

PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

**Rail Safety Division
Rail Transit Safety Branch**

**Resolution ST-229
July 16, 2026**

R E S O L U T I O N

Resolution ST-229. Granting Approval of the Final Report on the 2018 Triennial Safety Review of the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency.

PROPOSED OUTCOME:

- Approval of the Final Report of the 2018 Triennial On-site Safety Review of San Francisco Municipal Transit Agency.

SAFETY CONSIDERATIONS:

- This resolution considers the safety and security of the public and employees who might be affected by the San Francisco Municipal Transit Agency. The resolution approves a review report required every three years to comprehensively assess, evaluate, and improve safety and security of a rail transit system.

ESTIMATED COST:

- There are no costs associated with this resolution.

SUMMARY

This Resolution approves the Rail Safety Division final report, titled "*2018 Triennial Safety Review of San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency*," dated March 27, 2020. The report includes the results of the Commission Staff review of the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) and its compliance with its System Safety Program Plan, the Commission's General Order 164-E, and applicable state and federal rules and regulations. The review identified sixty-six findings of non-compliance and Staff makes recommendations for corrective actions. The findings and recommendations have been

addressed and corrective actions completed. Staff is not recommending that any fines or penalties be assessed by the Commission associated with the results of this triennial safety review.

BACKGROUND

General Order (GO) No. 164-E, "*Rules and Regulations Governing State Safety Oversight of Rail Fixed Guideway Systems*" requires Commission Staff (Staff) conduct on-site system safety and on-site system security reviews of the transit agencies operating rail fixed guideway systems at least once every three years.* These are commonly referred to as triennial safety and triennial security reviews. Triennial safety and security reviews are conducted by Staff to evaluate compliance with an agency's own plans and procedures as well as safety and security laws and regulations applicable to the agency.

Triennial Safety and Security Reviews

Staff conduct triennial safety and triennial security reviews in accordance with the CPUC State Safety Oversight Program Standard Procedures Manual, which is approved by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) as part of our FTA Certification.¹ The foundation of the triennial safety and security reviews is the structured approach, guided by checklists covering the required 21 essential elements of a System Safety Program Plan (SSPP) as specified in GO 164-E, Section 3.2. Some of the checklists include field reviews and inspections of system infrastructure and observations of operations and maintenance activities conducted by the transit agency.

All checklists guide Staff's inquiries to determine whether an agency is following the policies and procedures supplementing the SSPP and whether any gaps exist in the SSPP or there are procedures that an agency must address. Each checklist identifies safety-related elements and characteristics for that review area that Staff either inspects directly, or evaluates by reviewing reports, documents, and other records.

Staff reviewers are the engineers, inspectors, and analysts in the Rail Transit Safety Branch (RTSB) of the Commission's Rail Safety Division (RSD). RTSB management assigns the reviewers checklists based on expertise, skill sets, interest and knowledge of the area covered by the checklist. Most checklists are conducted by at least two Staff members. While checklist questions provide initial Staff guidance, the agency is

¹ Staff's security review and report, "*2018 Triennial Security Review of San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency*" is being brought before the Commission concurrently in Resolution ST-230.

* Commission Resolution ST-241 provided RSD Director with the flexibility to delay triennial audits that would otherwise have been scheduled during the COVID-19 Pandemic to avoid violating state public health protocols. On-site triennial reviews were paused for 22 months starting in early 2020.

informed that Staff may make additional inquiries related to the subject matter based on agency responses or documents examined during the review.

Staff conducted an on-site system safety review of the SFMTA beginning on May 13-17, 2018. For the SFMTA triennial review, Staff developed 32 checklists covering the 21 essential elements (plus GO 172 and GO 175 checklists) to guide the review, which were shared with SFMTA in advance for review and comment. Staff made several minor edits pursuant to SFMTA comments and finalized the checklists. Staff conducted the triennial safety review and compiled its final report, as attached to this Resolution.

The methods used to conduct the safety review included:

- a. Interviews with SFMTA employees at all levels from rank and file through management;
- b. Reviews of design, construction, procurement, testing, training, operation and maintenance programs;
- c. Reviews of records and procedures;
- d. Observation of operations and maintenance activities; and
- e. Inspections of equipment and facilities.

A full description of the safety review, including the scope, results, and recommendations, is contained in the final safety review report identified in this resolution as Attachment A.

The requirements for SSPPs are found in GO 164-E, section 3. GO 164-E requires specific elements to be included in the SSPP and requires SFMTA to evaluate it annually to determine whether any changes or updates are necessary to maintain compliance or address new or changed system risks. Updates must be submitted to Staff for review and approval.

The SSPP is the guiding document that incorporates safety into SFMTA's daily operations and requires the Safety Department and the managers and supervisors in other departments to conduct operations and maintenance activities in accordance with the procedures established by SFMTA. Those procedures are specified in various procedural manuals, plans and policies that supplement the SSPP. The SSPP and associated policies and procedures are intended to provide SFMTA personnel the guidance to properly perform tasks and to identify and eliminate, mitigate or control safety hazards and risks. Additionally, the SSPP and associated procedures are intended to ensure compliance with safety, health and environmental laws and regulations, as well as to establish requirements, lines of authority, and levels of responsibility and accountability within the organization for their implementation.

Monitoring Compliance

As a routine element of the triennial review process, RSD requests Commission approval of the final report and requests the Commission order the agency to supply responses to each finding and recommendation and develop a corrective action plan to address them. Staff reviews the responses and corrective action plans to ensure the identified issue(s) are being addressed and, if so, approves the corrective action plan. Staff then monitors implementation of the corrective action plans and field verifies their completion. Corrective actions may be simple and already implemented prior to issuance of the Final Report, while for some the agency may propose longer-term activities to correct.

DISCUSSION

The final report, *"2018 Triennial Safety Review of San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency,"* dated March 27, 2020, included as Attachment A, identifies Staff activities for each of the 40 checklists covering the 21 items that the Commission's GO 164-E require for inclusion in each Rail Transit Agency's SSPP, plus GO 172 and GO 175.

Staff identified a total of sixty-six findings of non-compliance, which resulted in recommendations for corrective action. The findings and recommendations are organized by source checklist number in the attached report. In this case, due to delays in processing the final report, all findings and recommendations have been addressed by corrective action plans and have been closed out.

RSD Staff recommends the Commission approve the final safety review report titled, *"2018 Triennial Safety Review of San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency."*

COMMENTS

Public Utilities Code section 311(g)(1) provides that this Resolution must be served on all parties and subject to at least 30 days public review. Any comments are due within 20 days of the date of its mailing and publication on the Commission's website and in accordance with any instructions accompanying the notice. Section 311(g)(2) provides that this 30-day review period and 20-day comment period may be reduced or waived upon the stipulation of all parties in the proceeding.

The 30-day review and 20-day comment period for the draft of this resolution was neither waived nor reduced. Accordingly, this draft resolution was mailed to parties for comments and will be placed on the Commission's agenda no earlier than 30 days from today. No comments were received.

FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

1. The RSD RTSB Staff conducted an on-site safety review of SFMTA beginning September 17, 2018, and continuing through October 17, 2018. Staff conducted a post-review exit conference with SFMTA management on September 19, 2019.
2. The safety report review identified 66 findings of non-compliance. These non-compliant items and recommendations for corrective actions are described, where applicable, in the Comments/Findings and Recommendations section of each checklist and in the body of the final report.
3. SFMTA has developed and implemented corrective action plans for of the areas of non-compliance identified in the report and all of the findings and recommendations contained in the report have been closed out to Staff's satisfaction.

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED THAT:

1. The Rail Safety Division's request for approval of the final safety review report titled, *"2018 Triennial Safety Review of San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency"* dated March 27, 2020, is granted.
2. This Resolution is effective today.

I certify that the foregoing resolution was duly introduced, passed, and adopted at a conference of the Public Utilities Commission of the State of California held on July 16, 2026; the following Commissioners voting favorably thereon:

/s/Leuwam Tesfai

LEUWAM TESFAI
Executive Director

JOHN REYNOLDS
President

DARCIE L. HOUCK

KAREN DOUGLAS

MATTHEW BAKER

CHRISTINE HARADA

Commissioners

Dated July 16, 2026, at San Francisco, California

ATTACHMENT A

2018 Triennial Safety Review Report of
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency.

CS# 611508015

<http://docs.cpuc.ca.gov/SearchRes.aspx?docformat=ALL&DocID=611508015>