

2010
TRIENNIAL ON-SITE
SECURITY REVIEW OF
BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT

RAIL TRANSIT SAFETY SECTION
RAIL TRANSIT AND CROSSING BRANCH
CONSUMER PROTECTION AND SAFETY DIVISION
CALIFORNIA PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION
505 VAN NESS AVENUE
SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94102

July 29, 2010

(Public)

Richard W. Clark, Director
Consumer Protection and Safety Division

2010 TRIENNIAL ON-SITE SECURITY REVIEW OF BAY AREA RAPID TRANSIT DISTRICT

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The California Public Utilities Commission's Rail Transit Safety Section (RTSS) staff conducted this system security program review. Staff members directly responsible for conducting review and inspection activities include:

Georgetta Gregory – Rail Transit Crossing Branch
Program Manager
Steve Espinal, Senior Utilities Supervisor
Raed Dwairi, Project Manager, Utilities Engineer
Vincent Kwong, RTSS Representative to BART
Howard Huie, Utilities Engineer

"Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a "need to know" as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520."

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
2 INTRODUCTION	2
3 BACKGROUND	3
4 SECURITY REVIEW PROCEDURE	5
5 FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	6
APPENDICES	8
A. Acronyms List	9
B. BART 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklist Index	11
C. BART 2010 Triennial Security Review Recommendations List	12
D. BART 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklists	13

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The California Public Utilities Commission's (Commission) Consumer Protection and Safety Division (CPSD), Rail Transit Safety Section staff (Staff) conducted an on-site system security review of the Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) in May 2010. The review is focused on verifying the effective implementation of the System Security Plan (SSP), addressing Threat & Vulnerability Assessment (TVA) and emergency response.

Following the on-site security review, staff held a post-review conference with the BART Manager of Security Programs, on November 1, 2010. Staff provided a preliminary summary report detailing the possible on-site review recommendations for corrective actions.

The security review results indicate that BART has a comprehensive system security program and has effectively implemented the SSP. However, staff noted exceptions during the review. These exceptions are described in the Findings and Recommendations sections of each checklist. Of the eight (8) checklists used for the 2010 triennial security review, staff made two recommendations for corrective action within the BART Security Program.

The Introduction for this report is presented in Section 2. The Background, in Section 3, contains a description of the BART rail system. A description of the 2010 security review procedure is in Section 4. The review's findings and recommendations are listed in Section 5. A listing of the Acronyms is in Appendix A. The BART 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklist Index and the Recommendations List are included, respectively, in Appendices B and C. The Triennial Security Review Checklists are presented in Appendix D.

"Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a "need to know" as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520."

2. INTRODUCTION

The Commission's General Order (GO) 164-D, *Rules and Regulations Governing State Safety Oversight of Rail Fixed Guideway Systems*, and the Federal Transit Administration's (FTA) Rule, Title 49 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) Part 659, *Rail Fixed Guideway Systems: State Safety Oversight*, require the designated State Safety Oversight Agencies to perform a review of each rail transit agency's system safety and security program(s) at a minimum of once every three years. The purpose of the triennial review is to evaluate the effectiveness of each rail transit agency's System Security Plan (SSP) and to assess the level of compliance with GO 164-D as well as other Commission safety and security requirements. Staff conducted the previous BART on-site security review in conjunction with Transportation Security Administration in August 2006.

On January 27, 2010, staff advised in a letter to the BART General Manager of the scheduling of the Commission's security review on May 17, 2010. The letter included eight checklists that served as the basis for verification of the effective implementation of the SSP.

Staff conducted an opening conference on May 10, 2010 with BART General Manager, Assistant General Manager of Operations, Executive Manager of Transit System Compliance, Manager of Security Programs, and BART Chief Officers.

Staff performed the on-site triennial security review at the BART offices. Staff developed eight (8) checklists for the inspection of the System Security Program. Staff derived the checklist review questions from CPUC's GO 164-D, FTA's 49 CFR659, Transportation Security Administration's (TSA) Baseline Security Review, and BART's SSPP and SSP. At the conclusion of each review activity, staff provided BART personnel a verbal summary of the preliminary findings and discussed preliminary recommendations for corrective actions.

On November 1, 2010, staff conducted a post-review exit meeting with the BART Manager of Security Programs. Staff provided a synopsis of the non-compliant findings from the 8 checklists and discussed the need for corrective actions where applicable.

"Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a "need to know" as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520."

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

3. BACKGROUND

The Bay Area Rapid Transit District (BART) began operation on September 11, 1972 with 28 miles of track in Alameda County, servicing Oakland to Fremont. The second segment opened on January 29, 1973, with 12 miles of track extending the service from Fremont to Richmond. The third segment opened on May 21, 1973, with 17 additional miles of track marking the opening of the Concord Line. On November 5, 1973, service began between the Montgomery Street Station in downtown San Francisco and the Daly City Station, adding another 7.5 miles of track to the system. Transbay service began on September 16, 1974, bringing the full 71.5 miles of track into service. On May 27, 1976, the Embarcadero Station officially opened for revenue service, bringing the total station count to 34. The Embarcadero Station added no additional track miles.

Additional Extensions

The extension to North Concord/Martinez Station opened on December 16, 1995, adding 2.25 miles of track north of the Station. On February 24, 1996, Colma Station opened for revenue service, adding 1.6 miles of track south of the Daly City Station. The Pittsburg/Bay Point Station was the next to be opened for revenue service on December 7, 1996, completing a 7.8-mile segment of the Pittsburg/Antioch Extension from the Concord Station. The Dublin/Pleasanton extension opening followed on May 10, 1997, adding 14 miles of track and two stations to the system. The San Francisco Airport extension opened on June 22, 2003 adding four stations and 8.7 miles of track. Currently, the system operates five lines on 104 miles of track with 43 stations.

The BART system operates five lines. These are:

- Fremont – Daly City Line
- Dublin/Pleasanton – Millbrae Line
- Pittsburg/Bay Point – SFO Line
- Richmond – Millbrae Line
- Richmond – Fremont Line

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

Current Extensions in planning/construction

Warm Springs Extension

The Warm Springs Extension Project will add 5.4 miles of track, extending BART's railway system from the Fremont Station to the Warm Springs Station in South Fremont. Staff has reviewed and the Commission has approved the Safety and Security Certification Plan for this project in its Resolution ST-80.

Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority/Silicon Valley Rapid Transit Project

The Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority/Silicon Valley Rapid Transit Project (VTA/SVRT Project) is a 16.3-mile extension beginning at the Warm Springs BART Station in South Fremont, extending along the Union Pacific Railroad line to Milpitas and then continues on to 28th and Santa Clara Streets in San Jose. The extension will then proceed underground through Downtown San Jose to the Diridon Caltrain Station. The BART extension will then turn north under the Caltrain line and terminate at the Santa Clara Station. Staff has reviewed and the Commission has approved the Safety and Security Certification Plan for this project in its Resolution ST-83.

Status of the 2006 BART Triennial Security Review Recommendations

Staff performed the previous triennial on-site security review during the week of August 14, 2006. With the involvement from the Surface Transportation Security Inspection Program of the Transportation Security Administration (TSA), the summation of "items of consideration" currently resides between BART and TSA which are based on the CFR 49 Part 659 requirements. Results of the Year 2006 review demonstrated that BART has an effective security program in place.

"Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a "need to know" as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520."

4. REVIEW PROCEDURE

Staff conducted the 2010 Triennial Security Review in accordance with Rail Transit Safety Section Procedure Four (4), *Procedure for Performing Triennial Safety & Security Reviews of Rail Transit Systems*. Staff developed eight (8) checklists to evaluate the adequacy of BART's system security plan and the efficacy of its implementation.

The security evaluation includes the BART security department, programs and processes which have system security functions and responsibilities. The review is based on Commission and FTA requirements, BART's SSP & SSPP, TSA baseline review list, TSA security related documents, and the staff's knowledge of the transit system. The eight (8) checklists are listed in Appendix B.

Each checklist identifies the core security-related elements and characteristics that staff reviewed. Each of the checklists also references Commission, BART, and other documents that establish the security program requirements. The methods used to perform the review include:

- Discussions and interviews with BART management
- Reviews of rules, procedures, policies, and records
- Interviews with rank and file employees

Immediately following the security review, staff summarized the findings and the preliminary recommendations (if appropriate) with the respective BART security personnel. The post-review summary is beneficial for clarifying findings or best-practices and provided BART an opportunity to promptly address any necessary security improvements.

"Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a "need to know" as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520."

5. FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

APPENDICES

	Page
A. Acronyms List	9
B. BART 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklist Index	11
C. BART 2010 Triennial Security Review Recommendations List	12
D. BART 2010 Triennial Security Review Checklists	13

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

APPENDIX A ACRONYMS LIST

Abbreviation / Acronym	Description
BART	Bay Area Rapid Transit District
BPD	BART Police Department
CAP	Corrective Action Plan
CFR	Code of Federal Regulations
Commission	California Public Utilities Commission
CPSD	Consumer Protection and Safety Division
CPUC	California Public Utilities Commission
CTC	Centralized Traffic Control
DHS	Department of Homeland Security
DOJ	Department of Justice
FBI	Federal Bureau of Investigation
FTA	Federal Transit Administration
GO	General Order
ICS	Incident Command System
ISSA	Internal Safety and Security Audit
IT	Information Technology
OCC	Operations Control Center
POST	Peace Officers Standard and Training
RTCB	Rail Transit and Crossing Branch
RTSS	Rail Transit Safety Section
SCADA	Supervisory Control And Data Acquisition
SSP	System Security Plan
SSPP	System Safety Program Plan

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

Staff	Consumer Protection and Safety Division personnel
Abbreviation / Acronym	Description
TSA	Transportation Security Administration
TVA	Thread and Vulnerability Assessment

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

APPENDIX B
BART 2010 TRIENNIAL SECURITY REVIEW CHECKLISTS INDEX
(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

APPENDIX C
BART 2010 TRIENNIAL SECURITY REVIEW RECOMMENDATION LIST
(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

APPENDIX D

BART 2010 TRIENNIAL SECURITY REVIEW CHECKLISTS

(CONFIDENTIAL)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”

(INTENTIONALLY BLANK)

“Warning: This record contains Sensitive Security Information (SSI) that is controlled under 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520. No part of this record may be disclosed to persons without a “need to know” as defined in 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520, except with the written permission of the Administrator of the transportation security Administration or the secretary of Transportation. Unauthorized release may result in civil penalty or other action. For U.S. government agencies, public disclosure is governed by U.S.C. 552 and 49 CFR parts 15 and 1520.”