a-l-d. Thank you for being here, and thanks for all the people who have spoken. I strongly oppose the abandonment by AT&T of its service commitment to landline telephones. Landlines are more reliable. Ecological considerations also favor landlines as they do not rely on rare earth elements and minerals required by cell phones, and they emit arguably harmful radiation as do cell phone towers and, perhaps, cell phones.

I implore AT&T by way of CPUC to consider service, including to those living where cell phone coverage is not available, rather than mere short-sighted company profit. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

So we have had roughly 350 people attend either the 2:00 p.m. session or this session. That concludes our list of speakers.

Commissioner, do you have any final remarks?

COMMISSIONER REYNOLDS: I want to offer my thanks to everyone who's joined us this evening, taking time out of their day, and some of you traveled quite
far. We really appreciate hearing your thoughts and concerns about the applications that are before us.

For those of you who weren't with us earlier, there has been no action taken on the applications. There will be no action taken now. We will have evidentiary hearings in the future with legal briefs from the parties, and no action will be able to occur until a proposed decision is drafted by Judge Glegola, who is here with us, and then a majority of the five Commissioners who vote vote on that proposed decision.

Once again, I'd like to thank you. I would also like to thank our court reporters, all of the PUC staff who helped us put on this event, the County, the City, Judge Glegola, my Bagley-Keene partner, Commissioner Houck, and Assistant Chief Colbert for all being here with us.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Sir, I notice that you were raising your hand.

STATEMENT OF SPEAKER ACKERMANN

Yes. Thank you for having this hearing. I'm over 90 years old. Just yesterday I was trying get the Life Alert. We are living in the mountains, Pine Mountain. My name is Kurt Ackermann, A-c-k-e-r-m-a-n-n. Everybody understands me very well, I hope. But I like -- going to say, the First Alert we had to go and
terminate because we had no service there on Pine
Mountain. So I oppose that. You eliminating this.
You're abandoning your landlines.

    I like to go also say in 2017, I was in San
Francisco when your blow torch fire came here in
October. I was disconnected with my wife and with the
community for three days.

    Again, these are things that when we go and
point out, but the main thing nobody ever brought out is
the services, Cal Fire, and public services have only
your landline phone number when they alert you or when
they are having PG&E placed back on. They do not have
cell numbers.

    Again, in addition, all of you, when you have a
phone, which is hooked up to your electricity, they
cannot get ahold of you. You need an old-fashioned
phone with no power or batteries to hookup, so the
public services can go and contact you.

    Thank you. And I have my faculties. I just
want you to know. I served in the Korean conflict. I
was a firefighter. This shouldn't happen. Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you, sir, and thank you for
service.

    Commissioner Houck, do you have any final
remarks?
COMMISSIONER HOUCK: Again, I thank the public for coming out. There's a lot of folks who have come a long way to talk with us, and we really appreciate the time and effort you've taken to be here this evening.

I want to thank all the public officials that came to express their opinion, our staff for putting the hearing on today and doing all the work. I want to thank the parties that were here.

And, again, I reiterate what Commissioner Reynolds said, that no decision is being made tonight. Nothing will happen until there's a vote by the full Commission and after there is an extensive procedural process that was described by Commissioner Reynolds.

So we are also taking public comment, both online or in writing. Please feel free to reach out to our Public Advisor's Office if you want to provide any additional comments or if anyone that couldn't be here this evening would like to.

And as Commissioner Reynolds mentioned earlier, there will be one more virtual public participation hearing that folks can participate in.

And, again, I just want to thank everyone for their time and attention. And I assure you that we are reading the materials that are coming in, and we are looking carefully at all of the information that's being
provided.

And last, but not least, I want to thank Judge Glegola and Assistant Chief Colbert for facilitating and managing the proceeding before the Commission. So thank you, and good night.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Assistant Chief Colbert, do you have anything?

AC ALJ COLBERT: Thank you, Commissioners. Thank you, Judge Glegola. Thank you to our court reporters. Thank you to our staff from the Public Advisor's Office. And thank all of you for coming out and letting us hear your voice. Have save travels home.

Thank you.

ALJ GLEGOLA: Thank you.

This concludes the 6:00 p.m. Public Participation Hearing for Application 23-03-002 and Application 23-03-003. We are adjourned and off record.

(At the hour of 8:27 p.m., this matter having been continued to 2:00 p.m., March 14, 2024, the Commission then adjourned.)

* * * * *

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION, STATE OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
OF THE
STATE OF CALIFORNIA

CERTIFICATION OF TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDING

I, ASHLEIGH BUTTON, CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER
NO. 14013, IN AND FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DO
HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THE PAGES OF THIS TRANSCRIPT
PREPARED BY ME COMPRISCE A FULL, TRUE, AND CORRECT
TRANSCRIPT OF THE TESTIMONY AND PROCEEDINGS HELD IN
THIS MATTER ON FEBRUARY 22, 2024.

I FURTHER CERTIFY THAT I HAVE NO INTEREST IN THE
EVENTS OF THE MATTER OR THE OUTCOME OF THE PROCEEDING.
EXECUTED THIS FEBRUARY 28, 2024.

ASHLEIGH BUTTON
CSR NO. 14013
BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION

OF THE

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

CERTIFICATION OF TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDING

I, SHANNON ROSS WINTERS, CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER NO. 8916, IN AND FOR THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, DO HEREBY CERTIFY THAT THE PAGES OF THIS TRANSCRIPT PREPARED BY ME COMPRISE A FULL, TRUE, AND CORRECT TRANSCRIPT OF THE TESTIMONY AND PROCEEDINGS HELD IN THIS MATTER ON FEBRUARY 22, 2024.

I FURTHER CERTIFY THAT I HAVE NO INTEREST IN THE EVENTS OF THE MATTER OR THE OUTCOME OF THE PROCEEDING.

EXECUTED THIS FEBRUARY 28, 2024.

SHANNON ROSS WINTERS
CSR NO. 8916
Index: co-presiding..concerns
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Index: designed..earth</th>
<th>183:9 243:15,17 273:21 301:8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>designed</td>
<td>158:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>destruction</td>
<td>166:9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>detail</td>
<td>116:6 120:12 209:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>details</td>
<td>122:11 210:13 221:12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>detector</td>
<td>136:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>determine</td>
<td>126:9 131:24 225:11,13 232:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>develop</td>
<td>126:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>developing</td>
<td>301:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>device</td>
<td>305:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>devices</td>
<td>145:17 147:1 187:3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>diabetic</td>
<td>283:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dial</td>
<td>220:9 236:6,19 246:16 249:10 251:7 261:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dial-up</td>
<td>223:4 289:5,8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dialer</td>
<td>243:12,14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diane</td>
<td>183:1,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>die</td>
<td>149:18 172:25 198:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>died</td>
<td>158:4 255:14,15 198:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dies</td>
<td>148:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>diesel</td>
<td>158:8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difference</td>
<td>150:19 244:18 254:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>differently</td>
<td>153:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficult</td>
<td>141:22 164:1 239:13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficulties</td>
<td>183:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>difficulty</td>
<td>116:16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dina</td>
<td>247:24 249:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>direct</td>
<td>173:5,7 245:21 305:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>direction</td>
<td>151:25 266:17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>directly</td>
<td>193:11 220:16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>director</td>
<td>143:13 249:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Directors</td>
<td>250:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disabled</td>
<td>129:18 130:19 136:7 147:11 162:12 231:10,11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disadvantaged</td>
<td>142:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disagree</td>
<td>157:13 233:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disaster</td>
<td>146:24 262:10 291:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disasters</td>
<td>130:13 137:21 159:18 286:12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disconnected</td>
<td>154:11 239:8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discovered</td>
<td>195:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discriminate</td>
<td>146:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discriminating</td>
<td>187:1,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discrimination</td>
<td>145:24 241:22,23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discuss</td>
<td>115:9 120:6 219:2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discussing</td>
<td>234:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>discussion</td>
<td>252:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dish</td>
<td>210:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disingenuous</td>
<td>173:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disk</td>
<td>158:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dismiss</td>
<td>130:2 145:19 231:22 242:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dispatch</td>
<td>207:5 243:1 295:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disrespect</td>
<td>228:19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disrupted</td>
<td>271:8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>disruption</td>
<td>129:22 231:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>distance</td>
<td>236:2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>distant</td>
<td>293:17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>distinction</td>
<td>252:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>districts</td>
<td>130:13 246:18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ditch</td>
<td>258:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>divide</td>
<td>125:13 224:17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>divided</td>
<td>292:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixon</td>
<td>265:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dixon-smith</td>
<td>209:6 210:23 214:8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DJ</td>
<td>173:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ocket</td>
<td>220:1,20 233:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doctor</td>
<td>136:9 160:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doctor's</td>
<td>282:9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doctors</td>
<td>188:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>document</td>
<td>145:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>documentable</td>
<td>172:8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>documents</td>
<td>209:22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dogs</td>
<td>140:22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dollar</td>
<td>208:16 211:15 275:2 278:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dollars</td>
<td>178:22 190:18 191:3 240:8 258:17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>domestic</td>
<td>249:24 250:2,3,7,9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>door</td>
<td>234:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>double</td>
<td>301:16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>doubled</td>
<td>272:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>downed</td>
<td>243:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>downtown</td>
<td>148:23 254:17 271:2,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dozens</td>
<td>124:8 223:8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dramatic</td>
<td>286:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>draw</td>
<td>245:2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>drawing</td>
<td>184:16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drell</td>
<td>175:25 178:3,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>drilling</td>
<td>230:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>drive</td>
<td>166:23 180:5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Index:

- **earthquake** 156:24
- **earthquakes** 137:18
- **easily** 207:25
- **east** 178:10 276:1
- **Easter** 243:1
- **easy** 138:17
- **eavesdropping** 147:14
- **echo** 164:13
- **Ecological** 306:9
- **economic** 142:7
- **economically** 142:4
- **Edison** 171:14 175:4,5,6
- **educate** 210:18
- **education** 209:20
- **Edwards** 279:22
- **effect** 140:16,17
- **effective** 182:14
- **effectively** 153:6
- **effects** 186:17
- **efficient** 143:1 238:12
- **effort** 120:19
- **egg** 301:24
- **eighth** 294:1
- **elbowing** 153:6
- **elder** 137:23
- **elderly** 151:8 160:13
- **elevate** 286:19
- **electric** 144:4
- **electrical** 157:15
- **electricity** 158:4
- **electro-magnetic** 146:25
- **electro-sensitivity** 144:16
- **electromagnetic** 214:16
- **electronically** 132:3
- **elements** 306:11
- **eleven** 172:9
- **eligible** 114:12 117:4,5
- **eliminate** 146:9,18
- **eliminating** 164:3
- **Elk** 175:15 189:11
- **Elko** 141:22
- **Ellen** 194:19
- **Ellis** 165:18 167:22,23,25
- **eloquently** 194:20
- **else’s** 167:5
- **email** 232:18 242:18
- **emails** 120:20 131:15
- **emergencies** 146:23
- **emergency** 138:8
- **enforce** 210:13
- **enforceable** 231:17
- **enforced** 230:8
- **enforcement** 181:17
- **engine** 143:21
- **engineer** 157:15
- **engineers** 245:1
- **enough** 55:18
- **enough** 64:16
- **enough** 113:3
- **ensure** 123:19 127:6
- **entail** 120:11
- **enter** 276:3
- **entertain** 247:9
- **entire** 129:14 172:2,6
- **equally** 282:16
- **equipment** 196:10
- **equity** 152:14 184:23
- **equal** 245:22
- **error** 258:11
- **essential** 133:25 142:9
- **essential** 143:17 144:14
- **estimate** 275:4
- **estimating** 193:1
- **evacuate** 155:24
- **evacuate** 172:20 259:15
- **evaluate** 118:17
- **evaluate** 232:12

**PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION, STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

**SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA**
Public Participation Hearing
February 22, 2024

Index: evening..financially

---

evening 120:24 149:12
218:1 219:14,16 220:25
221:23 222:2 227:20
228:20 234:10,11
238:25 240:17 242:11
248:2,10 260:17 262:3
264:4 265:19 268:15,21
269:19 284:20 293:21
299:6 301:2 306:24
event 176:22 283:4
eventually 239:18
Everbridge 237:2
evidence 171:4
evidentiary 118:25
169:7,19,24
evolution 202:19
evolve 202:15 261:2,10
evolving 261:11,19
examples 242:24
267:11
excited 266:23 267:1
excuse 166:8 199:18
235:10 250:22 251:3
298:23
executive 249:23
exectives 153:2
184:10
exist 135:8
existing 131:2 194:23
271:17 292:9 303:1
exists 212:7
expand 174:1
expansion 153:4
expect 126:13 205:25
275:8
expects 203:19
expedited 247:6
expense 285:6
expensive 133:23
239:10,13,14 279:15
experience 143:15
152:21 183:22 194:25
260:21 266:6,13
experienced 158:22
182:9
experiences 154:3
experiencing 170:4
176:10
express 121:1
expressed 120:15,18,20
expressing 232:8
extended 219:14,25
220:3
extensive 220:18
221:10
extensively 229:25
263:15
external 123:2 221:24
extra 136:2
extremely 250:18
253:4 291:6,16
\textbf{F}

F-R-A-N-K 285:11
fabric 151:21
face 122:25
faced 160:12
facilitated 151:5
facilities 130:22
facilities-based 227:12 228:11
facility 151:8,15 270:11
facing 228:18
fact 122:13 124:14
126:22 137:15 145:20
162:14 196:13 221:13
233:3 257:22 260:4
factor 208:2
factors 207:25
fail 179:15 204:23
failed 130:5 179:16
283:7,8
Failing 176:18
fails 179:24
faith 139:21 140:20
185:2
faithful 142:11
fail 274:17 290:15
false 195:19
familiar 294:21
families 271:18
family 152:5 167:15
220:6 237:9 261:6
285:14 303:12
fancy 204:6 211:9
213:11 215:13
fantastic 265:8
farm 255:24
farmer's 255:25
farmers 255:24
fashioned 212:19
fast 152:20 287:21
faster 225:26 267:9
fatality 281:6,9
father 236:16
fathom 212:25
fault 174:18 245:1
298:14
favor 124:12 306:10
favorably 240:13
FBI 147:9
FCC 154:13 230:8
231:8
fiber-optic 118:6
128:25 141:18,25
227:25
fiber-optics 230:16
fiber-to-the-home 240:16
field 144:4 244:24
260:22
fields 214:16
fight 206:3
fighting 244:17 257:8
figure 254:13
file 119:3 193:12 203:9
filings 170:17 171:3
final 296:14 306:22
finally 178:7 179:10,12
19 190:22 195:12
204:13,18 221:18
233:18,21 240:11
254:19 272:3 275:4
276:17 283:11 285:24
286:2 298:6
financed 272:7
financial 117:8
financially 208:20
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>flooding</td>
<td>130:12 246:18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>floor</td>
<td>245:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flora</td>
<td>254:3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flown</td>
<td>174:15 292:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fluid</td>
<td>243:19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flux</td>
<td>151:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fly</td>
<td>143:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>flying</td>
<td>256:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FM</td>
<td>172:17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>focus</td>
<td>194:21 219:23 266:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>focused</td>
<td>139:1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>focusing</td>
<td>265:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fogens</td>
<td>255:20,21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>folded</td>
<td>292:3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>258:5 269:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>food</td>
<td>255:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>force</td>
<td>152:13 215:9 263:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forced</td>
<td>186:11 305:19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forest</td>
<td>163:19 183:5 236:18 290:2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forever</td>
<td>246:20 249:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forfeit</td>
<td>149:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forgive</td>
<td>303:16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>form</td>
<td>124:16 126:12 163:24 184:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>formal</td>
<td>268:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>formulate</td>
<td>259:9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fortunately</td>
<td>264:22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forum</td>
<td>220:9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>forums</td>
<td>137:3 278:6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>found</td>
<td>160:1,2 166:11 297:16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>founded</td>
<td>145:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>franchise</td>
<td>275:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Francisco's</td>
<td>152:21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frank</td>
<td>253:13 284:18 285:10,11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freddie</td>
<td>176:1 177:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frequency</td>
<td>207:24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>286:13</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frequent</td>
<td>250:23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frequently</td>
<td>143:19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frontier</td>
<td>173:6,25 174:2,72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>frustration</td>
<td>179:5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fulfill</td>
<td>151:19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gain</td>
<td>265:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaithersburg</td>
<td>188:14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gal</td>
<td>192:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Galletti</td>
<td>201:18,20,21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gamble</td>
<td>237:11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gap</td>
<td>271:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>garage</td>
<td>189:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Garcia</td>
<td>161:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gas</td>
<td>241:13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gate</td>
<td>243:18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gather</td>
<td>131:24 232:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gen</td>
<td>261:7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>general</td>
<td>139:18 194:20 251:2 264:11 266:12 293:4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>generate</td>
<td>207:5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Index:** find..generate
Public Participation Hearing
February 22, 2024

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION, STATE OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
prohibit 263:21
progress 151:12
programs 129:18
program 130:19
progressive 263:21
prohibits 264:17
project 140:13
promise 198:21
promises 285:5
promotes 150:22
promotion 150:23
prone 130:12
proper 130:22
property 155:25
proposals 180:17
propose 239:20
proposed 119:4
propositions 136:4
protect 185:14
protected 156:4
protocol 118:8
proven 127:5
provide 117:9
provided 118:5
publicly 177:9
PUC 117:2
pull 161:20
pulled 152:12
pump 241:13
purchase 234:24
pure 245:13
purpose 115:1
pursue 292:2
pursued 196:3
push 202:17
pushing 249:2
put 157:1
puts 160:10
putting 186:20
putting 300:18
Q
quality 128:7
quasi-independent 228:3
question 160:11
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION, STATE OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
February 22, 2024

Public Participation Hearing
Public Participation Hearing

Index: Superstorm..texts

Public Utilities Commission, State of California
San Francisco, California
Index: wire's..Zagaris

wire’s 254:24
wired 146:3 155:22
wireless 124:13,15
126:11,12 129:11
145:16,17 146:6 147:1
150:22 153:12 169:2
170:6 187:3,4 188:6
202:24 203:10 208:7
210:15 223:13 227:12,24
228:9 245:21
257:21,24 260:3 269:7
293:6 294:11 299:15
wireless-handheld 202:18
wireline 118:6
wires 148:11 301:14
wishes 285:6
WISP 157:25 158:2,4
withdraw 114:12,15
129:6 218:9,13 230:19
242:1 265:13
withdrawing 284:25
Wiyot 161:7,9 162:21
woefully 302:14 303:1
woman 161:21 177:23
254:3 274:16
women 161:9
wonderful 115:24
299:14
wondering 168:1
270:17
Wood 134:24
Wood’s 134:20 192:19
wooded 175:19
woods 175:11 255:23
288:3
word 173:19 185:5
196:22 235:18 241:15,18
263:21
words 213:11
work 121:24 122:3
123:18 127:4 131:3
137:11 138:19 140:21
142:15 143:19,20 148:5
151:21 158:18 164:10
166:4 5 167:13 168:6
172:12 173:20,22
174:12,13 175:18 179:8
180:5 182:10 187:25
188:8 192:2,4,9,16
194:5,4,25 199:24
202:2,23 203:7,19
204:10,15 205:15
215:4,7,8 222:16 226:5
236:12,13,18 242:23
245:1,6,12 246:10
247:8 255:13 256:7,9
261:6,17 262:8 264:19
267:21 271:19 272:2
273:10 277:18 280:4
281:15,22 285:12
290:2,4,5 291:3 292:17,18
295:3,5 297:3,5,6,17
300:4,9,17 302:21
303:1,2,18
worked 151:11 156:22,23
169:6,18 170:8
173:12,14 175:15 178:6
180:2 184:1 199:5
202:20 203:3 205:15
206:25 207:2 234:24
237:16 255:16 263:14
270:6 272:7,16 280:25
286:3 294:19 297:10,14
298:7
worker 285:12 291:11
workers 244:5 245:21
working 131:20 139:4,9
158:6 166:10 168:10
174:9 176:13,18 181:1
199:11,14 234:22
242:24 254:24 295:13
298:8
works 125:11 142:23
143:4 224:15 235:8
237:17 242:21 245:20
256:12,15 277:4 291:4
294:7 295:10 297:15
300:12
world 136:13 181:11
182:2 281:3
worried 140:4,10
worries 136:25 305:1
worry 194:22
worst 198:11
worth 280:23
Zagaris 202:7,8,9
wound 282:12
Wow 160:5,7
wrap 191:15 197:11
273:8 296:11
wreck 295:24 296:1
wrinkled 292:3
write 249:16 274:8
writing 220:19
written 132:16 220:1
230:9
wrong 158:17
www.cpuc.ca.gov/pph 122:16 221:15
Y
yards 210:9
year 119:7 148:12
160:2 167:3 178:7
195:7 196:3,16,21
209:15 235:14 240:8,13
258:8 283:2 290:4
301:4
years 123:25 139:23
140:2 142:11 143:9
150:14,21 151:17 155:9
156:21 157:25 158:3,23
159:20 172:9,11 173:15
178:5 184:12 190:1,12
191:6 196:6 197:25
202:1,12 203:18 205:6
207:6 212:6,22 213:8,10
214:1,4,22 222:22
223:16 236:17 239:22
248:3,4 253:23 254:1,13
257:9 259:5 261:2,13
268:22 272:9,21
274:4 277:20 280:8
282:21 287:22 291:5
293:11 295:4 296:18
297:12 299:25
young 234:25 254:3,21
255:2,22 256:1 288:19
Z