

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

**Communications Division
Broadband, Video and Market Branch**

**RESOLUTION T-17824
June 20, 2024**

R E S O L U T I O N

RESOLUTION T-17824: Approval of six (6) public housing infrastructure projects for grant funding from the California Advanced Services Fund’s Broadband Public Housing Account totaling \$596,315.97.

I. SUMMARY

This Resolution approves grant funding in the amount of up to \$596,315.97 from the California Advanced Services Fund (CASF) Broadband Public Housing Account (BPHA) for six projects from four applicants. These six projects will deploy both wireless and wired broadband infrastructure utilizing wi-fi and cat-6¹ inside-wiring capable of 25 Megabits per second (Mbps) download and 3 Mbps upload² for 346 living units in these publicly supported housing developments. The deployment of broadband in public housing for the purpose of offering free internet access to those who do not already have access to a free broadband network will improve public safety by providing enhanced access to government, e-health, and online education opportunities.

Table 1, below, lists the six public housing infrastructure grants approved, and Appendix A shows a map of proposed project locations.

¹ A twisted pair copper cable for ethernet and other networking physical layer under the standard TIA/EIA-568-B.2-1, which was ratified by the TIA/EIA in June 2002. CAT6 provides higher performance than CAT5e and features more stringent specifications for crosstalk and system noise.

² The applications were submitted on January 1, 2024, prior to the Federal Communications Commission’s adoption of increased broadband speed benchmark of 100 megabits per second download speeds and 20 megabits per second upload speeds on March 14, 2024. These applications are subject to the 25 megabits per second download and 3 megabits per second upload speeds in Decision (D.) 24-03-021.

Table 1						
Applicant	Project Name	Address	City	Zip	Grant	Units
Community HousingWorks	Eucalyptus View Cooperative	1821 Escondido Blvd	Escondido	92025	\$39,590.00	24
Las Palmas Housing and Development Corporation	Tres Lagos Apartments Phase II	23365 Catt Rd	Wildomar	92595	\$211,995.97	88
RCD Housing	Aspen Court	121 Aspen Dr	Pacheco	94553	\$29,775.00	15
RCD Housing	Oxford Plaza	2175 Kittredge	Berkeley	94704	\$89,725.00	97
Self-Help Enterprises	River Grove I	49177 Road 426	Oakhurst	93644	\$107,450.00	70
Self-Help Enterprises	Neighborhood Village	7571 Florence Ave.	Goshen	93291	\$117,780.00	52
				TOTAL	\$596,315.97	346

II. BACKGROUND

On May 19, 2022, the Commission issued Decision (D.) 22-05-029 which implemented changes to the BPHA enacted by Senate Bill 156 and programmatic changes for publicly supported housing developments, including farmworker housing, and allocated \$15 million funding for Fiscal Year 2023-2024.

Key provisions of the Decision relevant to this Resolution include:

- The Commission authorized CD staff (Staff) to review and approve applications through ministerial review that meet all of the ministerial review criteria.³ Applications not meeting the ministerial review criteria may still be considered for a grant but may only be approved by the Commission via Resolution.
- Grants can be awarded to finance up to 100 percent of the installation costs (inside wiring and equipment), but not maintenance or operation costs.
- Grantees must maintain and operate the network for five years after project completion.
- The proposed network is capable of offering residents Internet service speeds of at least 25 Mbps download and 3 Mbps upload service for an average user during peak and off-peak hours or current state standard, whichever is higher.⁴

³ D.22-05-029, Appendix 1, p. 11.

⁴ Peak hours mean 7 p.m. to 11 p.m. local time.; <https://www.fcc.gov/reports-research/reports/measuring-broadband-america/measuring-fixed-broadband-eleventh-report>

- Applicant attests that no broadband service provider offers free service that meets state standards, as defined in Section III of the BPHA Guidelines, to the subject low-income community.
- Applicant attests that it will not charge residents for broadband internet services.
- Applicant agrees to complete the project within 12 months from the date of Commission approval.
- Applicant has an identified internet service provider with the required internet bandwidth capacity at the Minimum Point of Entry (MPOE).
- Applicant attests that the low-income community project to be in residential use as low-income community for at least 10 years.

III. APPLICANTS' REQUEST

On January 1, 2024, Community HousingWorks (CHW) (1 project), Las Palmas Housing and Development Corporation (Las Palmas) (1 project), RCD Housing (2 projects), and Self-Help Enterprises (SHE) (2 projects) submitted applications for CASF BPHA funding. All six projects exceed the cost per unit benchmark established in the ministerial review criteria in D.22-05-029 and therefore are ineligible for ministerial review and are addressed in this Resolution.

Applicants: All four applicants are eligible applicants as defined in D.22-05-029.⁵

Community HousingWorks (CHW) was founded in 1988 as a 501(c)(3) nonprofit organization that develops, rehabilitates, preserves and operates affordable apartment communities throughout California and in Texas.

Las Palmas Housing and Development Corporation (Las Palmas) has been approved by the IRS as a 501(c)(3) nonprofit organization for providing affordable housing since 2001. Las Palmas serves over 12,400 residents at 62 affordable housing communities across the state of California.

RCD Housing (RCD) has been approved by the IRS as a 501(c)(3) nonprofit organization for providing affordable housing since 1984. RCD Housing has developed or preserved over 65 communities that provide affordable, high-quality, and service-enriched rental housing to over 2,200 low-income households throughout the Bay Area.

Self-Help Enterprises (SHE) has been approved by the IRS as a 501(c)(3) nonprofit organization for providing affordable housing since 1965. SHE is a nationally recognized

⁵ D.22-05-029, Appendix 1, p. 5.

community development organization whose mission is to work together with low-income families to build and sustain healthy homes and communities. Since 1965, Self-Help Enterprises' efforts have affected over 55,000 families.

Projects: All six projects are eligible projects as defined in D.22-05-029.

CHW, RCD (Aspen Court project only) and Self-Help Enterprises request funding for the installation of a wireless 2.4GHz and 5GHz WiFi 802.11AX network architecture utilizing Cisco, Eero, Cisco-Meraki, ONV and Ruckus WiFi access points and switches, to provide wireless broadband coverage to each residential unit.

According to CHW, RCD, and SHE, these installations will be able to provide a minimum download speed of 25 Mbps and minimum upload speed of 3 Mbps during peak use hours.

Las Palmas requests funding for Intermediate Distribution Frames (IDF) that connect to Main Distribution Frame (MDF) build-out and inside-wiring to each residential unit for its 802.11AX WiFi network.

According to Las Palmas, these installations will be able to provide a minimum download speed of 25 Mbps and minimum upload speed of 3 Mbps during peak use hours.

RCD (Oxford Plaza project only) requests funding for the installation of a combined wireless and wired network architecture utilizing 802.11ax WiFi wireless routers that are connected to distributed wired switched ethernet networks using inside copper wiring to deploy broadband service each residential unit.

According to RCD, the installation will be able to provide a minimum download speed of 25 Mbps and minimum upload speed of 3 Mbps during peak use hours.

All six projects include equipment for broadband traffic management, deployment, security, monitoring and reporting, consisting of layer 2 or layer 3 switches and a firewall that interfaces to the Wide Area Network Internet Service Provider (ISP) equipment providing the broadband service.

IV. NOTICES

On January 3, 2024, Staff posted the proposed project descriptions on the Commission's BPHA webpage.⁶

V. PROJECT REVIEW

The Wireless installations for CHW, RCD (Aspen Court project only), and SHE, use the latest WiFi standards, which requires more expertise to properly design, configure and deploy the wireless equipment to meet the coverage needs of multiple housing facilities and to properly interface together as a local area network to connect to the ISP. In addition, the wireless mesh⁷ equipment utilized in wireless installations for the RCD and SHE projects is more resilient, as it can be self-adapting to changes in wireless conditions. The use of the latest WiFi standard⁸ in all these projects offers greater throughput and wireless link management capability and can carry more traffic.

The projects propose multiple Intermediate Distribution Frame (IDF)⁹ that connect to Main Distribution Frame (MDF)¹⁰ in a star network topology.¹¹ Each IDF will serve as the local collection point for the distributed access points, providing wireless coverage to the residential units in each housing facility. The Community Housing Works project utilizes wireless connections to bring IDFs back to the MDF, to connect to the IDFs that serve each building. RCD and SHE projects utilize wired connections to bring IDFs back to the MDF, to connect to the IDFs that serve each building. In addition, CHW and Las Palmas projects will connect fiber service to the MDF.

IDFs distribute WiFi access equipment to serve the buildings, and the Eero, Cisco-Meraki, Ruckus and Ubiquiti wireless equipment being proposed are WiFi access points that use 802.11AX standard. In addition, the Ruckus Wireless equipment being proposed are

⁶ <https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/-/media/cpuc-website/divisions/communications-division/documents/casf-adoption-and-access/bpha/january-2024-broadband-public-housing-account-grant-request.pdf>

⁷ A mesh network is a network composed of multiple nodes that work together as one large system.

⁸ 802.11AC Wave2 (WiFi-5 wave2) or 802.11ax WiFi standard per BPHA guidelines, p.2.

⁹ IDF is a localized hub and a cable distribution point, typically a rack or a cabinet, which brings internal lines to all locally distributed computing devices to the Main Distribution Frame.

¹⁰ The MDF is the centralized distribution point for all IDFs and is the terminating point for all the computing devices within the local network. The MDF connects and manages telecommunications between the local facility and the outside world.

¹¹ A star network is a network topology in which all nodes of computing devices are directly connected to a common central location.

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Star_network#/media/File:Star_Topology.png

wireless mesh capable WiFi access points that use 802.11AX standards. All access points include the latest technology advancements that greatly improve capacity and performance by enabling more simultaneous connections and a more thorough use of spectrum¹², while maintaining backwards compatibility to older WiFi standards.

The wireless mesh equipment utilized in these projects is more costly but provides flexibility and scalability for future expansion. All proposed wireless projects are 100 Mbps download/20 Mbps upload speed ready, and, capable of exceeding 100 Mbps download/20 Mbps upload speed,¹³ with better speeds for the wireless projects using the 802.11AX WiFi standard.¹⁴

The Las Palmas project will be deploying IDF and MDF build-outs and interconnections between several residential buildings using single-mode fiber and will also be deploying cat-6 inside-wiring to each residential unit. The deployed IDF and MDF distribution points will be connected to Las Palmas' 802.11AX WiFi network via matching funds.

The project is 100 Mbps download/20 Mbps upload ready. In addition, this project is capable of exceeding 100 Mbps download/20 Mbps upload speed.

The RCD (Oxford Plaza project only) project combines wired and wireless installations propose connecting wired residential buildings, that use inside copper wiring to connect each residential units in a building, using to the MDF in another building that interfaces with the ISP. In addition, 802.11ax WiFi routers¹⁵ are deployed at each of the residential spaces to provide wireless coverage.

While the deployment of inside wiring to each residential unit is labor intensive, the simplicity of network configuration and installation offsets the higher complexity and cost of the wireless projects. The projects propose layer 2 and layer 3 switching equipment and firewall equipment and service to manage, deploy and monitor the broadband traffic.

¹² <https://www.wi-fi.org/discover-wi-fi/wi-fi-certified-6>

¹³ Based on the proposed engineering designs submitted, for the wired projects using switched ethernet technology and wireless projects using 802.11ax WiFi technology, upgrading the layer 2/layer 3 switching equipment and the firewall equipment would enable speeds greater than 100 Mbps download/20 Mbps upload toward gigabit capability.

¹⁴ All WiFi access point hardware proposed are 802.11ax (WiFi-6) based.

¹⁵ Per RCD design documentation, each residential space will be provisioned with Netgear Rax10 WiFi6 router.

All proposed wired projects are 100 Mbps download/20 Mbps upload ready. In addition, these projects are capable of exceeding 100 Mbps download/20 Mbps upload speed with a minor hardware upgrade.

The wireless projects listed access limitations within the property as the primary reason for choosing wireless deployment. The complexity, labor and material cost¹⁶ of wireless deployment has been rising thus increasing the project costs but remains a viable and less costly engineering option of system deployment as compared to direct connection, when heavy construction is required involving structural modification, trenching, laying conduits, feedthrough and backfill. Wireless bridge connections, when utilized, can also be engineered and deployed relatively quickly, as compared to heavy construction, which can require review and approval and lengthy project planning.

Based on the above, Staff determined that the extra cost per unit is reasonable and recommends approval.

VI. COMPLIANCE REQUIREMENTS

CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE are required to comply with all the guidelines, requirements, and conditions associated with the grant of CASF funds as specified in D.22-05-029. Such compliance includes, but is not limited to the following:

A. California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA)

All CASF grants are subject to CEQA requirements unless the projects are statutorily or categorically exempt pursuant to the CEQA Guidelines.

All six projects require limited modifications of existing structures.

The wireless projects are based on 802.11ax wireless network architectures consisting of ISP Modem(s), network switching equipment and wireless access points. This requires installation/mounting of equipment in existing structures such as ceilings or rooftops.

The hybrid projects that use both wired and wireless network architecture consists of ISP modem(s), networking switching equipment and wireless routers. This requires installation/mounting of equipment in existing structures, such as ceilings or rooftops

¹⁶ Applicants in Table 1 have indicated that projects are experiencing high material costs and supply chain delays.

and installation of cat-6 inside-wiring and conduits on existing structures such as walls, hallways, or in the roof.

Based on the above information, these projects meet the criteria of the CEQA categorical exemption for existing facilities (CEQA Guidelines § 15301) and CEQA Guidelines Section 15303 – New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures, involving construction, installation, and/or conversion of limited numbers of new and/or existing facilities/structures.

B. Execution and Performance

CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must start the projects within 30 days from the date this Resolution is approved and complete the project within a 12-month timeframe. Should the grantee or Contractor fail to begin work within 30 days of grant approval, the Commission or Director of Communications Division, upon 5 days written notice to the grantee, reserves the right to terminate the award. If the grantee is unable to complete the proposed project within the required 12-month timeframe, it must notify the Commission as soon as it becomes aware of this prospect. If such notice is not provided, the Commission reserves the right to reduce or withhold payment for failure to satisfy this requirement.

Grantees must operate and maintain the network for a minimum of five years after it has been installed. The grantee must complete all the performance on the project before the termination date in accordance with the terms of approval granted by the Commission. In the event that CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE fail to complete the project or subsequently operate and maintain the network service in accordance with the terms of approval granted by the Commission and compliance with the CASF program guidelines, CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must reimburse some or all of the CASF BPHA funds that it has received.

CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must sign a consent form within 30 days from the date of the award agreeing to the terms stated in the Resolution authorizing the CASF award. Should CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE not accept the award through failure to submit the consent form within 30 calendar days from the date of the award, the Commission will deem the grant null and void.

Material changes in the entries for this application, such as discontinuing operation or bankruptcy, or change of name (DBA), change of address, telephone, fax number or e-mail address must be reported immediately by a letter to the CPUC, Director of the Communications Division, 505 Van Ness Avenue, San Francisco, CA 94102.

C. Project Audit

The Commission has the right to conduct any necessary audit, quality check, verification, and discovery during project implementation and post-project completion to ensure that CASF funds are spent in accordance with the terms of approval granted by the Commission. Invoices submitted will be subject to financial audit by the Commission at any time within 5 years of the release of the final payment.¹⁷

D. Reporting

CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE are required to submit a project status report within six months of the project award date if the project has not been completed, irrespective of whether the grantee requests reimbursement or payment. Project status reporting requirements can be found at the Commission's website.¹⁸ CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must identify foreseeable risks that might prevent it from meeting future milestones. Before full payment of the project CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must submit a project completion report. CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE shall also include speed test results in its completion report CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must certify that each progress and completion report is true and correct under penalty of perjury.

CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE are required to maintain the broadband network for five years after it has been installed. After installation, for a five-year period, they must also submit quarterly reports showing the percentage of up time, the number of unique log-ons (either by individuals or by units) and the amount of data used.¹⁹

E. Payments

Submission of invoices from and payments CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE shall be made at completion intervals in accordance with D.22-05-029, Section X, Appendix 1 and according to the guidelines and supporting documentation required in D.22-05-029. Project status and completion reports must be submitted with all required supporting documentation in order to receive payment. Payments are based on submitted receipts, invoices and other supporting documentation showing expenditures incurred and work done on the project in accordance with the approved CASF funding budget included in

¹⁷ D. 22-05-029, Appendix 1, p. 16.

¹⁸ <https://www.cpuc.ca.gov/industries-and-topics/internet-and-phone/california-advanced-services-fund/casf-public-housing-account>

¹⁹ D.22-05-029 Appendix 1, p. 14.

the application. CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must submit a project completion report before full payment. Final requests for payment must be submitted no later than 90 days after project completion.

Payment to CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE will be made in accordance with, and within the time specified in California Government Code § 927 *et seq.*

If any portion of reimbursement is found to be out of compliance, CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE will be responsible for refunding any disallowed amount along with appropriate interest rates determined in accordance with applicable Commission decisions.

VII. SAFETY CONSIDERATIONS

The deployment of affordable broadband in public housing will improve access to government and e-health services, which improves safety.

VIII. COMMENTS

In compliance with Public Utilities Code, § 311(g)(1), a Notice of Availability was e-mailed on May 17, 2024 informing all parties on the CASF Distribution List of the availability of the draft of this Resolution for public comments at the Commission's website at <http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/>. This letter also serves to inform parties that the final conformed Resolution the Commission adopts will be posted and available on this same website. The Commission received no public comments.

IX. FINDINGS

1. On January 1, 2024, CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE submitted applications for six projects totaling \$596,315.97 for CASF funding.
2. All six projects exceed the cost per unit benchmark established in the ministerial review criteria and are therefore ineligible for ministerial review.
3. Based on its review, Staff determined that all six projects meet BPHA eligibility requirements. Staff further determined that all six projects qualify for funding under BPHA guidelines per D.22-05-029 and recommends approval of all six projects.

4. The Commission has determined that these projects are categorically exempt from CEQA review, under section 15301 regarding exemption for existing facilities and section 15303 regarding minor modifications to existing structures.
5. A notice letter was e-mailed on May 19, 2024, informing all applicants filing for CASF funding, parties on the CASF distribution list of the availability of the draft of this Resolution for public comments at the Commissions website found here <http://www.cpuc.ca.gov/PUC/documents/>. The Commission received no public comments.

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that:

1. The Commission shall award the following grant amounts for the projects listed in Table 1:
 - \$39,590.00 to CHW for one project;
 - \$211,995.97 to Las Palmas for one project;
 - \$119,500.00 to RCD for two projects;
 - \$225,230.00 to SHE for two projects;

The total grant award is \$596,315.97. All awards are based on the descriptions of the projects as described herein and are predicated on commitments to install and operate broadband infrastructure as expressed in its application and compliance with the requirements in as specified in D.22-05-029 and this Resolution.

2. Grant payments of up to a total \$596,315.97 for these public housing projects shall be paid out of the CASF Public Housing Account in accordance with the guidelines adopted in D.22-05-029, including compliance with CEQA.
3. CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must complete and execute the consent form agreeing to the conditions set forth in this Resolution within 30 calendar days from the date of the award. Failure to submit the consent form within 30 calendar days from the date of the adoption of this Resolution will deem the grant null and void.
4. CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must each submit quarterly progress reports on the status of the project irrespective of whether reimbursement or payment is requested.
5. CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE are required to maintain the broadband network for five years after it has been installed.

6. Payments to CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE shall each be in accordance with D.22-05-029, Section X, Appendix 1 and in accordance with the process defined in the "Payments" section of this Resolution.
7. CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must each complete all performance under the award on or before 12 months from the date this Resolution is approved.
8. By receiving a CASF grant, CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE agree to comply with the terms, conditions and requirements of the grant and thus submits to the jurisdiction of the Commission regarding disbursement and administration of the grant.
9. CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE are each required to comply with all guidelines, requirements and conditions associated with the CASF funds award as specified in D.22-05-029, and in accordance with the terms of the Commission's approval as set forth in this Resolution.
10. If CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE fail to complete the project in accordance with the terms outlined in D.22-05-029 and this Resolution, CHW, Las Palmas, RCD, and SHE must reimburse some or all CASF funds it has received.

This resolution is effective today.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was duly introduced, passed, and adopted at a meeting of the Public Utilities Commission of the State of California held on _____, the following Commissioners voting favorable thereon:

Rachel Peterson
Executive Director

APPENDIX A
Resolution T-17824
Public Housing Projects Locations

