

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

**Communications Division
Broadband, Video and Market Branch**

**RESOLUTION T-17650
March 14, 2019**

RESOLUTION

Resolution T-17650: Approving the Broadband Adoption grant applications of the Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay from the California Advanced Services Fund (CASF) in the amount of \$1,308,335.

I. Summary

This Resolution approves grant funding in the amount of \$1,308,335 from the California Advanced Services Fund (CASF) Broadband Adoption Account (Adoption Account) for the grant applications of the Allen Temple Leadership Institute (“Digital Inclusion for All” digital literacy project), United Ways of California (“Connecting California to Affordable High Speed Internet” broadband access project) and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay (“Vietnamese Community Digital Equity” digital literacy project). Collectively, these projects will provide digital literacy training to 2,200 participants and will enroll 5,804 households to wireline or fixed-wireless broadband services.

This Resolution also defers a recommendation to fund human-I-T’s three “human-I-T Connect” digital literacy projects in light of new information provided in its comments. Staff recommends instead that, if it chooses to pursue grant funding, human-I-T may modify and clarify its prior application and submit a separate application for broadband access in order to clarify its goals within 30 days from the date of this Resolution.

II. Background

On October 15, 2017, Governor Brown signed Assembly Bill (AB) 1665 (Garcia) into law. This legislation amended the statutes governing the CASF program, Public Utilities Code, §§ 281, 912.2, and 914.7, and added the Broadband Adoption Account which provides grants to increase publicly available or after school broadband access and digital inclusion. Eligible applicants for digital inclusion are local governments, senior centers, schools, public libraries, non-profit organizations, and community-based organizations with

programs to increase publicly-available or after-school broadband access and digital inclusion.

On June 21, 2018, the Commission issued Decision (D). 18-06-032¹ which implemented provisions of AB 1665 and adopted new rules and guidelines for the Adoption Account including eligibility and application requirements, types of activities and costs to be funded by CASF, criteria for expedited review approval and deadlines for applications. Key provisions of the Decision relevant to this Resolution include:

- *The Commission assigned Commission Division (CD) staff the task of approving applications that meet the criteria for expedited review;*
- *Applicants requesting a grant greater than \$100,000 do not qualify for expedited review;*
- *Where an application does not meet the expedited review criteria, it may still be considered for a grant, but it must go through the traditional Commission Resolution approval process².*

Up to thirteen criteria must be met to qualify for expedited review, one of which requires that the grant request must be \$100,000 or less per project.

On August 31, 2018, the Allen Temple Leadership Institute, human-I-T, United Ways of California and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay submitted applications for CASF funding. The projects considered through this Resolution do not qualify for expedited review because each grant request exceeds \$100,000.

On February 8, 2019 Communications Division mailed a draft of this Resolution to participants on the CASF distribution list, recommending funding for the applications of the Allen Temple Leadership Institute, human-I-T, United Ways of California and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay from the CASF in the amount of \$1,676,717.

On March 4, 2019, human-I-T, United Ways of California and the California Emerging Technology Fund (CETF) submitted comments to the Draft Resolution.

III. Applicant Request

A. About the Applicants

Allen Temple Leadership Institute is a 501(c)(3), non-profit, community service organization located in Oakland, CA. Its core mission is to educate men and

¹ Decision Implementing the California Advanced Services Fund Broadband Adoption, Public Housing and Loan Accounts [D.18-06-032] (2018), Appendix 1.

² D.18-06-032, Appendix 1 pp. 11.

women to develop and maintain responsive and responsible leadership in the church and community. Allen Temple partners with various organizations including the California Endowment, the East Oakland Building Healthy Communities, Bay Area Career Resources of San Francisco, the Rainin Foundation, the Alameda County Health and Social Services Ministry, Google, and the Oakland Unified School District. Existing programs offered include training in general education, driver education, and digital inclusion.

human-I-T is a 501(c)(3) non-profit organization based in Los Angeles, California. Its core mission is to bridge the digital divide by connecting low-income individuals and non-profits to technology, the internet, and digital training. human-I-T partners with various organizations including the Youth Institute, Everyone On, the California Emerging Technology Fund, local school districts and various local businesses. Existing programs offered include training in digital literacy, access to broadband and free computer giveaways.

United Ways of California (UWCA) is a 501(c)(3) non-profit association of United Ways organizations and community-based organizations throughout the state of California. Its mission is to improve the health, education and financial results for low-income children and families by enhancing and coordinating the advocacy and community impact work of California's United Ways. In addition to leading 31 local United Way organizations throughout the state, UWCA also partners with the California Emerging Technology Fund, Covered California and the Department of Social Services. Existing efforts include working with the California Emerging Technology Fund to connect low income households to affordable broadband services.

The Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay (VACCEB) is a 501(c)(3), non-profit, community service organization located in Oakland, CA serving clients within the County of Alameda. Its mission is to serve the basic needs of low-income refugees and immigrants within the Southeast Asian communities and other smaller, hard-to-access and isolated refugee and immigrant populations. VACCEB partners with the Community Tech Network with existing programs that include training in digital literacy, access to broadband, and language tutoring.

B. Project Descriptions and Grant Request

Allen Temple Leadership Institute's "Digital Inclusion for All" project is a digital literacy project that will bridge the digital divide and provide access to technology, training and broadband inclusion to the poor and underserved communities of East Oakland. Participants will learn basic computer skills such as how to use word processing, spreadsheet and presentation software, search online, email best practices and video chat. According to its application, classes will provide training to 2,000

participants over 2 years with a goal to subscribe 200 households to broadband services. Allen Temple Leadership Institute is requesting \$269,902 for the project.

human-I-T's three "human-I-T Connect" projects are digital literacy projects that will be offered in three locations to provide training covering the fundamentals of operating a computer, navigating the internet, and maintaining privacy online with courses being offered in English and Spanish. At each location, participants will learn how to explore and research websites for education, employment, government services, and financial management services. Depending on a person's goals, they will be able to also use this time to enroll in online courses, find affordable housing, set up online banking, create resumes, apply for jobs, and access healthcare services. Seventy-five percent of the training sessions will be dedicated to course instruction, with the remaining twenty-five percent set aside for one-on-one tutoring with instructors. According to its application, each project location will provide training courses to 1,315 participants over 2 years with a goal to subscribe 1,300 households to broadband services. human-I-T is requesting \$354,589 per project.

UWCA's "Connecting California to Affordable High-Speed Internet" project is a broadband access project that will sign up 5,804 households for broadband services. UWCA will lead a network of 31 local United Way organizations throughout the state, all with deep roots in their communities and long histories of culturally competent, language-appropriate outreach and direct service. UWCA will engage its subcontractor members to integrate broadband outreach into its other outreach and direct service work, and to steer qualifying Californians towards UWCA's automated screening and appointment setting system. These efforts also will include coordinating a statewide outreach campaign to refer qualifying individuals to the enrollment and verification system, as well as marketing efforts including distributing collateral materials, social media posts, targeted ads on Google and social media, web content, and telephone hold messages for answering machines and 2-1-1 phonebanks to be distributed to subcontractors. UWCA staff will then assist these consumers in enrolling in the affordable programs available in their areas, and then follow up to verify the enrollment. According to its application, the project will enroll 5,804 households in broadband services over 2 years. Additionally, UWCA will partner with cities and counties to educate communities about the 2020 Census and will incorporate broadband outreach into these education efforts to increase the adoption of broadband and make it easier for low income people to respond to the Census. UWCA is requesting \$1,451,000 for the project.

VACCEB's "Digital Equity Program" project is a digital literacy project consisting of single-session workshops that will educate participants on how to get connected through WiFi and broadband, public access, safety/security, and low-cost service

providers. The multi-session classes will provide training in Vietnamese on basic digital literacy, beyond basics such as cloud-based e-mail, word processing, spreadsheets, and employment-related topics. These classes support VACCEB's mission of promoting assimilation and self-sufficiency within one generation of arrival to the United States. According to its application, the classes will provide training to 200 participants over 2 years with a goal to subscribe 75 households to broadband services. VACCEB is requesting \$192,293.00 for the project.

IV. Project Review

Staff evaluated the applications based on it meeting the requirements specified in D.18-06-032.

A. Project Evaluation Process

Completeness: Decision 18-06-032 Appendix 1 requires all applicants to submit a complete application package including, but not limited to, the project description, work plan, performance metrics, detailed budget, cover letter, curriculum (if applicable), as well as a notarized affidavit. Staff reviewed each project's application to ensure that all the required information was submitted.

Expedited Review Criteria: Decision 18-06-032 Appendix 1 assigns to staff the task of approving applications that meet all the expedited review criteria³. Projects not meeting all the expedited review requirements may still be considered through the Commission's Resolution process. Staff reviewed each project to see if it met all the expedited review criteria. (See Attachment 1 for expedited review criteria).

Preference Criteria: AB 1665 requires the Commission to give preference to programs in communities with demonstrated low broadband access, including low-income communities, senior communities, and communities facing socioeconomic barriers to broadband adoption⁴. Decision 18-06-032 also included a preference checklist to assist the Commission in the evaluation and prioritization of applications⁵. Staff reviewed each project to see how many of the preference criteria was met and prioritized projects accordingly. (See Attachment 2 for preference criteria checklist).

³ D.18-06-032 Appendix 1, pp. 11-12.

⁴ Pub. Util. Code, § 281 (j)(5).

⁵ D.18-06-032, Appendix 1, Attachment 1, pp. 15.

Budget: Decision 18-06-032 Appendix 1 states the Commission may fund *up to* 85 percent of the program costs including education and outreach efforts, travel, computing devices, printers, routers, staffing for instruction and technical support, desks, chairs, and the gathering, preparing, creating and distribution of digital literacy curriculum⁶. The remaining amount shall be matched by other non-CASF funds. Staff reviewed each project's budget as presented in the applications to ensure that no more than 85 percent of eligible program costs were included and adjusted the final budgets removing any ineligible expenses including, but not limited to, reimbursement for rent, utilities, internet service, lodging, and snacks.

Staff further reviewed project cost by category based on the applicants' proposed budgets, in addition to an evaluation of overall cost per participant. Staff based its budget adjustment recommendations on the following:

- i. Available funds vs. total funds requested: Staff received in the first round of applications over \$8.4 million in total requested funds for 66 projects. This amount exceeds the \$5 million funding limit established in D. 18-06-032 for the first round of applications.
- ii. Reasonableness review: Staff compared budget line items among projects and found large variations in expenses requested for similar items (e.g. a \$13,700 printer versus a \$150 printer). Staff evaluated the mean, median, minimum, and maximum request amount for each of the expense categories and assigned a reasonable cost to expenses exceeding the norm. Staff also reviewed labor expenses to ensure budgeted items were attributable to a required activity.

For all projects approved at the expedited review level or recommended for approval via a Resolution, Staff provided the approved grant amount broken down by category (*In-Classroom Computing Devices, Take Home Computing Devices, Printers, Computer Software, Training Materials, Marketing and Outreach, Technical Support, Digital literacy instructors or Staffing for monitoring the designated space or staffing for call centers, Other Staffing, and Travel*).

Overall Quality: All projects were reviewed based on how well they meet the requirements and goals set out in D.18-06-032 to increase publicly available or after-school broadband access and digital inclusion in communities with limited broadband adoption.

B. Project Application Evaluation and Recommendation

⁶ D.18-06-032, Attachment 1, pp.6.

Staff finds that these projects align with CASF's goal to increase publicly available or after-school broadband access and digital inclusion to serve communities with limited broadband adoption and recommends approval for these projects after the following review and budget adjustments.

i. Allen Temple Leadership Institute – “Digital Inclusion for All” Digital Literacy Project

The Allen Temple Leadership Institute's “Digital Inclusion for All” digital literacy project meets five of the seven preference checklist criteria (the project is not located in a rural community and is not serving a community with some other demonstrated disadvantage). The project's work plan includes detailed functions, activities, and deliverables related to implementing the adoption program, as well as a timeline identifying milestone dates for completion of key work plan activities and deliverables. This project has also received support from Oakland Community Organizations, a federation of congregations, local schools, the Oakland Unified School District's Adult and Career Education Department and allied community organizations representing over 40,000 families in Oakland.

Additionally, the project will meet the needs of the community by providing computer and digital literacy training and by promoting broadband adoption by providing access to technology, training and broadband inclusion to the poor and underserved communities of East Oakland that have a low broadband adoption rate. It will also train 2,000 participants over 2 years with a goal to subscribe 200 households to broadband services.

In the Draft Resolution, staff recommended awarding CASF funding in the amount of \$147,874 for this project after some budget modifications.

ii. human-I-T – “human-I-T Connect” (Three projects)

human-I-T's three “human-I-T Connect” digital literacy projects meet six of the seven preference checklist criteria (project locations are not in a rural community). The projects' work plans include detailed functions, activities, and deliverables related to implementing the digital literacy training programs, as well as a timeline identifying milestone dates for completion of key work plan activities and deliverables. These projects also have support from the California Emerging Technology Fund, Los Angeles City Councilman Herb Wesson, Long Beach City Vice Mayor Rex Richardson, the Housing Authority of City of Los Angeles, and the Youth Policy Institute.

Based on its application, human-I-T states that it will meet the needs of the communities by providing digital literacy training to the poor and underserved communities of Los Angeles, Commerce and Long Beach, and that each project location will train 1,315 participants over 2 years with a goal to subscribe 1,300 households to broadband services.

In the Draft Resolution, staff recommended awarding CASF funding in the amount of \$122,794 per project location after some budget modifications.

- iii. United Ways of California (UWCA) – “Connecting Californians to Affordable, High-Speed Internet”

UWCA’s “Connecting Californians to Affordable, High-Speed Internet” broadband access project meets all seven preference checklist criteria. The project’s work plan includes detailed functions, activities, and deliverables related to implementing the adoption program, as well as a timeline identifying milestone dates for completion of key work plan activities and deliverables. UWCA is also receiving support from the California Emerging Technology Fund.

Additionally, according to its application, the project will meet the needs of low-income families and households across the state by helping them find and sign up for affordable broadband services. The project will enroll 5,804 households to wireline or fixed-wireless broadband services over two years.

In the Draft Resolution, staff recommended awarding CASF funding in the amount of \$1,051,380 after some budget modifications.

- iv. Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay (VACCEB) – “Digital Equity Program”

VACCEB’s “Digital Equity Program” digital literacy project meets six of the seven preference criteria (the project is not located in a rural community). The project’s work plan includes detailed functions, activities, and deliverables related to implementing the adoption program, as well as a timeline identifying milestone dates for completion of key work plan activities and deliverables. The project has also received a letter of support from twenty-six of its members and volunteers.

Additionally, the project will meet the needs of the community by providing digital literacy training in their native language to low-income refugees and immigrant within the Southeast Asian communities in the East Bay. It will train 200 participants over 2 years with a goal to subscribe 75 households to broadband services. We recognize that the average investment per participant trained for this project is higher as compared to the other projects in this resolution. This is mainly due to the fact that this project will train less participants over the course of two years. However, according to the VACCEB, this project would also serve a very low income and hard to reach community with instruction provided in their native language.

In the Draft Resolution, staff recommended awarding CASF funding in the amount of \$109,081 after some budget modifications.

V. Comments on Draft Resolution and Final Recommendation

In compliance with Public Utilities Code, § 311(g), Communications Division sent a notice letter on February 11, 2019, informing all parties on the CASF Distribution List of the availability of the draft of this Resolution for public comments at the Commission's documents website at <http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/documents/>. This letter also informed parties that the final conformed Resolution adopted by the Commission will be posted and available at the same website. human-I-T, UWCA and CETF submitted comments on the Draft Resolution on March 4, 2019.

A. *human-I-T*

In its comments on the Draft Resolution, human-I-T disagreed with the recommended grant funding level, provided additional new information about the project, and provided revised goals for the project. It raised the four main issues as discussed below.

- i. human-I-T states that the Draft Resolution denies funding to entire categories of request submitted by human-I-T that were granted to others, without clear logic regarding why certain projects were approved over others⁷.

human-I-T's original application was submitted under a digital literacy training project with an updated budget and goal to train 1,315 participants *per* location. However, in its comments Human-I-T states that the projects include both a digital literacy component as well as a broadband access/call center component, and that the goals as stated in the Resolution are erroneous. This is inconsistent with the information provided in the application, as the application stated a goal of 1,315 participants *per* location. Staff evaluated this project as a digital literacy training project as described in the application and based all goals off of what was provided in the application.

- ii. human-I-T states that the Draft Resolution significantly reduces the budget to carry out deliverables, without reducing the expectation of individuals served⁸. Further, it states that the Draft Resolution fails to explain which categories of the budget were cut or reduced and fails to give rationale as to why certain categories were disallowed⁹.

⁷ human-I-T, Comment on Draft Resolution T-17650, filed 03/04/2019, p.1.

⁸ Ibid, p.4.

⁹ Ibid, p.4.

Decision 18-06-032 allows the Commission to fund *up to* 85 percent of eligible program costs but does not require that all expenses be funded in the amounts originally requested, as the Commission expects and encourages that any remaining expenses not funded via the CASF grant be matched by other sources. human-I-T's proposal included expense items that appeared much higher than what the majority of other applicants were requesting to carry out the same efforts for a digital literacy project. Accordingly, CD staff recommended reducing those expense items so that they are comparatively reasonable.

- iii. human-I-T states that the Draft Resolution misrepresents human-I-T's deliverables submitted to the CPUC¹⁰.

In its comments, human-I-T clarifies that the 1,315-goal combined both the number of participants the project would train as well as the number of participants it would subscribe or sign up for affordable internet per location. It further clarifies that each location would actually train 416 participants and subscribe or sign up 1,315 participants to affordable internet access.

However, in its application, human-I-T described its project as a digital literacy project. Staff reviewed the proposal as a digital literacy project and its budget was reviewed and adjusted accordingly. It also clearly stated that, its' digital literacy project would serve 1,315 participants per location. If the projects are intended to be both a digital literacy and broadband access/call center project, then the project applications should be evaluated separately and respective to their goals pursuant to program requirements. Given the misrepresentations in the application, Staff recommends that action on this application be deferred.

Final Recommendation for human-I-T

Decision 18-06-032 requires applicants to submit information to the Commission for each proposed project, including but not limited to, project description, work plan, performance metrics plan and budget. Staff reviews and recommends approval of projects based on the information provided in applications and evaluates budget requests contained in the applications. In its comments, human-I-T provided new and different information with respect to the project's description, activities and goals, which was not included in its original application and which staff could not review prior to releasing the draft resolution¹¹. The rules governing this program do not provide for an applicant to modify or make changes to its application through comments on a Draft Resolution. Accordingly, Staff cannot recommend approval of the three human-I-T digital literacy projects based on

¹⁰ Ibid, p.4.

¹¹ Human-I-T comments to Draft Resolution T-17650 via email to Cynthia Walker, dated March 4, 2019.

the new information provided in its comments. Therefore, Staff defers the recommendation to fund human-I-T's three "human-I-T Connect" digital literacy projects in light of new information provided in its comments. human-I-T may modify and clarify its prior application and file a separate application for broadband access in order to clarify its goals within 30 days from the date of this Resolution. Alternatively, it may later submit new applications pursuant to the next application cycle, due July 1, 2019 for Staff review and Commission consideration.

B. UWCA

In its comments, UWCA disagrees with the recommended grant funding level, and raises three main issues as discussed below:

i. No Justification for the Removal/Reduction of Administrative Support Costs

In its comments, UWCA states that its proposed budget included a line item for "Administrative Support" amounting to \$133,583, but that the Draft Resolution removed this entire category without explanation or justification. UWCA further asserts that all other applicants' budgets have a category which allows for administrative support, and that it is unclear why the requested administrative costs would be removed from the proposed budget but granted to other grantees¹².

UWCA's \$133,583 request detailed in its budget in the application was not categorized as "administrative support." Rather, it was identified as "Indirect Costs (15% of Personnel + Non- personnel)." This 15%+ adder was applied to the total personnel labor budget and other non- personnel expenses, which included the wages for the President & CEO, Development Coordinator and Advocate, Digital Outreach Manager, Digital Outreach Coordinator, Broadband Enrollment Assistant, Program Assistant, Communications Staffer. Further, this 15%+ adder was inappropriately applied on top of the 25% adder for Benefits for all the above roles, and other "non- personnel expenses" which were not identified. Based on UWCA's mis-characterization of costs in its application and lack of specificity of "indirect costs," Staff finds the "15% of Personnel + Non- personnel" adder as appropriate to be removed.

With regards to other budget adjustments made, Staff recommended adjustments to UWCA's request for overall personnel labor expenses during the ramp up period given that it was based on a full year's salary for each personnel. Decision 18-06-032 states that the ramp up period may not exceed 6 months, and therefore Staff adjusted these expenses

¹² United Ways of California, Comment on Draft Resolution T-17650, filed 03/04/2019, pp.1-2.

to reflect a 6-month salary, rather than a full year. Year 1 and Year 2 of the project's personnel labor costs were approved as requested.

ii. Reduction of Subcontracting Costs

In its comments, UWCA states that the Draft Resolution reduced the subcontractor costs/reimbursement while still expecting the same proposed number of broadband subscriptions, 5,804. It states that the removal of such a large portion of the subcontracting budget would severely reduce its success in producing the proposed number of broadband subscriptions, and would leave the program budget unbalanced, with a disproportionate amount allocated for UWCA "Staff/Instructors," who would be managing a necessarily smaller project. UWCA requests that the Commission either increase the budgeted amount for subcontractor costs or reduce required number of broadband subscriptions¹³.

In reviewing the requested subcontractor expenses, staff observed that the overall expense request for all subcontractors was \$50 per enrollment. Staff considers this amount as reasonably justified. However, UWCA proposed a \$75 to \$83 adder to certain subcontractors for "verification" of the enrollment. UWCA did not provide an explanation as to why a separate \$75 to \$83 adder per enrollment for verification work was necessary, therefore, Staff excluded this expense. Additionally, based on discussions with other staff and local 2-1-1 providers about the costs for conducting similar enrollment work, the average reimbursement rate ranged from \$15 to \$30 per screening. Accordingly, \$50 per enrollment is reasonable.

iii. IV. Reduce Target Adoptions or Increase the Reimbursement Cost Per Broadband Subscription

UWCA states that based on its experience in enrolling thousands of low-income California households in affordable high-speed home broadband, it believes that the proposed cost per verified broadband subscription of \$250 is fair or even conservative. In addition to the \$250 per verified subscription UWCA requested from CASF, it offered an additional \$44.12 in leveraged funding and self-funding, which would be obtained through other sources, bringing the total estimated cost per verified subscription to \$294.12. UWCA asks that the Commission revise the estimated cost per broadband subscription to \$250, as requested and to apply a similar cost per outcome equitably for all CASF applicants. However, should the total budget remain as the Resolution provides (\$1,051,380), UWCA would need

¹³ United Ways of California, Comment on Draft Resolution T-17650, filed 03/04/2019, pp.2-3.

to lower their total output from 5,804 subscriptions to 4,205 verified subscriptions, based on the rate of \$250 per subscription¹⁴.

Staff recommends approval of UWCA's project based on the information provided in the application and evaluated the budget request within those terms after adjusting UWCA's original request to a) remove the unexplained "indirect costs," b) adjust the labor and personnel salary during the ramp-up period to 6 months, and c) remove the subcontractor reimbursement adder for additional verification work. Under the grant terms, all grantees have the option of declining the grant if they decide not to move forward with the project or do not believe they can meet the goals with the grant funding provided. In this instance, if UWCA does not believe that it can achieve the goals as outlined in their application with the grant award, it can always choose to not accept the grant and resubmit an application with revised project plan, goals and budget in the next cycle.

Final Recommendation for UWCA

The final recommendation remains the same as what was in the Draft Resolution (i.e. awarding CASF funding in the amount of \$1,051,380 after some budget modifications).

C. CETF

In its comments, CETF disagrees with the recommended grant funding level for the human-I-T project and the UWCA project. It raises the issues below:

- i. Budgets are reduced yet unfairly requiring the same outcomes which will not be achievable absent full funding;
- ii. Resolution fails to state which categories or items were cut or reduced, and further fails to give a rationale for each change from the proposed budget so that future applicants can learn from the grants;
- iii. Resolution inconsistently cuts some categories of items in one application but grants it in others and thus is arbitrary and capricious;
- iv. Resolution accepts a wide range of costs per outcome (ranging from \$67 to \$397) even for similar programs for Digital Literacy, and thus is arbitrary and capricious; and
- v. Resolution contains an error about the human-I-T application which should be corrected¹⁵.

¹⁴ United Ways of California, Comment on Draft Resolution T-17650, filed 03/04/2019, pp.3-4.

¹⁵ CETF, Comment on Draft Resolution T-17650, filed 03/04/2019, pp.1-5.

Staff appreciates CETF's comments and have addressed these issues in the response to both human-I-T and UWCA's comments.

Final Recommendation for Allen Temple Leadership Institute and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay

The final recommendation remains the same for those projects as what was in the Draft Resolution (i.e. awarding CASF funding in the amount of \$147,874 and \$109,081 respectively after some budget modifications).

VI. Compliance Requirements

All grantees are required to comply with all guidelines, requirements, and conditions associated with the grant of CASF funds as specified in D.18-06-032. Such compliance includes, but is not limited to the below.

A. Reporting Requirements

The grant award is contingent upon fulfilling reporting requirements during and after project completion as specified in D.18-06-032, Appendix 1, Section 1.12.

A template for all necessary reports is provided in the CASF Adoption Program [Administrative Manual](#) which is posted on the Commission's CASF website, along with the [Adoption Account Instructions](#) and [Application forms](#). Up to three reports will be required throughout the course of the project:

i. Ramp-up period report

A "ramp-up period report" is required after completion of the ramp up activities and when deployment is set to begin (if applicable). This report must be submitted by no later than 3 months after the completion of the ramp up activities. In this report, recipients will report on the completion of the ramp up activities per the work plan, milestones met, as well as request payment for relevant expenses to date. The ramp up period may not exceed 6 months from the time the application is approved.

ii. Year 1 Progress Report

The Year 1 progress report is required at the end of the first year of deployment. This report must be submitted by no later than 3 months after the end of the first year of deployment. In this report, recipients will report on the status of Year 1 milestones per the work plan, as well as request payment for relevant expenses to date.

iii. Year 2 Completion Report

The Year 2 completion report is required at the end of the 24-month period, or after the work plan milestones/deliverables have been accomplished if earlier than the 24-month period. This report must be submitted by no later than 3 months after completion of the project. In this report, recipients will report on the completion of the overall project, milestones met per the work plan, as well as request payment for final and remaining relevant expenses.

B. Execution and Performance

Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay must start the project within six months after the grant approval (after the ramp up time) and complete the project within a 24-month time frame or earlier. The Commission may withhold or terminate grant payments if the grantee does not comply with any of the requirements set forth in its application and compliance with CASF rules. In the event the grantee fails to complete the project in accordance with the terms of approval granted by the Commission, the grantee will be required to reimburse some or all the CASF funds it has received.

Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay must complete all performance metrics under the award on or before the termination date of the award.

Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay must maintain files, invoices and other related documentation for three years after final payment. Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay shall make these records available to the Commission upon request and agree that these records are subject to audit and review by the Commission at any time within three years after the Grantee incurred the expense being audited.

Material changes in the entries shown in the application, such as discontinuing operation or bankruptcy, or change of name (DBA), change of address, telephone, fax number or E-mail address must be reported immediately by a letter to the Commission Director of the Communications Division, 505 Van Ness Avenue, San Francisco, CA 94102.

C. Award Acceptance

Upon adoption of this Resolution, the Grantees will receive an award acceptance letter and consent form requiring agreement to the terms set herein. A completed and executed consent form shall be emailed to CASF_Adoption@cpuc.ca.gov within 30 calendar days from the date of the adoption of this Resolution. Failure to submit the consent form

within 30 calendar days from the date of this Resolution's adoption will deem the grant null and void.

VII. Payments to CASF Recipients

A. Payment Process

- i. Grantees may submit payment requests at 3 points throughout the project period. Payment requests will accompany the 3 reports required above (Ramp Up Period, Year 1, Year 2).
- ii. The relevant project report must be submitted in order for a payment request to be granted.
- iii. Payment request for the ramp-up period may not exceed 25% of grant amount.
- iv. All payments requests require documentation of outcome in "milestone" report.
- v. Grantees shall submit final requests for payment no later than 3 months after completion of the project.
- vi. Payment will be based upon receipt and approval of invoices and other supporting documents showing the expenditures incurred for the project are in accordance with their application.
- vii. Grantees must notify the Commission as soon as they become aware that they may not be able to meet project deadlines.
- viii. Payment will be made in accordance with, and within the time specified in California Government Code § 927 et seq.
- ix. The Commission has the right to conduct any necessary audit, verification, and discovery during project implementation to ensure that CASF funds are spent in accordance with the terms of approval granted by the Commission.
- x. The recipient's invoices will be subject to audit by the Commission at any time within three years of final payment.

B. Audits

The Commission has the right to conduct any necessary audit, verification, and discovery during project implementation to ensure that CASF funds are spent in accordance with Commission requirements. Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay invoices are subject to a financial audit by the Commission at any time within three years of completion of the project. Grantees must certify that each report and payment request submitted is true and correct under penalty of perjury.

All required reports and payment requests, including invoices and other supporting documents should be submitted via email to: CASF_Adoption@cpuc.ca.gov.

VIII. Findings

1. On August 31, 2018, the Allen Temple Leadership Institute submitted an application for its digital literacy project “Digital Inclusion for All” to the CASF Broadband Adoption Account.
2. On August 31, 2018, human-I-T submitted an application for its three digital literacy projects - “human-I-T connect” to the CASF Broadband Adoption Account. The human-I-T application is for three projects located at three different locations that share the same curriculum, budget and project goals.
3. On August 31, 2018, United Ways of California submitted an application for its broadband access project “Connecting Californians to Affordable, High-Speed Internet” to the CASF Broadband Adoption Account.
4. On August 31, 2018, the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay submitted an application for its digital literacy project “Digital Inclusion for All” to the CASF Broadband Adoption Account.
5. These applications do not meet the expedited review criteria because each grant request exceeds \$100,000.
6. Based on its review, staff has determined that three of these projects meet the eligibility requirements and align with CASF’s goal to increase publicly available or after-school broadband access and digital inclusion to serve communities with limited broadband adoption and therefore recommends Commission approval of CASF funding for Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay projects.
7. Some expenses submitted in the budget were not reasonable and staff reduced the budget expenses accordingly based on reasonableness review described in Section IV (Project Review) Section A (Budget).
8. A notice letter was emailed on February 11, 2019, informing all parties on the CASF Distribution List of the availability of the Resolution at the Commission’s documents website at <http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/documents/>. This letter also informed parties that the final conformed Resolution adopted by the Commission will be posted and available at the same website.

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED THAT:

1. The Commission shall award:
 - i. \$147,874 to Allen Temple Leadership Institute for its digital literacy project "Digital Inclusion for All."
 - ii. \$1,051,380 to United Ways of California for its broadband access project "Connecting Californians to Affordable, High-Speed Internet."
 - iii. \$109,081 to the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay for its digital literacy project "Digital Equity Program."
2. A total of \$1,308,335 for these three projects shall be paid out of the CASF Broadband Adoption Account in accordance with the guidelines adopted in D.18-06-032.
3. Grantees must complete and execute the consent form and email to CASF_Adoption@cpuc.ca.gov within 30 calendar days from the date of the adoption of this Resolution. Failure to submit the consent form within 30 calendar days from the adoption date of this Resolution will deem the grant null and void.
4. Payments to the CASF recipient shall be in accordance with Appendix 1 of D.18-06-032 and in accordance with the process defined in the "Payments to CASF Recipients" section VII of this Resolution.
5. Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay agree to comply with all guidelines, requirements and conditions associated with the CASF funds award as specified in D.18-06-032 and this Resolution.
6. By receiving a CASF grant, Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay agree to comply with the terms, conditions and requirements of the grant and thus submits to the jurisdiction of the Commission with regard to disbursement and administration of the grant.
7. Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay must complete all work and achieve all performance metrics identified in the attached Appendix 3 and their application filed workplans covered by the grant.
8. If Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, or the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay fail to complete the projects in accordance with the terms outlined in D.18-06-032 and this Resolution, they must reimburse some or all the CASF funds they have received.

9. Allen Temple Leadership Institute, United Ways of California, and the Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay shall submit final requests for payment no later than three months after completion of the project.
10. human-I-T may modify and clarify its prior application and submit a separate application for broadband access in order to clarify its goals within 30 days from the date of this Resolution. Alternatively, it may later submit new applications pursuant to the next application cycle, due July 1, 2019 for Staff review and Commission consideration.

This Resolution is effective today.

I hereby certify that this Resolution was adopted by the Public Utilities Commission at its regular meeting on March 14, 2019. The following Commissioners approved it:

/s/ Alice Stebbins

Alice Stebbins
Executive Director

MICHAEL PICKER
President
LIANE M. RANDOLPH
MARTHA GUZMAN ACEVES
CLIFFORD RECHTSCHAFFEN
GENEVIEVE SHIROMA
Commissioners

ATTACHMENT 1

Expedited Review Criteria

The Commission assigns to staff the task of approving applications that meet all the following expedited review criteria:

1. Applicant is proposing to serve a low-income population;
2. Applicant is a local government, senior center, school, public library, non-profit organization, or community-based organization with programs to increase publicly available or after-school broadband access and digital inclusion, such as digital literacy training programs;
3. Applicant requests a grant of \$100,000 or less;
4. Applicant agrees to perform education and outreach to educate the community of available broadband Internet services;
5. Applicant's requested reimbursement for computing devices for community training rooms or other public space, is no more than \$750 per device, with a maximum of 15 devices per location;
6. Project provides device technical support responses within 24 hours.
7. Device technical support (not network), either by phone or in person, will be able to respond within 24 hours. Refurbished devices will have at least a six-month warranty. New devices will have at least a 30-day warranty.
8. Applicant has identified a designated space for digital literacy training or broadband access;
9. Applicants must be ready to provide classes within six months of being selected for a CASF grant and must submit a work plan with major milestones showing how they propose to meet this deadline; and
10. Applicants must complete the adoption project within 24 months from the ramp up period, or earlier if work plan milestones/deliverables have been accomplished.

Additional Criteria for Digital Literacy Projects only

11. Applicant or partner organization possesses at least one-year experience in digital literacy training or has previously carried out at least one digital literacy project;
12. Applicant must provide at least eight hours of digital literacy training to each participant, through digital literacy classes, one on one tutoring or self-paced instruction; and
13. Applicant's requested reimbursement for take-home computing devices is no more than \$150 per device, limited to one computing device per eligible household, and no more than \$10,000 per application/project location.

ATTACHMENT 2

Preference Checklist

1. Project is serving a low-income community (where the community has a median household income at or below the CARE income limits for a household of four).
2. Project is serving a community with a high percentage of residents with limited English proficiency (where more than 50 percent of residents have limited English proficiency).
3. Project is serving a community with a high percentage of residents with limited educational attainment (where more than 50 percent of residents have only a high school diploma or less).
4. Project is serving a rural community. A project is located in a "rural" area if it meets one of the following criteria:
 - a. It is in area that is eligible for federal program under the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) Section 515 program;
 - b. It is in a city with a population of 40,000 or less or in a non-urbanized area; or
 - c. It is in an unincorporated area of a county and is not in an urbanized area.
5. Project has community support, endorsements and/or partnerships.
6. Project is serving a community with some other demonstrated disadvantage which affects broadband adoption, documented by applicant.
7. Project considers coordination with other public purpose programs and funding sources.

ATTACHMENT 3

Approved Project Budgets and Performance Metrics

- Allen Temple Leadership Institute
8501 International Blvd, Oakland CA

Allen Temple Leadership Institute - "Digital Inclusion for All" Budget	
Category	Grant Amount
<i>In-Classroom Computing Devices</i>	\$4,462
<i>Take Home Computing Devices</i>	\$7,650
<i>Printers</i>	\$1,020
<i>Computer Software</i>	\$5,313
<i>Training Materials (includes preparing, gathering, printing, distributing)</i>	\$6,375
<i>Marketing and Outreach (including marketing and outreach staff, fliers, advertising, other marketing and outreach efforts)</i>	\$8,075
<i>Technical Support</i>	\$5,100
<i>Digital literacy instructors or Staffing for monitoring the designated space or staffing for call centers</i>	\$64,940
<i>Other Staffing (including administrative support, project management, other staff, (excludes marketing and outreach staff))</i>	\$42,112
<i>Travel per Guidelines</i>	\$2,827
Total	\$147,874

Allen Temple Leadership Institute - "Digital Inclusion for All"	
Performance	Metric
<i>Grantee will provide digital literacy training to the following</i>	<i>2000 participants</i>
<i>Grantee will perform the following education and outreach to educate the community of available broadband internet services</i>	<i>Activities as stated per application</i>
Goal	
<i>Grantee shall aim to subscribe the following number of households to broadband internet services</i>	<i>200 subscriptions</i>

ATTACHMENT 3

Approved Project Budgets and Performance Metrics

(cont.)

2. United Ways of California

Counties throughout the state including Fresno, Madera, Kern County, Orange County, Inland Empire, Northern Santa Barbara, Tulare, Corona-Norco, Yuba-Sutter-Colusa, the Bay Area, and Greater Los Angeles.

UWCA - "Connecting Californians to Affordable, High-Speed Internet" Approved Budget	
Category	Grant Amount
<i>Printers</i>	\$425
<i>Routers</i>	\$340
<i>Computer Software</i>	\$1,020
<i>Desks</i>	\$340
<i>Chairs</i>	\$170
<i>Training Materials (includes preparing, gathering, printing, distributing)</i>	\$4,000
<i>Marketing and Outreach (including marketing and outreach staff, fliers, advertising, other marketing and outreach efforts)</i>	\$243,100
<i>Digital literacy instructors or Staffing for monitoring the designated space or staffing for call centers</i>	\$553,657
<i>Other Staffing (Outreach Contractors)</i>	\$246,628
<i>Travel per Guidelines</i>	\$1,700
Total	\$1,051,380

UWCA - "Connecting Californians to Affordable, High-Speed Internet"	
Performance	Metric
<i>Grantee will provide broadband access to the following</i>	<i>5804 households</i>
<i>Grantee will perform the following education and outreach to educate the community of available broadband internet services</i>	<i>Activities as stated per application</i>
<i>Grantee will subscribe the following number of households to fixed-wireless or wireline broadband internet services</i>	<i>5804 subscriptions</i>

ATTACHMENT 3

Approved Project Budgets and Performance Metrics

(cont.)

3. Vietnamese American Community Center of the East Bay (VACCEB)
 655 International Blvd., Oakland CA

VACCEB "Digital Equity Program" Budget	
Category	Grant Amount
<i>In-Classroom Computing Devices</i>	\$9,563
<i>Take Home Computing Devices</i>	\$8,160
<i>Printers</i>	\$956
<i>Computer Software</i>	\$1,700
<i>Training Materials (includes preparing, gathering, printing, distributing)</i>	\$13,000
<i>Marketing and Outreach (including marketing and outreach staff, fliers, advertising, other marketing and outreach efforts)</i>	\$12,028
<i>Technical Support</i>	\$15,484
<i>Digital literacy instructors or Staffing for monitoring the designated space or staffing for call centers</i>	\$33,150
<i>Other Staffing (including administrative support, project management, other staff, (excludes marketing and outreach staff))</i>	\$15,040
Total	\$109,081

VACCEB "Digital Equity Program"	
Performance	Metric
<i>Grantee will provide digital literacy training to the following</i>	<i>200 participants</i>
<i>Grantee will perform the following education and outreach to educate the community of available broadband internet services</i>	<i>Activities as stated per application</i>
Goal	
<i>Grantee shall aim to subscribe the following number of households to broadband internet services</i>	<i>75 subscriptions</i>

End